

MINUTES

174RD MEETING

**NEW YORK STATE BOARD FOR HISTORIC
PRESERVATION**

6 December 2018

**New York State Museum
Albany, New York**

The following were present:

SRB Members

Doug Perrelli, Chair
Jennifer Lemak
Erika Krieger
Paul Stewart
Jay DiLorenzo
Wint Aldrich
Wayne Goodman
Kristin Herron
Lucy Waletzky (part of meeting)

Absent

Chuck Vandrei

New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation

Rose Harvey, Commissioner (part of meeting)
Robert Hiltbrand, Executive Deputy Commissioner
Daniel Mackay, Deputy Commissioner for Historic Preservation
Michael Lynch, Director, Division for Historic Preservation
Kathleen LaFrank, Board Secretary
Julian Adams, Director, Community Preservation Services
John Bonafide, Director, Technical Services Bureau

Staff

Virginia Bartos
Jennifer Betsworth
Jennifer Walkowski
Bill Krattinger
John Rozell
Greg Smith
Daniel McEneny (part of meeting)
Christina Vagvolgyi (part of meeting)
Beth Cumming (part of meeting)
Olivia Brazee (part of meeting)
Weston Davey (part of meeting)
Sloane Bullough (part of meeting)
Kathy Howe (part of meeting)
Linda Mackey (part of meeting)
Erin Czernecki (part of meeting)
James Finelli (part of meeting)
Chelsea Towers (part of meeting)

Guests

Linda Cooper, Regional Director, Taconic State Park Region
 Thomas Watt, Assistant Regional Director, Taconic State Park Region
 Raymond Doherty, Parks Operations Manager, Taconic State Park Region
 Garrett Jobson, Capital Facilities Manager, Taconic State Park Region
 Deb Cohen, Taconic State Park Region
 Frederick Osborn III, Taconic State Park Commission
 Randall Fleischer Taconic State Park Commission
 Edgar Masters, Taconic State Park Commission
 Arthur Gellert, Taconic State Park Commission
 J. Henry Neale Jr. Taconic State Park Commission
 George Gumina, President, Friends of Rockefeller State Park
 Evelyn Hadad, Friends of Rockefeller State Park
 Jay Unger, President, Ashokan Center
 Molly Mason, Ashokan Center
 Rosemary Nichols, Secretary, Ashokan Center
 Neil Larson, Larson Fisher Associates, Ashokan Center
 Eileen Huggard, student
 Kerri Culhane, Consultant
 Joe and Verna Heyman, Vroman House

The meeting was called to order at 10:33 a.m. by Chair Doug Perrelli.

Order of Business

Following the roll call, the minutes of the 173nd meeting of the State Board for Historic Preservation were reviewed.

Motion to Approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Erika Krieger

Vote: Unanimous

ReportsCommissioner Rose Harvey

Commissioner Harvey noted that she was here first and foremost to thank everyone and especially this august board for all they've done for so many years and for all that they will do in the future for historic preservation. She said that she's had the great honor of watching, learning from, and working with the board, and that although her tenure [as commissioner of parks] would soon end, around January 15, 2019, serving as commissioner had been the job of a lifetime and that she had learned so much from so many in historic preservation. She reminded the board what the division for historic preservation and the whole agency together had done, noting that New York led the nation in nominations, with nominations that are more diverse, that

