

MINUTES

178th MEETING

**NEW YORK STATE BOARD FOR HISTORIC
PRESERVATION**

4 December 2019

**New York State Museum
Albany, New York**

The following were present:

SRB Members

Doug Perrelli, Chair
Erika Krieger
Wint Aldrich
Kristin Herron
Jay DiLorenzo (late)
Carol Clark
Jennifer Lemak
Wayne Goodman
Tom Maggs

Absent

Chuck Vandrei
Paul Stewart

New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation

Daniel Mackay, Deputy Commissioner for Historic Preservation
Michael Lynch, Director, Division for Historic Preservation
Julian Adams, Director, Community Preservation Services
John Bonafide, Director, Technical Service Bureau
Kathleen LaFrank, board secretary

Staff

Virginia Bartos
Jennifer Walkowski
Jennifer Betsworth
Bill Krattinger
Beth Cumming
Kathy Howe
Daniel Bagrow
Linda Mackey
Robyn Sedgwick
Olivia Brazee
Derek Rohde
Erin Czernecki
James Carter
James Finelli
Matt Dillon, intern
Greg Smith, sound
Jamel Mosely, videographer

Guests

Tyler Booth – Forsyth-Warren House
Jonathan Newman - Forsyth-Warren House
Bill MacRostie – tax credit consultant

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:37 a.m. by Chair Doug Perrelli. This was followed by the roll call.

Approval of Past Minutes

There being no further corrections to the minutes for the 177th meeting, they were approved on a motion by Tom Maggs, seconded by Kristin Herron, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

Board Members Introduction

Each member of the State Review Board introduced him or herself and provided a brief background for the staff and guests

REPORTS**Deputy Commissioner's Report: Daniel Mackay**

Deputy Commissioner Mackay briefly summarized what he called a very productive year for the division, noting that despite being short staffed, we will have nominated properties in thirty counties and included 3,700 properties on the registers in this calendar year. He also noted that tax credit projects had exceeded \$5 billion in private investment during the governor's two terms and that 80 percent of the new projects were in upstate New York, adding that the National Register was proving a fruitful source of applicants. He noted that the Historic Sites Bureau had a new role in direct capital planning for the historic sites and added that the division had asked the governor's office for \$100 million to ready the sites for several important upcoming anniversaries.

The deputy commissioner also announced that we had added a number of new staff at Peebles Island over the course of the year, that we now numbered 71, and noted that we had embarked on two special projects, a significant upgrade to the CRIS data base system and a state parks survey. Finally he announced the decision to merge the National Register and Survey Units in order to serve the public better. Following his remarks, Kathy Howe also made a brief announcement about the imminent launch of the "new" Trekker mobile survey app, which promises a vast improvement in our ability to collect data in the field.

NOMINATION REVIEWS

1. Sanford W. and Maude Smith House, Chatham, Columbia County

Presented by: Bill Krattinger

Discussion:

Carol Clark observed that Smith's wife had lived there thirty years after his death and had built the garage. Bill noted that the period of significance had been expanded to include her lifetime.

Motion to approve: Tom Maggs

Second: Erika Krieger

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

2. Accord Historic District, Accord, Ulster County

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion:

Doug Perrelli asked if we should worry about the large size of the non-contributing parcels in view of the proposed changes to the National Register regulations. It was noted that the changes had not yet occurred. Jennifer assured him that local support for this district was very high.

Motion to approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Jay DiLorenzo

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

3. Lewis Avenue Congregational Church, Brooklyn Kings County

Presented by: Jennifer Betsworth

Discussion:

Carol Clark noted that it was impressive that on one special occasion Governor Rockefeller had spoken at a morning church service and Martin Luther King Jr. had spoken at the church later that same afternoon.

Motion to approve: Tom Maggs

Second: Carol Clark

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

4. Minerva and Daniel Deland House, Fairport, Monroe County

Presented by: Virginia Bartos

Discussion

Kristin Herron complimented the sponsor on a fine nomination and the other members agreed.

Motion to approve: Wayne Goodman

Second: Kristin Herron

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

5. Ezra Huntington House, Auburn, Cayuga County

Presented by: Virginia Bartos

Discussion:

Carol Clark noted that the abolitionist legacy of the seminary itself was clear but that Huntington's was more ambiguous, asking staff if they agreed. Both Virginia and Kath answered affirmatively, saying that they had suggested omitting this portion of the nomination until research proved it conclusively. Virginia noted that the nomination's focus was on the house and on Dr. Huntington for his other contributions. Kristin Herron agreed, saying that the nomination did not need the questionable assertions.

Motion to approve: Carol Clark

Second: Wint Aldrich

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

6. Merrell-Soule None Such Mincemeat Factory, Syracuse, Onondaga County

Presented by: Virginia Bartos

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Jay DiLorenzo

Second: Jennifer Lemak

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

7. Forsyth-Warren Farm, Lockport vic., Niagara County

Presented by: Jennifer Walkowski

Discussion:

After her presentation, Jennifer introduced Tyler Booth, owner, who explained that he is working on restoring the property to its 1808 appearance in order to open it as a living history museum.

