

CHAPTER VII

COMMENTS AND RESPONSES

The Black Diamond Trail project, and its many iterations over the past 30 years, has been the subject of several public information meetings. On November 21, 2007, a draft master plan for the trail project was finally released for public review and comment.

The following chapter presents the summary of public comment and the responses from the New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation.

INTRODUCTION

The Draft Master Plan/Draft Environmental Impact Statement for the Black Diamond Trail was released for public comment and review from November 21, 2007 to January 15, 2008. Two public workshops and public hearings were held on December 5th and 6th, 2007 respectively. By the close of the comment period, 146 people submitted either oral or written comments on the proposed trail plan. A list of the persons and organizations providing comments is contained at the end of this chapter.

The two public workshops and hearings were well attended. At the December 5th session, 99 people registered with 33 attendees speaking during the public hearing component of the evening. At the December 6th session, 100 people registered with 37 attendees providing an oral comment. The oral comments were recorded and transcribed by a court reporting service for OPRHP.

The OPRHP received 120 letters and e-mails from interested people and organizations. Comments received included general statements of support or opposition, corrections or updates to the master plan text, requests for clarification on design and operation proposals and specific comments on trail location and infrastructure. All comments, both written and oral, were reviewed, summarized and organized by their relationship to the chapters and subsections of the master plan.

This section of the master plan presents a summary of the comments and OPRHP's responses to these comments. The Final Master Plan/Final Environmental Impact Statement (FEIS) includes revisions as noted in the responses to comments.

The New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation values the time and input given by persons interested in the proposed Black Diamond Trail project. Public input ensures that the future implementation of the trail project contributes in a positive way to the Tompkins County area's recreational and transportation opportunities.

RESPONSE TO COMMENTS

General - Comments of Support

A significant number of comments, provided orally and in writing, expressed general support for the trail project and encouraged OPRHP to move forward with implementation and construction. The following list summarizes the reasons of support for the trail project.

A beautiful path linking the equally beautiful parks.

With rising gas prices, trail gives people an alternative way to travel.

Will encourage people to get out to exercise in a safe environment.

Low costs associated with participating in outdoor activity - the cost of a pair of shoes.
 Asset for Tompkins County tourism - will encourage more people to visit.
 Name supports area railroad history.
 Supports a cleaner environment.
 Appreciated by the non-car-owning population in Tompkins County.
 Will make family bicycling trips safer.
 Asset for bicyclists who do not want to use roads and highways.
 Will enhance the quality of life in area.
 Good resource for runners.
 Business owners will benefit.
 Money spent on trail is a plus to help keep the population healthy.
 Trail secures a corridor that could be used for some other transportation mode in the future.
 Trail development will eliminate illicit land trespassing and encroachments on adjacent private property.
 Great resource for community events, fund-raisers.
 Provides an opportunity to educate young people about the natural resources in the area.
 Supports a sustainable way to move around the community.
 Positive addition for seniors with physical limitations.

Chapter II - Guiding Principles

Goals and Objectives

Comment: Trail as a transportation corridor

Several oral and written comments were received noting that people will use the trail as a transportation corridor between their residences and work or school.

Response: Noted.

Comment: Safe Resource for Bicycling

There were many comments regarding the value of the trail to cyclists in the area who use their bikes for both transportation and recreation and do not want to ride on the busy road system.

Parents and grandparents also noted that they look forward to being able to take their children to a safe environment to ride bicycles.

Response: Noted.

Comment: Ithaca-Tompkins County Transportation Council Plan

The Black Diamond Trail supports the Transportation Council’s long-term plan for a multi-modal transportation system.

Response: Noted.

Comment: Finger Lakes Trail

The Black Diamond Trail will afford the Cayuga Lakes Trail Club the opportunity to develop loop trails to the other state and city park facilities in Tompkins County.

Response: OPRHP looks forward to working with other trail groups to expand trail-based recreational opportunities in the Finger Lakes Region.

Chapter III - Environmental Setting and Existing Conditions

Local Setting

Comment: Hogs Hole Wetland

Understands that the Hogs Hole wetland in Allan H. Treman State Marine Park is a DEC wetland and is confused why it says in the draft master plan that its designation is to be investigated (on pg. III-18).

Response: The New York State Department of Environmental Conservation determined in 1991 that the Hog Hole wetland area in Allan H. Treman State Marine Park should be designated as state regulated wetland. The NYSDEC noted that the area should be placed on the regulatory map, a process that requires a public comment period. To date, the NYSDEC has not completed the formal process. The text on page III-18 of the master plan has been amended to clarify the status.