recognize much more of the history of rural New York, that recognize the history of African American burial grounds, that recognize LGBTQ history, and observing that we've taken the lead in deep research into all corners of the state's history. In tax credits, she noted that we lead the nation in reinvestment and revitalization, observing that we're looking at investments of \$1.2 billion just this year, \$4.5 billion since Governor Cuomo began, and \$6 billion going forward. With our own upgrade to the state historic tax credit legislation, she said that 80 percent of the credits are now going to upstate projects, which is spectacular. She addressed Chair Doug Perrelli, noting that he had brought new energy to the platform of previous chairs and complimented him for his progress in improving processes and procedures. She noted that she no longer saw piles of papers on the tables and acknowledged that the board was automating! She offered special thanks for the amazing leadership of Deputy Commissioner Daniel Mackay, mentioning that she had had the privilege of serving with his predecessor, former Deputy Commissioner Ruth Pierpont, and noted the high degree of staff expertise and professionalism. She said that it had been a great joy and a pleasure to work with everyone here; she also complimented the leadership of First Deputy Commissioner Rob Hiltbrand and promised that there was a great future going forward, including many more nominations and tax credits, many more capital dollars to historic sites for improvements, a new curatorial management system, more services to sites, and new interpretive programs. She noted the burgeoning relationship with the Dutch government, which will result in a better interpretation of our Dutch colonial history and potential new sites to interpret. She also mentioned that we are upgrading our technology, observing that we had pioneered CRIS, our cultural resource information system, and announced that we are upgrading it and upgrading Trekker, our mobile app, for better survey work in the field. She noted that this will make us more efficient, and that we will be faster, more exciting, and more innovative in the future. She concluded by thanking everyone in the room and all of our partners. The board, staff, and guests honored the outgoing commissioner with a round of applause.

NOMINATION REVIEWS

Board Members Introduction

Each member first introduced him or herself and provided a bit of background information to the board, staff, and guests.

Robinwood Historic District, Ossining Vicinity, Westchester County

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion:

Doug Perrelli noted that he liked the development of suburbia and the suburban house context in the nomination, as well as the idea of modernity, praising the draft.

Motion to approve: Kristin Herron

Second: Jay DiLorenzo

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

Rockefeller Pocantico Hills Historic District, Sleepy Hollow Vicinity, Westchester County

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion:

Kath LaFrank offered compliments to Bill on the nomination, noting that the way that he had translated this physical landscape into prose was truly beautiful and that he had really captured its spirit in words. She also noted that we were very honored to have the Taconic State Park Commission with us today.

Linda Cooper, regional director for the Taconic Region, introduced George Gumina and Evelyn Hadad, both from the Friends of Rockefeller State Park, as driving forces behind the nomination.

George Gumina thanked the commission, Commissioner Harvey, the State Historic Preservation Office, Bill Krattinger, Linda Cooper, and Tom Watts for all their support. He noted that he was the founding president of the Friends of Rockefeller State Park and that the group was established in memory of his aunt, Peggy Rockefeller, who taught him about the carriage roads. He explained that after her death, he had approached his uncles, Lawrence and David Rockefeller, about the idea of documenting the roads to honor her legacy and they had readily agreed. He said that the designation is important to Westchester County, to New York State, to the nation and to the legacy of the Rockefeller family and that it meant a great deal to the entire family. He noted that it was twenty years in the making and that all the family members appreciated it very much.

Lucy Waletzky also thanked Bill for doing such an incredible job and for working so hard and so creatively. She thanked George for having the vision that the nomination was so necessary. She went on to explain that the landscape was a complete artistic vision of JDR Sr. and Jr. and said that it should not be tampered with. She cited the example of a future park manager who decides that the carriage roads should be narrower or wider or a “country path,” declaring that such could not happen anymore. She also mentioned preserving a habitat for wildlife that will not be further fragmented by any additional roads. She stated that preserving this artistic vision, as well as the wildlife habitat, was a major purpose of the designation.

Linda Cooper then introduced all the other members of the Taconic State Park Commission as well as the Taconic regional park staff who were in attendance (see list of attendees) before her own remarks. She commended the nomination of an incredible cultural landscape and thanked the board for honoring the accomplishments and vision of JDR Sr. and Jr. and all the members of the family that have maintained the land, given the land, helped to preserve the land in the state it's in, and kept the land in public use for many years, even before much of it was a state park. She especially honored the family members for keeping their land in public use and noted the restorative character of the carriage roads, stating that the roads are a public benefit for people in that part of the state and that the landscape gives sustenance to locals – from the Olmsted designed landscape of Rockwood Hall, on the banks of the Hudson, to the fifty plus miles of carriage roads. She concluded by urging an affirmative vote.

Wint Aldrich observed that the intersection of culture and nature is often and, in this case clearly, that part of our world that engages the affection and inspiration of people. He noted that it is

appropriate that this property is proposed for national significance (the only property today) and hoped that we can look forward to its designation as National Historic Landmark (NHL). He praised Bill for a masterful piece of work.

