### Allegany Council House notes – Jennifer Walkowski

### Slide 1: Title Slide

The Allegany Council House is significant for its associations with two major 20th-century events in the cultural and governmental history of the Seneca Nation. The Allegany Council House served as the primary gathering place for regular meetings of the Seneca Council beginning in 1926. Over the next forty years, the Allegany Council House functioned as the governmental center of the Seneca Nation. During this time, the building was the sociopolitical epicenter for two major, nearly simultaneous, Seneca Nation battles: to halt the Kinzua Dam Project and to obtain the right to vote for Seneca women.

### Slide 2: Historic Photo

Between 1936 and 1966, the Allegany Council House served as the primary location where the Seneca Nation discussed, debated and formulated strategies to prevent the United States government from taking ten thousand acres of treaty-protected Seneca lands along the Allegany River. After a lengthy and ultimately unsuccessful legal battle to protect their lands in the midtwentieth century, one-third of the Allegany Reservation land was flooded by the Kinzua Dam beginning in 1966. As a result, the Seneca people suffered the taking, loss, and destruction of ancestral hunting, fishing and gathering areas, farms, homes, churches, schools, the ceremonial longhouse and burial grounds, and the forced relocation of over 600 people. While creating deep emotional and psychological wounds that last to this day, the resistance to the Kinzua Dam that occurred at the Allegany Council House ultimately strengthened Seneca determination to protect their sovereignty, helped to create a new generation of activists who have been instrumental in creating numerous education and economic opportunities for the Nation, and advanced the suffrage movement of Seneca women.

The first record of Seneca women seeking the right to vote in Nation elections occurred at the Council House in 1935. Although the first attempt was unsuccessful, during the Kinzua Dam controversy Seneca women staffed committees, testified before the United States Congress, and helped organize the removal. It was the women's participation and strong leadership role in the fight against the dam that finally influenced the male-dominated leadership to grant women the right to vote and hold office in the Seneca Nation, and, in 1964, in this building, Seneca woman were given the right to vote. The Allegany Council House is one of the few surviving public buildings from this era remaining on the Seneca Reservation, and it was the political and social nucleus of activity for these historic events, both of which continue to impact the Seneca Nation today.

For its role as a central meeting place for the Seneca Nation during this pivotal era in their governmental and cultural history, the Allegany Council House meets the requirements for Criterion A in the areas of Politics/Government and Ethnic Heritage (Native American). While the building was initially constructed around 1925/26 to serve as the new primary administrative center for the Nation, its significance begins in 1935, with the earliest recorded vote taken to give Seneca women the right to vote, and ends in 1966, when the Kinzua Dam was completed and the governmental functions were transferred out of the building to the new Haley Building nearby. The era from 1935-1966 encompasses the period during which the building is most strongly associated for the events for which it is significant.

### Slide 3: Historic Map

Historically, the ancestral homeland of the Seneca people was located in the area between the Genesee River and Canandaigua Lake in New York State. The Seneca are one of the six tribes united under the Six Nations of the Haudenosaunee, also known as the Iroquois, a historically powerful northeast Native American confederacy. Formed around 1450, the Six Nations of the Iroquois each maintained their own cultural practices and traditions while living in separate areas of the state. While the Seneca Nation lived in this region for several centuries, interest in the area grew among European missionaries, traders and soldiers beginning in the 1700s. Rising tensions between the Seneca and the encroaching white settlers occurred during the late 1780s and early 1790s.

### Slide 4: Treaty

Also known as the Treaty of Canandaigua, the Pickering Treaty of 1794 was the result of this attempt to find peace between the Six Nations and the United States Government. Signed on November 11, 1794, the Pickering Treaty contains the signatures of 50 sachems and chiefs representing the Grand Council of the Six Nations of the Iroquois Confederacy and of several U.S. government officials, including President George Washington, whose signature was signed on a piece of paper stitched to the bottom which "ratified" the treaty. The document outlined terms for the future rights to maintain and purchase property henceforth.

