

**MINUTES**

**171<sup>st</sup> MEETING**

**NEW YORK STATE BOARD FOR HISTORIC  
PRESERVATION**

**16 March 2018**

**Peebles Island State Park  
Waterford, New York**

The following were present:

SRB Members

Absent

Robert MacKay, Chair  
Jennifer Lemak  
Daryl Andreades  
Paul Stewart  
Kristin Herron  
Jay DiLorenzo  
Wint Aldrich  
Wayne Goodman  
Douglas J. Perrelli  
Tom Maggs

Chuck Vandrei

New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation

Daniel Mackay, Deputy Commissioner for Historic Preservation  
Michael Lynch, Director, Division for Historic Preservation  
Kathleen LaFrank, Board Secretary  
Julian Adams, Director, Community Preservation Services  
John Bonafide, Director, Technical Services Bureau

Staff

Bill Krattinger  
Virginia Bartos  
Jennifer Betsworth  
Jennifer Walkowski  
Emilie Gould  
Dan McEneny  
John Rozell  
Beth Cumming  
Kathy Howe  
Linda Mackey  
Erin Czarnecki

Guests

Kerry Culhane - Consultant  
Gary Monti  
Thomas Moreland -Town of Austerlitz  
Olga Moreland  
Donald MacElvoy  
Dan Wilson

The meeting was called to order at 10:40 a.m. by Chairman MacKay

## **Order of Business**

Following the roll call, the minutes of the 170<sup>th</sup> meeting of the State Board for Historic Preservation were reviewed. Kathleen LaFrank noted that she had made the requested corrections.

Motion to Approve: Kristin Herron

Second: Daryl Andreades

**Vote: Unanimous**

## **Meetings**

June 7 - Peebles Island

Sept 6 – Planting Fields, Long Island

Dec 6 – Albany area; will coincide with NYS preservation awards

## **Reports**

### **Deputy Commissioner Daniel Mackay**

Deputy Commissioner Mackay acknowledged Commissioner Harvey, who could not attend the meeting, and noted that he was reporting on her behalf. He told the board members that visiting the twenty nominations they were reviewing today would require a sixty-hour road trip of 2,700 miles, noting the remarkable geographic diversity of the group. He also noted the properties' equally remarkable diversity of architecture and significance and thanked staff for the extra effort that had been put into preparation, both writing nominations themselves and assisting consultants.

Next, he lauded Michael Lynch's significant effort to prepare an annual report, which the deputy commissioner passed out to members. He noted that we have a very hard working staff, that the pace never relents, and that we are doing nationally significant work here. He then reported on the trip that he, Michael, and Dan McEneny made to Washington to meet with our congressional delegation. He was very pleased to announce that they met with 25 of 27 congressional offices and had a terrific meeting with a joint senate committee. They discussed important tax credit and National Register projects while asking for sustained historic preservation funding.

In more tax credit news, both houses of the state legislature have included early reauthorization and proposed "fixes" for transition rules in census tracts in their budget bills. Finally, Daniel reported that we had received an NPS grant to document twentieth-century civil rights sites in upstate New York from the NPS. He credited Kathleen LaFrank and Kathy Howe for pursuing this very competitive grant; Kath LaFrank in turn acknowledged board member Jennifer Lamak and colleague Cordell Reaves for their assistance.

Returning to tax credits once more, Daniel reported that since 1992, we had seen \$6.6 billion in investment due to federal tax credits, that \$4.7 billion was pending, and that we had 458 part 1 applications. With \$1.2 last year New York was #1 in the nation for the third year in a row and with this volume, we expected to continue in that position for the next few years.

Wint Aldrich asked whether this administration was especially sensitive to property rights, and Kath LaFrank replied that we not receiving large numbers of objections, as we had for some districts in the past. In the Mohawk Valley, in particular, we have done about four districts recently with little or no objections and several more were in the works. She did tell the members that the NPS was becoming more particular about what was contributing and what was not, noting that nothing was assured to be contributing until NPS had ruled on it – this usually as part of a tax credit application. She added that staff increasingly had to provide extra justification for things that they had judged to be non-controversial.

Wint also put in a request for updated staff territory maps, which was promised with the minutes.