Motion to approve: Lucy Waletzky [see special note below]

Second: Wint Aldrich [see special note below]

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous [see special note below]

After the vote, Deputy Commissioner Daniel Mackay addressed Bill Krattinger, thanking him on behalf of colleagues in the unit and the staff as a whole, stating that we know what your enduring commitment to this nomination has meant. He stated that it was a technically challenging nomination and is likely unique nationally in terms of the complexity of transforming landscape to paper. Daniel noted that Bill had reached out to numerous colleagues in the agency and beyond and that he had endured and prevailed, concluding simply, “we thank you.”

SPECIAL NOTE on Rockefeller Pocantico Hills Historic District

After this nomination was approved and after SRB member Lucy Waletzky, the TSPC members, Taconic regional staff, and guests had left the meeting, a board member approached Deputy Commissioner Daniel Mackay with questions, asking for clarification regarding the board’s conflict of interest policies. They discussed whether or not there could be an appearance of a conflict of interest due to the participation of Lucy Waletzky, because of her family’s close involvement in the history of this district [Lucy is John D. Rockefeller Jr.’s granddaughter]. After lunch, Daniel explained that agency supervising counsel Kathleen Martens had been consulted during the break and that, although there may be no direct conflict of interest, Lucy could recuse herself from voting to avoid even the appearance of a conflict. Because Lucy was then unavailable, Daniel suggested that the board vote on the proposal again and emphasized that it was best for the board’s procedure to do so. After this situation was explained to the board, Chair Doug Perrelli called for a new motion and vote, which is reported below

Motion to approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Jay Di Lorenzo

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

After the new vote, First Deputy Commissioner Rob Hiltbrand reiterated that we had consulted with counsel’s office only out of an overabundance of caution and to be sure that, with all due respect to the family, this nomination was unquestionable.

Kristin Herron then asked if there was formal information on conflict of interest and the agency’s formal policy and procedure. She asked if we could circulate any formal policy to the board, mentioning that her agency (New York State Council on the Arts) had a formal procedure that everyone followed. Doug Perrelli agreed, noting that we would circulate it after the meeting. He added that the New York Archaeological Council had a similar policy. [Note: this discussion was been added to the board’s agenda for March] He speculated that something similar might apply to nominations funded by organizations, such as the Preservation League. The distinction was made, however, that if your organization funds something, you are not personally benefitting

from it. Jay DiLorenzo then asked for clarification about whether a board member should recuse him or herself if the member or a family member reside in a proposed district and the listing provided eligibility for tax credits. The consensus was that one should.

Ashokan Field Campus Historic District, Olive Bridge Vicinity, Ulster County

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion:

Jennifer introduced two guests, Jay Unger, president of the Ashokan Center, and Rosemary Nichols, secretary of the Ashokan Center, each of whom addressed the board.

Jay Unger thanked the board for considering the nomination, as the property is near and dear to the hearts of many. He noted that there are many people who have come through the Ashokan Center and had had life-changing experiences. He said that this year marks the tenth anniversary of the Ashokan Center and that it has been a high priority to keep school programs alive and relevant for the twenty-first century. Mr. Unger observed that the fact that we're learning more about the history of the property will enhance the programs for the children who visit with schools (mostly fourth, fifth and sixth graders), noting that over 200,000 students have visited since the 1960s. He stated that the research and nomination process had enriched his personal knowledge and interest in the property and thanked consultant Neil Larson (who was also present but did not address the board) for all of his work. Mr. Unger cited several examples of interesting oral histories that had been collected from people whose relatives grew up on the property and noted that the center will be incorporating more authentic history into its programs for kids and visitors. He noted that the center was now available for programs on sustainability and cited a recent program on the history of the [Ashokan] reservoir that had given more depth to the social and cultural history of the reservoir's creation and its effect on the area. He concluded by saying that he was honored to be part of something that continues to educate people of all ages.

Rosemary Nichols introduced herself as an attorney, a volunteer, and a board member for the Ashokan Center. She noted that she had come prepared to rebut a letter submitted by DEP [New York City Department of Environmental Protection] but noted that she was glad to hear from Deputy Commissioner Daniel Mackay that DEP had withdrawn its objection to the nomination because, thus far, the Ashokan Center had managed to get along very well with DEP.