## **Slide 5: State Map of Reservations**

Despite the conditions of the Pickering Treaty, land issues continued to arise between the United States government and the Six Nations throughout the 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> centuries. In 1797, for instance, the Treaty of Big Tree was signed, creating the Allegany Reservation and several other reservations in New York State. By the provisions of this treaty, the Seneca relinquished

their rights to nearly all their traditional homeland in New York State, except for twelve small tracts of land, for \$100,000, to New York State.

# Slide 6: Allegany Reservation

Historically, the land composing the Allegany Reservation was essential to the physical, cultural and social well-being of the Seneca. In many ways, life on the Allegany Reservation was intricately tied to the land. Families settled along the river, where they planted their crops, hunted animals, fished on the river and collected fruits and herbs. Access to the river and its fertile soil was essential for the Seneca, who depended on these natural resources for physical subsistence. This land served as far more than simply a source of food and supplies, however, and also played an important role in the spiritual traditions of the Seneca. The Allegheny River and its surrounding valley provided the primary source of medicinal plants for the Seneca, who relied on the area's natural resources for continuity within their spiritual system. Culturally, this strong, multifaceted relationship to the land and the river also created settlement patterns that impacted social relations. In the 19th century, families tended to settle along the river rather than in clustered towns, each using the land surrounding their home for their own agricultural subsistence. This created social relationships that afforded families a degree of independence from one another, all bonded by their mutual use of and respect for the land on which they resided.

## Slide 7: Kinzua Maps

The United States Federal and State Governments expressed interest in constructing a dam on the Allegheny River early in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. The project, led by the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, was first considered as a method of flood control on the river in 1928. Flood control was a major concern during the 1920s and 1930s, when several storms in western Pennsylvania caused record flooding and significant damage to the Pittsburgh metropolitan area.

In 1936, the Kinzua Dam was proposed as part of the Flood Control Acts, which was authorized by Congress in 1938. These preliminary plans called for seizing several thousand acres of Seneca territory along the river in order to construct and operate the dam to regulate flooding. The dam was to be located near the town of Warren, Pennsylvania, but it would affect the Allegany River upstream to a great degree, particularly the area of the Allegany Reservation. Considerable opposition from the Seneca Nation arose at this time. Shortly after the project was proposed, however, it was tabled, as the government focused its attention on foreign policy during World War II.

In 1956, the project re-emerged as a vitally important construction agenda for the federal government, when record floods on the Allegheny and Ohio Rivers greatly revived public interest in building Kinzua Dam. Support for the project came from many downstream residents in New York and Pennsylvania, but primarily from businessmen, entrepreneurs and industrialists around Pittsburgh.

Once interest in constructing the Kinzua Dam was revived after World War II, a series of swift legislative actions on behalf of the U.S. Government systematically suppressed the Seneca Nation opposition to the project on multiple occasions. For each action that the Seneca Nation took to protest, reverse or compromise the Kinzua Dam project, the U. S. Government dealt another blow to the community at both the state and federal levels. On January 11, 1957, the U.S. District Court of the Western District of NY upheld the government's right to condemn land of the Seneca Nation for the proposed project. Ten days later, the U.S. Court of Appeals denied a petition from the Seneca for a stay of the order of condemnation and possession of their land.

### Slide 8: Morgan Plan

Under pressure from the Seneca Nation and its legal representatives, the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers agreed to have an independent engineering firm develop an alternative plan for providing flood control on the Allegheny River without disrupting Seneca land. With assistance from the Quakers, the Seneca hired Arthur E. Morgan to lead the study to find an alternative site for the dam. Morgan, the planner and chairman of the Tennessee Valley Authority, had worked on the Norris Dam and several others as part of the TVA system in the 1930s. Morgan identified an alternative proposal that routes the Allegheny River into a large glacial depression with three times the capacity and at a reduced cost to the Army Core proposal; however it would impact and relocate some non-Native American citizens. The Army Corps of Engineers rejected the Morgan Plan with little explanation.