Bill Krattinger, who assisted Jennifer with the analysis of the property, related the results of his research on Dutch framed buildings in the area, noting that they had been found in York and

Toronto, Canada. He observed that clearly these traditions had been moving up and across the border in this period, a remarkable occurrence.

Wint Aldrich mentioned that the description of the violence of war in this nomination was especially gripping and noted that this was a commendable nomination.

Motion to approve: Tom Maggs

Second: Kristin Herron

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

8. Empire Worsted Mill, Jamestown, Chautauqua County

Presented by: Jennifer Walkowski

Discussion:

Carol Clark commented on the very thorough discussion of the complex manufacturing process undertaken at this mill and observed that it was notable for manufacturing uniforms for the union army during the Civil War.

Motion to Approve: Carol Clark

Second: Wint Aldrich

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

9. Buffalo Public School #78, Buffalo, Erie County

Presented by: Jennifer Walkowski

Discussion:

Several board members inquired as to the reason for the nomination and the future use of the building. Staff informed them that it was a tax credit applicant and was to be apartments. Several members noted its extremely intact condition.

Motion to Approve: Tom Maggs

Second: Kristin Herron

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

10. Broadway Historic District, Monticello, Sullivan County

Presented by: Kathleen LaFrank

Discussion:

Members inquired as the nature of the letter of objection and staff said that it came from four individuals who together owned one commercial building. No reason had been given. Carol Clark asked about the source of the yellow clay used for so many of the yellow brick buildings. Michael Lynch informed her that it mostly came from New Jersey, just over the border. Wint

Aldrich asked if we had listed any of the nearby Catskills resorts, and Kath explained the various problems with integrity that had prevented this.

Motion to approve: Wint Aldrich

Second: Erika Krieger

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

11. North Guilford Cemetery, North Guilford, Chenango County

Presented by: Kathleen LaFrank

Discussion: none

Motion to approve: Jay DiLorenzo

Second: Doug Perrelli

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

12. National Headquarters, March on Washington for Jobs and Freedom, New York, New York County

Presented by: Kathleen LaFrank

Discussion

Several members mentioned that this was a well-written and thoughtful nomination, asking that it be recommended at the national level of significance. Others noted that it was nice to recognize Bayard Rustin in a second nomination, even if we could not claim significance under criterion B (since the Bayard Rustin Apartment had already been listed under B).

Motion to approve: Tom Maggs

Second: Erika Krieger

Vote: Recommended, 9 in favor, 0 opposed

BOARD BUSINESS

“Reimagining the Canal”

Jay DiLorenzo presented a brief report on the status of the current “Reimagine the Canal” initiative, which is a governor-appointed force charged with looking at the Erie Canal system and imagining its best use in the next hundred years. He discussed the Preservation League’s status as an outside agency and stated that no preservation organizations had been included on the task force but noted the role of both State Parks and the Erie Canalway as influential preservation advocates on the task force. He also pointed out that the task force was looking at the canal system from the perspective of the canal’s new operator, the New York State Power Authority, which prioritized safety and cost, both of which are reasonable from that agency’s point of view. With that in mind, however, he speculated that the imagining process was motivated by the fact

that NYPA believed that the canal was no longer being used for its original purpose of commercial transportation (which was true) and that NYPA believed that optimal safety was not compatible with operating a canal (also probably true). This led the Preservation League to conclude that the task force's recommendations may present a threat to the preservation of this important National Historic Landmark and might even recommend its closure – or closure of some sections. The league has written a white paper stating its position that maintaining an operable canal best preserves it as a historic resource and also as a heritage tourism site that is highly unusual for New York State. He also noted its economic impact on municipalities and the growing support of elected official and the boating community, a constituency that he felt NYPA had not yet accurately assessed. However, until the task force releases its final report, outside agencies could only speculate on its contents. He concluded by noting that he thought there was a role for the board in responding to the task force but suggested waiting until the report was released so that there was something definite to respond to.

Board members briefly discussed the reimagining initiative and some expressed dismay on hearing Jay's speculations of potential impacts. All agreed to wait until the report was released before taking action.

After Jay's report, Daniel Mackay passed out maps of the new National Register and Survey territories and the former survey staff introduced themselves and explained which territories they would be covering.

New Meeting Dates

The board approved the following meeting dates for 2020:

March 19, 2020
 June 11, 2020
 September 10, 2020
 December 3, 2020

Resolution

The meeting concluded with Wint Aldrich reading a resolution regarding the service of Kathleen LaFrank, which [will be] attached to these minutes.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:53 p.m. on a motion by Wayne Goodman seconded by Tom Maggs, 9 in favor, 0 opposed.