Comment: Fire Protection

On page III-31, it says that the Black Diamond Trail will get fire protection from the Town and City of Ithaca. The Town of Ithaca contracts with the City of Ithaca for fire protection and does not provide it directly.

Response: Noted. The text has been corrected.

Chapter IV - Analysis and Alternatives

Resource Analysis

Comment: Trail Use and Hunting

Hunting occurs on lands adjacent to the trail, particularly related to the trail between Ithaca and Trumansburg. Trails users will disrupt game species. Also trail users may not be safe using the trail during hunting seasons.

Response: The OPRHP operates many facilities where trails and hunting coexist. Hunting season posters will be installed at all trailheads and access points related to the Black Diamond Trail to inform the public that hunting does occur on adjacent private property.

Comment: Temporary Trail Closures

Parks & Trails New York works with many trail organizations across New York State and it has been the organization's experience that trails do not need to be closed during hunting seasons or when agricultural lands are being treated with pesticides.

Response: Noted.

Trail Alternatives

Comment: Paved Spur Trail around Buttermilk Falls State Park

The plan recommends that the trail system, main line and spurs, around Buttermilk Falls State Park be paved to match up with the developing Gateway Trail. The decision on the surface material for the Gateway Trail has not been decided.

Response: OPRHP will be a part of the planning process for the Gateway Trail. It is noted that the surface decision for the Gateway Trail has not been made. Page IV-48 of the master plan has been corrected to reflect this comment.

Comment: Trail Surface Materials

The trail surface materials should be matched to the terrain, particularly considering erosion issues.

Response: The majority of the trail will be surfaced with compacted limestone dust which allows absorption of water under most precipitation conditions. Where an asphalt surface is recommended, vegetated swales will be constructed along the trail edges to collect and filter run-off.

Comment: Trail Surface for Multiple Uses

The trail should be developed with different trail surfaces for different users. Runners prefer softer surfaces like grass. Equestrians also prefer a softer surface.

Response: The majority of the trail treadway will be surfaced with compacted limestone dust. This surface material is softer than asphalt, yet meets the guidelines for accessibility for physically-challenged individuals. The trail design also calls for two-foot wide grass or natural vegetation shoulders along each side of the trail. Where the shoulders will be maintained by regular mowing, e.g. in the urban area, runners can use the shoulders rather than the stone-dust surface. Equestrian use of the trail will be evaluated as construction progresses. The safest trail facility to include equestrian use involves developing a parallel, separated trail corridor for horses. The width of the abandoned rail corridor may not provide the adequate space to develop an equestrian trail facility.

Comment: Motorized Vehicle Use

A number of comments were received requesting that all-terrain vehicles and snowmobiles not be allowed to use the trail for safety and trail-user experience issues. Reasons for not allowing the use included speed of operation vs. slow moving walkers and skiers, noise and fumes disrupting a peaceful, quiet walk or ride, and noise disrupting the quiet that adjoining private residents enjoy.

Response: OPRHP does not allow all-terrain vehicle use on property under its jurisdiction. Snowmobiles are allowed to use state park property in designated areas. Snowmobile use of the Black Diamond Trail will be limited to a short portion of the trail that passes through the west area of Taughannock Falls State Park. The specific area is to allow use of the old railroad bridge over Taughannock Creek which would remove the snowmobile traffic off Jacksonville Road and the narrow road bridge over Taughannock Creek.

In addition, trail projects funded by the Federal Transportation Enhancements Program prohibit motor vehicle use of a facility built for pedestrian and bicycles with the exception of use for maintenance purposes; snowmobiles, when snow conditions and state and local regulations permit; motorized wheelchairs; and electric bicycles, when state and local regulations permit. (Federal Law 23 USC 217)

Comment: Allow Some Snowmobile Use

The Tompkins County Sheriff encouraged OPRHP to allow snowmobile use in areas that would improve traffic safety, particularly where there are narrow shoulders along local roads.

Response: Snowmobile use of the Black Diamond Trail will be limited to a short portion of the trail that passes through the west area of Taughannock Falls State Park. The specific area is to allow use of the old railroad bridge over Taughannock Creek which would remove the snowmobile traffic off

Jacksonville Road and the narrow road bridge over Taughannock Creek. This allowance has been more specifically defined in the master plan on pages IV-44, IV-49 and V-79.

Comment: Trail Amenities

The trail mentions some support facilities for trail users, but could a warming hut for cross-country skiers be considered, possibly at the Cayuga Nature Center?

Response: The OPRHP will monitor trail use over time to determine whether and where additional support facilities will improve the experience of trail users. At this time, the plan does not include warming huts or shelters.

Comment: Equestrian Use

Consideration should be given to allowing horseback riders to use portions of the trail.