# **Slide 9: Meetings**

During this time, the Allegany Council House became the hub of political activity for the Seneca Nation, where they met regularly in order to enact diverse strategies to fight the construction of the Kinzua Dam. The Seneca continued to take legal action against the Kinzua Dam, seeking recourse in courts at the state and federal level. The earliest record of a Kinzua Dam-related meeting that took place at the Allegany Council House was listed in meeting minutes as October 17, 1959, although it is likely that conversations about the project began even earlier.

At the October 1959 meeting at the Council House, a special session of the council voted to retain Arthur K. Lazarus Jr. as their general counsel and attorney, "for the Kinzua Dam litigation, negotiations, or settlements." The Pickering Treaty of 1794 was vital to their case, wherein they argued that the seizure of Seneca lands to construct the Kinzua Dam was in direct violation of the conditions of the treaty. Signed by George Washington himself, the Pickering Treaty served as the crux of the legal battle between the Seneca Nation and the U.S. Government. Advocating on behalf of the Seneca, Lazarus and the legal team attempted to uphold the conditions of the document, which stated in 1794, "The United States will never claim the same land, nor disturb the Seneca nation, nor any of the Six Nations, in the free use and enjoyment thereof: but it shall remain theirs, until they choose to sell the same to the people of the United States, who have the right to purchase." The legal team referenced the Pickering Treaty at the crux of the case, arguing that the U.S. Government had broken the conditions of this historic peace treaty.

In response to this prolonged battle, however, "every court from the Federal District Court to the U.S. Supreme Court denied their petitions," as one historian phrased it. In 1959, opposition from the Seneca Nation caused the U.S. Congress to freeze appropriated money to be used for the Kinzua Dam in order to await pending court action. This victory was only temporary; however, as the Supreme Court refused the Seneca Nation motion later that same year. This Supreme Court action removed the last legal obstacle for the U.S. Government to construct the dam.

### Slide 10: Tourists

Despite efforts to stop it, construction of the Kinzua Dam officially began on October 22, 1960. Newspapers reported thousands in attendance at the groundbreaking ceremony, and the event soon drew national media attention. Articles in the New York Times, New Yorker and Evening Post covered the legal battle in detail, while opinion pieces advocating for the Seneca began to appear in a variety of general circulation magazines as well as popular culture. Music icon Johnny Cash, for instance, included a song devoted to the subject on his album Bitter Tears. In this song, "As Long as the Grass Shall Grow," Cash described the situation with regret and it is suggestive of the swell in contemporary popular support for the Seneca that came from outside the community and region.

## Slide 11: Seneca protest

Even as construction on the Kinzua Dam was underway, the Seneca Nation continued to gather at the Allegany Council House to further mobilize in an attempt to terminate the project. In

1961 they sent a request to the White House to halt construction on the Kinzua Dam, which President John F. Kennedy personally denied while citing the immediate need for flood control. In 1962, the Seneca government increased its meeting schedule from twice a year to once a month, indicating the sense of urgency and determination they identified in response to the Kinzua Dam. In the Allegheny River basin, official council meetings were almost always held at the Allegany Council House, which was increasingly occupied by activists, officials and concerned citizens in the days leading up to and during the construction of the Kinzua Dam. Acknowledging that the project may not be halted and that relocation may be inevitable, focus shifted to planning for relocation. A committee, known as the Kinzua Planning Committee, regularly met at the Allegany Council House in order to organize for the potential relocation of their entire community upon completion of the Kinzua Dam.

In 1964, recognizing that the federal government was not going to halt the project despite a multitude of legal actions, the Seneca shifted their activist efforts to securing compensation for the loss of their land in some form. While no monetary value could possibly compare with the emotional, social and historical impact of the seizure of this land, the Seneca sought compensation in order to ease the physical relocation of the community to a new area, new buildings and new land.

The federal government took nearly 10,000 acres of Seneca land, approximately one-third of the entire reservation, forcing the relocation of approximately 650 residents. In an attempt to assist the Seneca with relocation, the government set aside 305 acres of land for their relocation, split between two towns along the Allegheny River, Steamburg and Jimersontown. While they received some financial compensation from the government to assist with relocation, the move was sudden, difficult and somewhat disorganized. As one scholar revealed, "Many Senecas had only two months from the time they received the money to the time they had to move." In a process entirely foreign to the Seneca way of life, families chose the lots for their new homes through a lottery on the reservation. The Seneca were also forced to adapt to new settlement patterns, being resettled in new suburban-style developments, condensing a community that had previously coexisted on 10 thousand acres into 305 acres, and weakening the traditional relationships between families and land use.