Ms. Nichols explained that when property was available from SUNY New Paltz, two entities wanted it: NYC DEP, which wanted it for water management purposes, and the Ashokan Center, which wanted it to continue its historic use for outdoor education and because it included a historic fiddle and dance program. The Open Space Institute (OSI) was recruited to help divide the land, as the two uses could have been incompatible. She summarized that as per the deal negotiated by OSI, DEP could have the part of the land that related to the creek and the Ashokan Center could have the rest, but an arrangement was made, since so much of the education function would now be on DEP land, that the *land use* itself would belong to the Ashokan Center, even though it was on DEP land. She concluded by saying that DEP had given up all rights to the property except for the right to manage water.

Deputy Commissioner Daniel Mackay added a brief summary of recent events, noting that there had been correspondence between NYC DEP and the NYSHPO, which had concluded yesterday with a conference call between DEP and SHPO staff, during which DEP's questions and concerns had been addressed. As a result of that call, DEP had decided not to attend and not to object further to the nomination. Daniel noted that the SRB had received correspondence from DEP and reminded the board that any property owner had the right to appeal this board's action within sixty days; however, DEP had not requested postponement of consideration of the nomination by the board or postponement of the submission of the nomination.

Kristin Herron remarked that this was a clear, contextualized nomination for a historic district on a par with other historic districts. Doug Perrelli complimented Jennifer for her detailed history of the outdoor education movement, noting that the nomination was about the property in its entirety, not any of the individual structures. Jennifer noted that his compliments should go to consultant Neil Larson, who developed the context. Wint Aldrich said that the memo that Kath and Jennifer prepared in response to DEP's comments was terrific to read and said that he was not surprised that DEP was withdrawing its objection. Jennifer Lemak noted that there was an exhibit on the first floor based on the Woodstock Art Colony and that a lot of those artists were inspired by this same landscape, and she encouraged the board members to check it out if they had time.

Motion to approve: Kristin Herron

Second: Wint Aldrich

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

Hotel Saranac, Saranac Lake, Franklin County

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Wayne Goodman

Second: Paul Stewart

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

Triboro Hospital for Tuberculosis, Jamaica, Queens County

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion:

Jennifer introduced consultant Kerri Culhane, who addressed the board.

Kerri Culhane thanked Jennifer for her excellent guidance and editorial skills and noted that this was an excellent project because, prior to her client's involvement in creating affordable housing in this building, it was slated for demolition. She noted that this exciting project will bring back to life one of the most unique buildings in Queens, if not in New York City. In response to a question from Doug Perrelli, she reiterated that the building will house 100 percent affordable housing, including formerly homeless and low income families.

Doug Perrelli complimented the level of detail found in this nomination, especially the history of tuberculosis, with specific reference to the New York City context, and the information on the architects; he said that it was beautifully done.

Motion to approve: Jennifer Lemak

Second: Kristin Herron

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

Monarch Knitting Company Factory, Buffalo, Erie County

Presented by: Jennifer Walkowski

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Kristin Herron

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

Buildings at Niagara and Seventh Street, Niagara Falls, Niagara County

Presented by: Jennifer Walkowski

Discussion:

Doug Perrelli complimented the nomination's elegant treatment of context, citing the discussion of industrial vs natural and energy vs awe; he also really liked that the nomination brought in the Erie Canal and how things had changed over time.

Motion to approve: Wayne Goodman

Second: Doug Perrelli

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

Payne Avenue High School, North Tonawanda, Niagara County

Presented by: Jennifer Walkowski

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Jay DiLorenzo

Second: Paul Stewart

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

St. Anthony of Padua Church Complex, Syracuse, Onondaga County

Presented by: Virginia Bartos

Discussion:

Doug Perrelli commented on the excellent quality of the research on Catholicism in Syracuse and on the stained-glass windows. Doug also asked what the one non-contributing resource noted on the chart was, and Kath LaFrank noted that that was a typo; there are no non-contributing resources in the complex.