Response: OPRHP will continue to explore the potential for allowing equestrian use of segments of the trail, particularly the segment between Allan H. Treman and Taughannock Falls where it is a more suitable setting for such use. Combining equestrian use with bicycling and walking is most successful when horses can be accommodated on a separate trail corridor. The limiting factor to including equestrian use on the Black Diamond Trail is the narrow width of the former railroad bed.

Comment: Trail Width

There were several comments on the trail width. Generally, there is interest in keeping it as narrow as safe for multiple uses so as to retain and preserve the natural character of the corridor. There was also recognition that there is the need to find a middle ground for trail width to fit all activities, specifically skiing and snowmobiling, where allowed. The caption for the photo SP 44+500, on page V-86, notes a 16-foot horizontal clearance.

Response: The actual travel way width of the trail as proposed is 10 feet. This is the minimum width recommended by AASHTO and the Rails-to-Trails Conservancy for a trail that will accommodate walking and bicycling. Two-foot wide grass or natural vegetation shoulders are proposed on either side of the trail to maintain a safe horizontal clearance. The caption for SP 44+500 has been amended to 14 feet, which includes the width of the 10-foot-wide treadway and 2-foot-wide vegetation shoulders on each side of the trail.

Chapter V - Trail Master Plan

General Design Comments

Comment: Other Bridge Structures

The City of Ithaca moth-balled pieces of an old truss bridge removed during the Octopus (Routes 79, 96, 89) reconstruction project. OPRHP should consider using the bridge for one of the stream crossings identified in the plan.

Response: OPRHP will share the information with the bridge design consultants.

Comment: Bridge Design

OPRHP should consider using local artists to help design aesthetic elements into the trail that celebrate the local culture.

Response: Noted.

Comment: Visual Design of Trail

Create meanders in the trail to enhance visual aesthetics. Use shrubs and keep existing vegetation to enhance the aesthetics.

Response: OPRHP will consider the suggestion and incorporate curves in the trail where it does not create an unsafe condition and the landscape allows for an alteration.

Comment: Trail Corridor

The plan notes that parcels still need to be acquired to complete the trail corridor, but the reader cannot easily evaluate the significance of the missing pieces.

Response: The parcels that still need to be acquired are denoted on the master plan maps, MP-1 through MP-6. The parcels yet to be acquired are located in the Robert H. Treman to Buttermilk Falls and Allan H. Treman to Taughannock Falls segments.

Design Criteria

Comment: Handicap access

There should be multiple access points for handicapped people along a suitable trail.

Response: The OPRHP will develop the Black Diamond Trail to provide opportunities for persons with disabilities. Access points will be provided where it is safe and provide adequate space to develop the parking area required by ADA guidelines.

Trail Plan

Robert H. Treman State Park to Buttermilk Falls State Park

Comment: Black Diamond Trail and Gateway Trail Link

The two trails are shown on the master plan maps but there appears to be an unexplained link between the two trails.

Response: The OPRHP, the Town of Ithaca and the City of Ithaca are partnering on the development of the Gateway Trail. The trail segment between the Black Diamond Trail main line and the Gateway Bridge is under the jurisdiction of the OPRHP and will be part of the Gateway Trail.

Comment: Update Photo SP 11+800 on Page V-59

The property shown in Photo SP 11+800 has more second-growth vegetation now than when the photo was taken.

Response: Noted. A new photo will be inserted.

Comment: Condition of Cayuga Inlet Banks.

There is significant erosion along the banks of the Cayuga Inlet near the intersection with Buttermilk Creek. The conditions causing the erosion should be remedied before the trail is constructed or the public funds investment will be wasted. The sediment deposited by the erosion is impacting the Cayuga Inlet Flood Control Channel depth downstream toward Cayuga Lake.

Response: OPRHP will work with the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation and the United States Army Corps of Engineers to determine the appropriate approach to the erosion problem. This issue also exists on the lands south between Buttermilk Falls State Park and Robert H. Treman State Park.

Comment: West Buttermilk Falls Road

Trail users traveling north from Robert H. Treman may attempt to use West Buttermilk Falls Road to reach the day-use area of Buttermilk Falls State Park. The falls themselves are visible from the road location.

Response: Trail users traveling north from Robert H. Treman State Park to Buttermilk Falls State Park will be directed off the main line of the trail before reaching the West Buttermilk Falls Road area. Users coming from Robert H. Treman will use a trail through the Larch Meadows area of the park to reach the day-use area. Trail users coming south from the City of Ithaca and other points to the north will be directed to use the Gateway Trail and bridge over N.Y.S. Route 13 to reach Buttermilk Falls State Park prior to reaching the West Buttermilk Falls Road intersection. A warning sign will be placed on the gate at the end

of West Buttermilk Falls Road directing trail users to the Gateway Bridge crossing. The need to install a warning sign at this location has been added to the plan on page V-57.