Kathy Howe introduced our new survey unit staff member, Erin Czernecki, who came to us from Crailo, to the board. Erin was a very welcome addition to the staff!

### **Doug Perrelli**

Kath LaFrank had allotted time for Doug Perrelli to discuss the chart he prepares to assist him in reviewing nominations, as well as for all the members to ask us any questions about the NR form or the process. NR staff had met previously and brought some materials to share.

Doug explained how he organizes the properties on a chart and what are the things he looks for in a nominations. They are: the level of significance, expecting state or nationally significant properties to meet a higher bar; the dates of significance and the number of years spanned; he looks at whether a property represents a few years or a span of centuries. He explained that one of his pet peeves was the number of contributing and non-contributing resources: he felt that the number of non-contributing resources was often too high and that he would like to see their locations on a map to determine if the district held up. This provoked some discussion, as Kath LaFrank explained that the nomination form does not differentiate between primary non-contributing buildings or outbuildings, such as garages and sheds. She noted that there was a significant difference between a 600 building district with 100 *primary* nc buildings and a 600 building district with 100 *secondary* nc buildings and that she hoped that everyone understood this nuance. She pointed out that it is usually explained in the text and indicated on a very carefully coded map; however, the maps were not usually ready in time for the board

meetings. Staff brought examples of maps to show and members were impressed. We would have to see if they could be produced earlier without inconveniencing our GIS team. Our goal is always to make what we send out more helpful.

Kath took the discussion a little farther, asking members to consider not just buildings but also areas of significance, which indicate what kinds of buildings and features to expect. Doug also asked if we ever group individually listed buildings into districts and Kath explained how this is often done in places where the most obviously eligible resources were listed first.

Kristin Herron asked if the sheet could be done in excel and if the nominations could be grouped differently for presentation; say, by theme. Kath answered that there were many different ways to arrange the presentations; however, staff greatly preferred doing all of their presentations together. She noted that she might change for a special occasion; however, otherwise, she preferred to give the staff their preference since they are the ones doing the hard work.

Kristin Herron also asked why some of the nominations were arranged differently. In response, Kath explained the different components of a nomination and how the parts should fit together. She emphasized that the first paragraph of item 8 was the most critical in the entire nomination and said that if the information was presented well there, we were more lenient about the way the rest of it was presented. She noted that not many were fond of the current NPS template. The more problematic ones were those where the writer insisted on trying to “tell a story” rather than presenting the needed analysis.

Board members seemed pleased with this discussion, which Kath told them could be continued at any time in the future.

### **Louise Slaughter**

Before the board moved on to National Register reviews, Daniel Mackay delivered the sad news that Rochester Congresswoman Louise Slaughter, who served 32 years in congress, had just died following a fall/concussion earlier in the week.

## **NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS**

### **Haines Family Cemetery, Haines Falls, Greene County**

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Tom Maggs

Second: Jennifer Lemak

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

### **Copeland Carriage Shop, Beechers Hollow, Saratoga County**

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion: Tom Maggs inquired about a nearby Underground Railroad Site in the store Bill noted the Beecher House and Store but noted that he had not researched the URR connection.

Motion to approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Tom Maggs

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

### **Crane House, Wallkill, Ulster County**

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion: Doug observed that this was nominated for a single year, the year it was built.

Motion to approve: Doug Perrelli

Second: Kristin Herron

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

### **Spencertown Historic District, Spencertown, Columbia County**

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion: Tom Maggs spoke in favor of the district, noting that some families go back to the seventeenth century, while others are recent.

Motion to approve: Tom Maggs

Second: Wayne Goodman

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**Austerlitz Historic District, Austerlitz, Columbia County**

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion: Tom Maggs once again praised the district sponsor for his commitment to the area.

Motion to approve: Tom Maggs

Second: Wint Aldrich

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

Bill introduced the sponsor, Thomas Moreland, from the Town of Austerlitz, praising his commitment to the project in honor of the town's bicentennial. Tom Maggs also mentioned the festival and what a wonderful place the town was to visit.