Motion to approve: Erika Krieger

Second: Jay DiLorenzo

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

Schoharie Village Historic District, Schoharie, Schoharie County

Presented by: Virginia Bartos

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Kristin Herron

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

After the vote, Daniel Mackay thanked Jay DiLorenzo and the Preservation League for finally getting this village where it needed to be, noting it was a very special piece of the Schoharie Valley and that the league funding was an important part of making this district happen. Jay in turn thanked Kristin Herron and the New York State Council on the Arts, which provided the funding. Kath LaFrank recalled working in the village on Labor Day Hurricane Irene with Commissioner Harvey and other parks and DEC employees and witnessing the great devastation that the flood had wrought; she noted that one post-flood proposal had called for demolition on the side of Main Street that was in the flood plain. She expressed her great relief at finally seeing this nomination completed as well.

Richmond Hill Historic District, Queens County

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion:

Doug Perrelli noted that this nomination had a wonderful map – which he would like to see in every nomination – of contributing and non-contributing resources. Kath LaFrank noted that we are required to send such a map to the NPS but explained that the maps are made by Mike Schifferli, our GIS person, who has a heavy workload, and that the final maps are not always ready until after the board meeting. However, she promised to address this issue if the board desired it. After Doug and other members reiterated how important these maps were to them, Kath promised to have the maps ready for future drafts.

Doug also liked the fact that the nomination explained how the term “Jamaica” came about, that it was derived from a native American term, and also noted the explanation of a railroad suburb and the division between the people who made the subdivision vs those who built the buildings themselves, noting that it was nicely done.

Daniel Mackay asked Jennifer to articulate the omission of the railroad viaduct from the district. Jennifer explained that the viaduct ran through and outside the district. Since including it would have made for a large and unwieldy boundary, and since NR guidance prohibits listing a portion of a resource, NYSHPO staff had reached out to NPS for guidance. The solution proposed by NPS staff, which was unusual (and was not unanimously agreed upon among NPS reviewers), was to treat the viaduct like a street: while the viaduct runs through the district, it will not be listed as a district resource. While we will follow the suggestion, this is an unusual and property specific solution and will not be used to set a precedent; however, it will allow us to move forward with this nomination.

Motion to approve: Jay DiLorenzo

Second: Doug Perrelli

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

Col. Peter B. Vroman House, Schoharie Vicinity, Schoharie County

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion:

Bill introduced the owners, Joe and Verna Heyman, each of whom addressed the board:

Joe Heyman introduced himself as a retired rocket scientist and noted that his wife was a college dean. He stated that he was honored to be in this community and to see the history of this house and its importance to the community. He noted that what they’ve seen done on the house and its construction, as explained by experts who understand the house and how it was built, was amazing. He said that he and his wife loved the house and the community and that they thoroughly enjoy taking care of it and seeing it move forward into next generation and, hopefully, next millennia.

Verna Heyman told the board about the Mildred Vrooman Easter Egg Museum, which is located in a non-contributing building on the property. Mildred Vrooman was a fifth great granddaughter of Col Vrooman, and she spent sixty years of her life painting eggs and putting them into scenes, such as “The Last Supper” or “The Old Stone Fort.” The museum will open to the public in the spring and will be a treasure for the community. She invited the board to visit.

Doug Perrelli asked Bill to address the archeology on the site, and Bill explained that archaeological investigations had been carried out on the site and that the site had been deemed significant by the state museum; however, we did not feel that the documentation and discussion was thorough enough to explain the methodology and to develop research questions that would satisfy NPS to support significance under criterion D. We had decided to add archeological significance to a nomination as an amendment at a later date. Kath LaFrank explained that we

would not have to bring the nomination back to the board; we could simply add additional criteria and areas of significance with additional supporting documentation as long as we did not change the boundary.

Motion to approve: Kristin Herron

Second: Wayne Goodman

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

After the vote, Daniel Mackay addressed the owners, noting that the state rehabilitation tax credit was now available to them.

German Evangelical Lutheran St. John's Church, Brooklyn, Kings County

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion: none

Motion to Approve: Wayne Goodman

Second: Wint Aldrich

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

Dresden School No 2, Clemons Vicinity, Washington County

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion:

Wint Aldrich inquired if the remote building was or had been on a public road, and Bill responded that it had been, but that the road was now closed and impassible beyond the building. Daniel Mackay asked Bill the motivation for the nomination, and Bill said that the owner was proud of the property and sought its public recognition.