Comment: Gateway Bridge

The trail segment map for the trail segment between Buttermilk Falls State Park and Allan H. Treman State Marine Park notes that the Gateway Bridge is “to be” constructed. The bridge is complete.

Response: Figure MP-2 is corrected.

Buttermilk Falls State Park to Allan H. Treman State Marine Park/Cass Park

Comment: Trail Bridge over Flood Control Channel

Discussion of the aesthetics of the trail bridge over the Flood Control Channel in the City of Ithaca should happen early in the design process and funding for a visually pleasing bridge allocated. It should be more than a utilitarian structure as it will be located along the emerging publicly accessible waterfront in the city. The master plan should include a recommendation to build an aesthetically pleasing trail.

Response: Text recommending that an aesthetically pleasing bridge be designed for the Flood Control Channel crossing has been added to the master plan in the discussion of the trail segment connecting Buttermilk Falls State Park to Allan H. Treman State Marine Park/Cass Park on page V-69.

Comment: Cornell Railroad Historical Society Assistance.

Members of the Cornell Railroad Historical Society are willing to provide assistance is developing interpretive material about the history of the Lehigh Valley Railroad’s “Black Diamond” passenger train.

Response: Noted.

Comment: Southwest Area Trail Route Alternative

The alternate route on Figure V-8 should be pursued in conjunction with the proposed new southwest neighborhood development being explored by the City of Ithaca. This route would provide the new neighborhood with a direct access to the Black Diamond Trail.

Response: Future spur links to the Black Diamond Trail will be encouraged and OPRHP is committed to work with partners to expand access to the Black Diamond Trail. The major obstacle to building the alternative shown in Figure V-8 is the construction of a new, at-grade pedestrian crossing across the active Norfolk-Southern Rail line. It is the intent of OPRHP to join with the City of Ithaca, the Town of Ithaca and the Ithaca-Tompkins County Transportation Council, with assistance of the State and Federal elected officials, to engage Norfolk-Southern Railroad in a dialog regarding accommodating bicycle and pedestrian crossings where needed for efficient movement of travelers on foot and bicycle.

Allan H. Treman State Marine Park/Cass Park to Taughannock Falls State Park

Comment: Emergency/Maintenance Access near Cayuga Medical Center

An emergency access road to the trail (road with no name) is shown on the map plan in the area of Indian Creek Road and the written document refers to it as a road for maintenance and operations purposes. The road is used by neighbors during the summer to walk. Concern was expressed that this could become another trailhead, thus increasing traffic in the neighborhood.

Response: The road referred to is located on Cayuga Medical Center at Ithaca, Inc. property and was the access road to the boiler plant that served the old hospital complex. OPRHP identified this existing road as a potential access point for emergency services and maintenance access only. This point of access would provide an interim access along this 3.5-mile stretch of trail that is unbroken by any road crossings. OPRHP use

of the property would have to be granted by Cayuga Medical Center. It is not OPRHP's intent to develop a trailhead in this area. The master plan map MP-3 has been updated to clarify the relationship of the road with Cayuga Medical Center.

Comment: Snowmobile Use to Enhance Local Club's Trail System

The Twin Lakes Snowmobile Club requested that OPRHP consider allowing the club to use portions of the Black Diamond Trail corridor to improve connections between their trail system they maintain on private property.

Response: OPRHP considered the request made by the club earlier in the plan development process. OPRHP has identified a segment of the trail that would allow the club safer access between their trail system by allowing use of the existing bridge crossing of the Taughannock Creek east of Jacksonville Road. This opportunity for snowmobile use is included in the master plan for the Black Diamond Trail. The remainder of the trail passes very close to residential property and it will not be appropriate to allow snowmobile use due to noise and some late-night hours of the club's activities.

Comment: Cayuga Nature Center

The Cayuga Nature Center will directly benefit by linking the Center's trail system to the Black Diamond Trail and will work with OPRHP to develop and manage a trailhead on the Center's property.

Response: Noted. OPRHP looks forward to working with the Cayuga Nature Center to enhance and expand opportunities to share information and appreciation of the natural resources of the area.

Comment: Trailhead at the Cayuga Nature Center

The location of the trailhead on Cayuga Nature Center property is in an area that is not densely populated. The adjacent property owners are concerned about OPRHP's ability to police and

maintain the area. The area would also discourage people from starting their trips from the state park facilities. Lighting the area would not be acceptable to the neighborhood. The installation of a bathroom facility that requires the use of water would impact the local aquifer. If “Porta-Johns” are used they will be an eye-sore and generate unwanted truck traffic on the rural residential road.