**Emilie Gould**

Before Emilie began her presentations, Kath LaFrank announced to the board that Emilie had decided to retire and that this was her last board meeting, noting that we would really miss her. Following the three presentations, Bob MacKay thanked Emilie for all her good work and wished her all the best. Daniel Mackay also thanked her for handling a challenging territory and noted that we will all miss her patience and her calm approach.

**St. Johnsville Historic District, Montgomery County**

Presented by: Emilie Gould

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Paul Stewart

Second: Doug Perrelli

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**Daniel Webster Jenkins House, Schoharie County**

Presented by: Emilie Gould

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Jennifer Lemak

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**First Baptist Church of Ogdensburg, Ogdensburg, St. Lawrence County**

Presented by: Emilie Gould

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Jay DiLorenzo

Second: Kristin Herron

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**Tibbets-Rumsey House, Ithaca, Tomkins County**

Presented by: Virginia Bartos

Discussion: **none**

Motion to approve: Wayne Goodman

Second: Doug Perrelli

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**Edith B. Ford Memorial Library, Ovid, Seneca County**

Presented by: Virginia Bartos

Discussion: Kristin Herron inquired about the construction drawings and Virginia speculated that they were part of the archives but that she did not have them.

Motion to approve: Kristin Herron

Second: Doug Perrelli

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**Seiappel Bakery and Richard Apartments, Niagara Falls, Niagara County**

Presented by: Jennifer Walkowski

Discussion: Doug Perrelli observed that there was an amazing level of interior detail on the building.

Motion to approve: Doug Perrelli

Second: Jennifer Lemak

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**New York Central Black Rock Freight House Complex, Buffalo, Erie County**

Presented by: Jennifer Walkowski

Discussion: Doug Perrelli noted that the early history of Black Rocked dated to the War of 1812. Jennifer noted that this would be added to the existing MPDF

Motion to approve: Jay Di Lorenzo

Second: Doug Perrelli

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**



**Buffalo General Electric Company Complex, Buffalo, Erie County**

Presented by: Jennifer Walkowski

Discussion: Wint Aldrich noted that the complex was a very bold achievement of an early era. Doug Perrelli wondered if we could give it a higher level of significance. Jennifer explained that we had no access to the working section of the building and, therefore, could not verify integrity.

Motion to approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Tom Maggs

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**Pilgrim Furniture Company, Kingston, Ulster County**

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Doug Perrelli

Second: Jennifer Lemak

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**The Wilbraham, New York, New York County**

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion: Jennifer discussed the site's potential connection to LGBT themes in New York City and noted that consultant Kerry Culhane (present) had written the excellent nomination.

Motion to approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Jay DiLorenzo

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**Sisters of St. Joseph Motherhouse, Brentwood, Suffolk County**

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion: Wint Aldrich noted that this was an extraordinary resource. Bob MacKay asked if this listing will encourage other Catholics to list their buildings; but Jennifer responded that the sisters were not under the control of any diocese

Motion to approve: Bob MacKay

Second: Kristin Herron

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**Hempstead Town Hall, Hempstead, Nassau County**

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion: Wint Aldrich mentioned that the original town hall had been restored by former SRB member Jack Waite. Doug Perrelli was fascinated by the way it all connected together.

Motion to approve: Bob MacKay

Second: Jay DiLorenzo

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**Mitchel Air Force Base and Flight Line, Garden City, Nassau County**

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion: Members expressed their surprise to learn what an important role it had served during WWII. Bob MacKay discussed the book containing old photos of the base that he had brought with him and left it on display for staff and visitors.

Motion to approve: Bob MacKay

Second: Tom Maggs

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**Wading River Radio Station, Wading River, Suffolk County**

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion: Again, board members expressed their amazement at the story behind this nomination and the important role this property had played in WWII.

Motion to approve: Kristin Herron

Second: Daryl Andreades

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

**Gooley Club, Essex and Hamilton Counties**

Presented by: Kathleen LaFrank

Discussion: None

Motion to approve: Tom Maggs

Second: Wint Aldrich

**Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**

The meeting of the New York State Board for Historic Preservation was adjourned at 1:15 pm on a motion by Tom Maggs and seconded by Jay DiLorenzo and unanimously approved by the board.