Motion to Approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Erika Krieger

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

Rensselaer Society of Engineers House, Troy, Rensselaer County

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion:

Wint Aldrich asked if the building operated as a single chapter fraternity? Were the residents elected and could then live in the house? Bill said that yes, that was fair, and that it was important to distinguish this property from a "frat house."

Motion to approve: Doug Perrelli

Second: Paul Stewart

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous

St. Johnsville Historic District [Boundary Correction], St. Johnsville, Montgomery County

Presented by: Kathleen LaFrank

Discussion: none

Doug Perrelli asked if the issue requiring a boundary correction was similar to that discussed earlier about the Richmond Hill Viaduct, that one could not include part of a feature? Kath verified that he was generally correct, that in this instance we were adjusting the boundary to exclude the approach to a bridge and a section of a bridge that then extended outside the district and into another county because there was a clear and easy way to so do.

Motion to approve: Wayne Goodman

Second: Kristin Herron

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous [Jay Di Lorenzo recused himself]**Hazard Willcox Jr. Farm, Smyrna Vicinity, Chenango County**

Presented by: Kathleen LaFrank

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Kristin Herron

Vote: Recommended, Unanimous**BOARD BUSINESS****Report on Quorums**

Board Secretary Kath LaFrank gave a brief report on quorums, following up on a question from Jay DiLorenzo from the last meeting, Jay had asked Kath to look into how a quorum of the board was calculated to see if is based on how many members were actually serving, rather than how many board positions were allocated. After consulting with Kathleen Martens, our supervising attorney, Kath reported that the quorum is based on the number of positions and that we were required to have seven board members present to meet (based on the number of thirteen board positions). In talking to Kathleen, Kath had discovered that not only does the board need seven to hold a meeting, it also needs seven votes to pass an item. Kath explained that this could present a problem if only seven members were in attendance and one or more members had to recuse themselves. Other potential problems arising from this rule were also discussed, and Kath encouraged all ten members to attend each meeting if they possibly could at least until all thirteen board positions were filled.

Meetings

Calendar for 2019

The board discussed the calendar for 2019 and agreed on the following dates, which had been sent to them in advance:

June 13, 2019

September 5, 2019

December 4, 2019

*The date for the March meeting was left unresolved, as numerous conflicts on the part of on the part of members and staff had arisen; however, it was later set at **March 23, 2019**.

Death of William Murtagh

Wint Aldrich noted the recent death of William Murtagh, at the age of 95, recognizing his long career, which stretched into his late old age, in urging the work of historic preservation. Wint presented a moving tribute to Murtagh, providing a brief outline of Murtagh's career, beginning with his early work as an officer of the National Trust, then serving as a representative on UNESCO in Europe, explaining that Murtagh had been recruited by NPS to help congress establish the programs, such as the National Register, that had been created under the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966. He noted that Murtagh had then been appointed the first Keeper of the Register, a position in which he served for many years before returning to the National Trust. Wint noted that Murtagh had never stopped proselyting for historic preservation and urged the board to remember Bill Murtagh as a friend of historic preservation.

Michael Lynch added that he had known Bill, and that to people who had been in the program for many years, such as Kath LaFrank and himself, Bill was the *only* keeper. Kath added that she believed that Murtagh had either written the National Register criteria himself or had strongly influenced them and that their broad basis was why it was so difficult to challenge a well written nomination based on the criteria. She added that Murtagh's vision was that the criteria be broad enough to accommodate all kinds of properties, and noted that their broad basis was why they had been able to be used to evaluate all sorts of property types that had not even been conceived of when they were written.

Michael Lynch also asked the board to congratulate Wint Aldrich on a new book published by Rizzoli on the houses on the Livingston family for which Wint wrote an introduction.

The meeting of the New York State Board for Historic Preservation was adjourned at 1:14 pm on a motion by Jay DiLorenzo, seconded by Paul Stewart, and unanimously approved by the board. The members then commenced a tour of the new Erie Canal exhibit before participating in the New York State Preservation Awards at 2 pm.