Response: The mileage between bathroom facilities on the segment of trail between Allan H. Treman/Cass Park and Taughannock Falls State Park is approximately 8.5 miles. It is the experience of OPRHP on other trail facilities that the availability of bathrooms along longer stretches of trail are desired by trail users. OPRHP will work with the Cayuga Nature Center to determine if there are other options to provide trail users with a bathroom that would lessen the impact on the surrounding neighborhood.

Comment: Bison Farm

An adjacent property is being developed to host a bison farm. Property for the enterprise is located on both sides of the trail. Concern is raised that trail users will harass the bison or potentially release the animals, views of the bison from the trail will diminish the owner’s ability to market on-site farm tours, trash receptacles for the trail will result in the bison challenging the fence or create a fly infestation problem, and trail establishment will restrict the property owners from moving between their property that is located on both sides of the OPRHP property.

Response: The OPRHP is committed to working with adjacent property owners to design and operate the trail to minimize impacts to the use and enjoyment of the adjacent private properties. Agency staff will meet and work with the owners of the bison farm to ensure design elements are built into the trail project that protect both the property owner and trail users from undesirable interactions. Page V-84 of the plan references the bison farm operation and the need to coordinate with the owners/operators.

Comment: Trail Splits Adjacent Property

Where a farm crossing exists and is used several times in a day, who is liable if an accident occurs between a trail user and an adjacent property owner?

Response: A traffic safety sign system will be installed where the trail intersects with an adjacent property owner’s crossing as is similar to the trail and road crossing situation. Accidents between trail users and adjacent owners would have to be evaluated pursuant to the law on a case by case basis. A notation addressing the sign issue for this specific crossing has been added to master plan map MP-5.

Comment: Culvert maintenance

There are many culverts along the old railroad corridor between Ithaca and Trumansburg that are currently not maintained causing flood damage to adjacent property and need to be replaced.

Response: Rehabilitating and in some cases re-establishing the drainage system constructed by the Lehigh Valley Railroad will be one of the first construction related activities that the OPRHP will pursue following the adoption of the master plan. The OPRHP has responded to adjacent owner’s telephone calls alerting the agency to culvert problems and will continue to do so.

Comment: Trail Placement Near Private Residential Property

An adjacent owner at the northern end of the Allan H. Treman to Taughannock Falls section of the trail where it enters the Village of Trumansburg is concerned about alignment of the trail and would like to be involved with the creation to be sure that their interests are protected. The trail corridor is very close to their residence. They have proposed in past discussions with OPRHP ending the trail in the northeastern side of Grove Cemetery. They would like to know if their idea was taken into consideration and would like the end point to be well thought out.

Response: The OPRHP acknowledges the existing condition associated with this private property. As noted in the master plan, OPRHP intends to expand the discussion of the connection to the Village of Trumansburg with the Village of Trumansburg and the Town of Ulysses before a final option is selected. To more effectively serve the population of the Village of Trumansburg, the potential to have more than one spur trail connection from the village to the Black Diamond Trail should be explored and will be the focus of a joint planning project with the two municipalities. The OPRHP, however reserves the option to use the abandoned rail corridor adjacent to this property. Graphic V-17, page V-104, has been added to the master plan to represent the potential alternative to add an additional route along this spur to the Village of Trumansburg to minimize the impact to the adjacent owner.

Operation, Management and Maintenance

Comment: Trail Etiquette

Multi-use trails do have safety drawbacks if all the users do not know and follow trail etiquette. It will be important to address this issue in the planning stage by building in educational and safety elements.

Response: The OPRHP will install orientation signage at all trail access points that will include trail etiquette along with rules and regulations for using the trail. The section of the master plan on page V-106 addressing this issue has been expanded to clarify how the OPRHP will manage the multi-use issue.

Comment: Cross-country Skiing

The trail should not be plowed in the winter to accommodate cross-country ski use.

Response: OPRHP expects to operate the trail as an all-season facility. Cross-country skiing and snowshoeing will be encouraged on the trail. OPRHP does not intend to plow sections of the trail outside the urban area. OPRHP will work

with the City of Ithaca to define the extent of snow clearing that will occur on sections located within the city limits.

Comment: Trail Users Fee

Motorized recreational vehicles must pay a registration fee or user fee to use state parks. Trail users should have to pay a fee as well. This is an expensive project for a few people.

Response: OPRHP provides opportunities for a wide variety of recreational activities. Not all activities have a user fee. The OPRHP will encourage the establishment of a "Friends of the Black Diamond Trail" group that can raise funds through membership and events that can help maintain trail infrastructure.

Comment: Safety and Security

There are some stretches of the trail that are long and do not have immediate access from a nearby road. What consideration is being given to law enforcement and security for adjacent private property owners?

Response: Rails-to-Trails Conservancy studies and correspondence with trail operators cross the country regarding criminal use of trails to burglarize homes and businesses finds that little to no activity of this nature is associated with multi-use trails. OPRHP will employ its New York State Park Police and Park Rangers to patrol the trail corridor to deter illicit use.

Comment: Trail Access by Emergency Vehicles

How will other law enforcement agencies and emergency responders be given access to the trail?

Response: OPRHP works closely with police and emergency responders to ensure that the agencies have access to the keyed security gates systems located in state parks. This policy will continue for access to the keyed gate system for the Black Diamond Trail as noted on page V-108 of the master plan.

Comment: Tripartite Agreement

A copy of the agreement should be included as an appendix. Considerable time has passed since the agreement was signed. New people at the Town of Ithaca and City of Ithaca will be involved with coordinating implementation of responsibilities.

Response: A copy of the agreement will be added as an appendices.

Comment: Trail Maintenance

What is the projected annual maintenance cost for the trail? Who will be responsible for maintaining the trail and trailheads.

Response: The Rails-to-Trails Conservancy has collected information from trail operators across the country regarding maintenance and operations costs. On average, non-asphalt surfaced trails require \$1,500 per mile annually to maintain. OPRHP will be the primary entity responsible for maintenance. A Friends group will also be encouraged to develop that can assist OPRHP with day-to-day maintenance activities, thus potentially reducing the budget amount the OPRHP will need to maintain the trail.

Comment: Dogs Off Leash

Dogs allowed to run off leash will be a problem for adjacent landowners.

Response: OPRHP's rules and regulations require dog owners to have their dogs under their control at all times on a leash no longer than 6 feet. This rule will be enforced on the Black Diamond Trail.

Comment: Dogs on Trail

Trail users who bring their dogs impact other users, particularly bicyclists.

Response: All trail users are responsible to follow trail etiquette which will be posted at all trailheads and periodically along the way. The OPRHP will encourage a "Friends of the Black Diamond Trail" group to develop and implement a Trail Stewards

program. Stewards will assist OPRHP to ensure that trail users do not unduly impact other users enjoyment of the trail. OPRHP staff, including park maintenance, security and Park Police, will also be on the trail managing the use.

Comment: Parking Along Roadways

People will likely park along the roads where the trail crosses to access shorter segments of the trail. This situation will be most relevant to the trail segment between Allan H. Treman and Taughannock Falls where the trail crosses several county and town roads. This will cause unsafe situations along these roads. How will OPRHP handle this?

Response: Providing an adequate number of trailheads along the route of a multi-use trail helps to reduce the need for trail users to park along roadways to access shorter segments of trails. OPRHP will also work with the local municipality to post "No Parking" areas and enforce the posted areas with New York State Park Police patrols, if necessary.

Comment: Garbage cleanup

Garbage clean up is necessary as there is a lot of trash along the trail.

Response: Illegal dumping occurred on the abandoned rail corridor during the years prior to OPRHP's ownership. As part of the trail development, garbage will be removed and disposed of properly. A system of gates and bollards will be installed at all road crossings eliminating the opportunity for illicit dumping on state parks land.

Comment: Access Hours

Limit trail access to daylight hours.

Response: The trail will be used by people for recreation and transportation. The recommended hours of operation for the trail will be the same as other state park facilities which is dawn to dusk. Use beyond the time limits as it relates to

transportation movement will be monitored and hours of use adjusted if needed.

Implementation

Comment: Trail Plan Implementation

Many oral and written comments were made regarding the long time frame of the construction plan for the trail. Suggestions were made that OPRHP should break down the construction of the trail into smaller sections and develop them to a level that would allow some use of the corridors over a shorter time frame (1 to 2 years) rather than the time frame indicated in the plan (5 to 7 years).

Response: OPRHP will make sections of the trail corridor available for some use by the public as sections are cleared and drainage and bridge structures repaired. A paragraph with the recommendation to open the trail to some use in a less-than-finished condition was added on page V-110.

Comment: Construction Assistance from Local Community Resources

The OPRHP should look to the local community to assist in completing construction activities that could open segments of the trail for some public use before the trail is complete with all the detailed amenities. There are many volunteers, from residents to businesses, who are willing to contribute to the trail's construction that could decrease the need to use public funds. For example, the Cornell Student Chapter of the American Society of Civil Engineers has offered to design or build bridges and culverts.

Response: The OPRHP values community assistance and will follow up on working with groups identified during the public comment period for the draft master plan. The discussion of funding sources, starting on page V-111, has been amended to include a Local Community Assistance category.

Comment: Tompkins County Support

The Tompkins County Public Works Department is willing to assist with resources to get the trail under construction.

Response: Noted.

Comment: Trail Construction Phasing

Several comments requested that construction begin on the trail segment that will link Trumansburg to Ithaca.

Response: It is the intention of OPRHP to implement the trail in phases. Phase 1 will be construction of the trail linking Allan H. Treman State Marine Park to Taughannock Falls State Park, which will construct the majority of the trail link between the communities of Trumansburg and Ithaca. The implementation schedule is located on page V-110.

Cost Estimate

Comment: Appropriate use of Federal and State transportation funds.

The money to be spent on the trail should go to up keep of the existing park facilities and the state and interstate highway systems.

Response: Noted. Resolving the debate on how funds for government sponsored programs should be spent, i.e. roads versus parks and trails, is beyond the scope of this project.

Chapter VI - Environmental Impact Analysis

Comment: Privacy of Adjacent Owners

Several adjacent property owners noted their concern that trail users will trespass onto their property interfering with their privacy.

Response:

The OPRHP is committed to work with the adjacent landowners to build elements into the trail design (e.g. fences, additional vegetation plantings) and management that best suit the individual property owner's issues and interface with the trail.

Comment: Wildlife

Developing the trail through relatively undeveloped areas will disrupt wildlife.

Response:

OPRHP's experience as an operator of hundreds of miles of trails across the State of New York is that trails and wildlife can exist together.

Persons/Organizations Who Provided Comments

<u>Name</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Greg Potter	Resident	
John Coggin	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Marilyn Kane	Resident	
Tom Myers	Resident	
Victoria Armstrong	Resident	
Will Burbank	Resident/Councilman	Town of Ithaca
Joe McMahon	Resident – Pedestrian	
John Schroeder	Chair	City of Ithaca Planning & Development Board
Martha F. Ferger	Resident	
Joanna Cummings	Resident	
Jebediah D. Mead	Resident	
Lesley Greene	Resident	
Jan Zeserson	Resident	
Andrea Dutcher	Resident – Biking Enthusiast	
Ed Marx	Commissioner	Planning & Public Works Tompkins County
David Elliott	Resident	
Diana Ozolins	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Daniel Touranee	Resident	
Quinn Thomas	Resident – Local Running Community	
Ian Golden	Owner	Finger Lakes Running Company
Tob de Boer	Member	Cayuga Nordic Ski Club
Fay Gougakis	Resident – Bicyclist	
Fernando de Aragon	Director	Ithaca-Tompkins County Transportation Council
Gay Nicholson	Program Coordinator	Sustainable Tompkins
Catherine McCarthy	Resident	
Melissa Garrett	Resident	
Ed Hart	Resident	
Andre Ozolins		
Pam Mackesey	Legislator – District 1	Tompkins County Legislature\

<u>Name</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Scott Sherwood	Owner President	Spruce Row Campground Twin Lakes Snowmobile Club
James and Rita Brown	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Marvin Pritts	Vice President	Board of Directors, Cayuga Nature Center
Ian A. Merwin	Resident, Owner	Black Diamond Farm
Regis Carver	Resident	
Andy Yale	Resident	
Krys Cail	Resident	
Herb Engman	Resident	
Roxanne Marino	Resident	
Dolores Higareda	Resident	
Janice Plante	Resident	
Donald Wilson	Resident – Cyclist	
David A. Tyler	Resident Member	Town of Ulysses Comprehensive Plan Update Committee
Bruce Rich	Resident	
Warren Brown	Resident	
Ashley Miller	Resident	
Eugene Endres	Resident Historian/Editor	Cornell Railroad Historical Society
Bruce John	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Harriet H. Sutherland and Richard Welch	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
David Holmberg	Resident	
Tim and Patricia Wach	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Sandra B. Hill	Resident	
Peter D. Burgevin	Resident	
Jason Koski	Resident	
Connor Burgevin	Resident	
George E. Reynolds	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Joe Burns	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Dan Clement	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Robert Thomas	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Bill Fearn	Resident	

<u>Name</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Sharon Bilotta-Withiam	Resident	
Richard Leed	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Rachael Richards	Resident	
Barbara Page	Resident	
Lucia Tyler	Resident Councilperson	Town of Ulysses
Brendan O’Brien	Resident	
Edward Sidote	Member	Finger Lakes Trail Conference
Michelle Matro	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Patricia Bennett Riddle	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Christine Tonitto	Resident	
Tim Logue	City Transportation Engineer	City of Ithaca
Rob Licht	Resident	
Andrew Moore and Cori Vogel	Residents – Trail Neighbors	
John Hamilton	Resident	
Margot Brinn	Resident	
Tommy Beers	Resident	
David Kreinick	Resident	
Gary Hodges	Resident	
Jon Cheetham	Resident	
Lanny Joyce	Resident	
Margo Alexander	Resident	
Judy Burns	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Elizabeth Thomas	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Celeste Withiam	Resident (8-yr old)	
Thomas Withiam	Resident (10-yr old)	
Steven Powell	Resident	
Christine Porter	Resident	
Peter Feitner	Resident	
Linda Waymire	Resident	
Felix Naschold	Resident	
Jonathan Bernstein	Resident	
Denise and David Kooperman	Residents – Trail Neighbor	

<u>Name</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Organization</u>
James W. Hamilton	Resident	
Joan Lawrence	Resident	
Chris Proulx	Resident	
Varya Siegel	Resident	
Robert O'Connor	Resident	
Brendan O'Brien	Resident	
Christina Tonitto	Resident	
Todd Miner	Executive Director	Cornell Outdoor Education
David Means	Resident	
Thomas J. Reimers	Resident	
Mary Weiss-Andersson	Resident	
Cally Arthur	Resident	
Michelle Bamberger	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Amy Bukowski	Resident	
Nancy Almann	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Rob and Amanda Champion	Residents	
David Henderson	Resident	
Barbara DeWall	Resident	
Marilyn Bush	Resident	
Shirley and Bill McAneny	Residents	
Don Oliver	Resident	
Donn Carroll	Resident	
Ellen Z. Harrison	Resident	
John DeVivo	Resident	
Diane Florini	Resident	
Gail Steinhart	Resident	
Deborah Jones	Resident	
Roger A. Hopkins	Resident	
Marilyn Kane	Resident	
Johanna Stebbins	Resident	
John M. Andersson	President	Cayuga Trails Club
Jeff Bateman		

<u>Name</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Kristen Letourneau	Resident Specialist in Recreation for Individuals with Disabilities	Ithaca Youth Bureau
Susan McCutcheon	Resident	
Susan P. Ashdown	Resident	
Dan Fuller	Environmental Engineer 2	N.Y.S. Department of Environmental Conservation
David Ruppert	President	Finger Lakes Cycling Club
Dave and Cheryl Allen	Residents	
Heinz and Anna Riederer	Residents	
Brenda Smith	Resident	
Sandy Wold	Resident	
Herman Sieverding	President	Cayuga Triathlon Club
Michael Ludgate	Resident	
Michael Meador	Resident	
Pam Gueldner	Resident and Business Owner	
Jack Rueckheim	President	Cayuga Nordic Ski Club
Samantha Roberts	Resident	
Merle and Carolyn Stillions	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Bob Riter	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
Carol Whitlow	Resident	
Ken Zeserson	Resident	
Lois Chaplin	Resident	
Linda Westlake	Resident	
Laurel McIntyre	Resident	
Judy Abrams	Resident	
Mark Holochuck	Trail Neighbor	
Ken Walkup	Resident	
Steve Gabriel	Land Use Manager	Cayuga Nature Center
Richard and Maureen Vogt	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
John and Carol Wilson	Resident	
Richard George	Resident	
John and Joyce Wootton	Residents	
John D. Powers	Resident – Trail Neighbor	

<u>Name</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Warren A. Brown	Resident	
Mike Baehre	Trail Neighbor	
Kent Johnson	Resident	
Greg and Tammy Reynolds	Trail Neighbors	
Peter Meskill	Sheriff	Tompkins County
Nancy Cusumano	Resident	
J. L. Mulrooney	Resident	
Andrew M. Frank	Resident	
Ari Kissiloff	Resident	
Barbara Hotchkiss	Resident – Trail Neighbor	
David Kay	Resident	
George R. Frantz	Resident	
A. Martin Petrovic, John Hrubbs, David Filiberto, Rordan Hart, Christopher Thomas	Mayor, Trustee, Trustee, Trustee, Trustee	Village of Trumansburg Board
Mary Michael Shelley	Resident	
Fred Bonn	Director	Ithaca/Tompkins County Convention & Visitors Bureau
Robin Dropkin	Executive Director	Parks & Trails New York
Lisa Nicholas	Planner	City of Ithaca
Jennifer Dotson	Alderwoman, First Ward	City of Ithaca
Maria Coles	Alderwoman, First Ward	City of Ithaca
Steve and Rosanne Lahr	Residents	
Barbara Anger	Resident	
Lesley Greene	Resident	
Jules and Patti Burgevin	Resident	
Marian Mumford	Resident	
Henry Curtin Spencer	Resident	