### Slide 12: Ruins/Aftermath

Shortly after the relocation, the majority of the buildings and structures in the old reservation were destroyed. Much of the acreage in the 'take area' was the most important land to the Seneca, including a number of ancestral homes, farms, and communities at Red House and Cold Spring. Several sacred sites were also destroyed on the former reservation, causing great disruption to the spiritual community as well. The demolition of the Cold Spring Longhouse,

once the ceremonial center of Seneca traditional life, was particularly traumatic to the spiritual life of the Seneca. Additionally, over 3,000 graves, including that of the Seneca religious leader Handsome Lake, were removed from their original locations during and after the construction of the Kinzua Dam.

One Seneca elder, Sally Crow, discussed the impact of the move with an interviewer over twenty years later in 1988:

When it became true and they were going to move us, I told them I wasn't going to move-that I was going to stay right there. They said that my property would be flooded. I said, I'm staying right here! Well, after we moved here [to the relocation site], it didn't feel like home. Even now, it feels like I'm just visiting. They burned our old house down and I think that land has been under water only once. When my husband used to get home from work, we'd go back to the old place and sit there until late at night. We used to have about ten acres, now we have three acres-more or less. It's been sixteen years since we were moved here. We had no choice but to move. They said it was progress.

### Slide 13: Women's Suffrage

In addition to its pivotal role in the Seneca resistance to the Kinzua Dam, the Allegany Council House also played an important part in the Seneca Nation women's suffrage movement. While Seneca women did not gain the right to vote until the mid-twentieth century, the history of the Seneca women's pursuit of suffrage traces back to the nineteenth century. Throughout the early 1800s, the Seneca Nation was mostly a matrilineal society, but this pattern was substantially changed in 1848, when the creation of the Seneca Nation of Indians at the Allegany and Cattaraugus Reservation had the effect of disenfranchising women in the community for the next century. However, during the Kinzua Dam meetings and conversations, Seneca women took a more active, vocal role in community leadership, bringing their plight for suffrage to the forefront.

According to one historian, the first record of Seneca women seeking the right to vote in Nation elections occurred at the Regular Session of Council on December 4, 1935, at the Allegany Council House in Jimersontown. The issue officially resurfaced in 1955, when a motion was made to entertain the petition made by women of the Seneca Nation who sought to vote and hold office, and again in June 1956, when the minutes indicate that the council called on the chairperson of the Women's Suffrage Organization that had formed. The motion was defeated by 30 votes on May 11, 1959, then again for a third time in 1962, losing by just two votes in Cattaraugus and 10 votes at the Allegany Council House.

In March 1964, Seneca female activist Martha Falammang presented a petition containing 162 signatures requesting the right to vote to council. In doing so, she pledged "to wage an all-out campaign" to win the vote, telling council, "I have been turned down before, but turning me down is like picking me up." On May 23, 1964, the men of council finally granted Seneca women the right to vote, approving the amendment by 169 to 99 at the Allegany Council House. About six months later in November 1964, Seneca women voted in their first general election at the Council House. Enabled to vote but not yet to hold political office, Seneca women continued to petition for this right until 1966, when they won by a narrow margin.

### Slide 14: Kinzua march

The repercussions of the Kinzua Dam era continue to be felt throughout Seneca society today, and the project has fundamentally changed the familial, spiritual, and governmental relationships in the community. Two decades after the Kinzua Dam was completed, the Seneca Nation initiated a ceremonial event intended to commemorate the immense impact of the relocation that occurred in the 1960s. Starting in 1984, the event, known as Remember the Removal day, was organized by the Kinzua Dam Issues Committee and the Remember the Removal subcommittee of the council.

### Slide 15: Summary

From 1935 to 1966, the Allegany Council House served as the primary gathering place for government officials and the broader Seneca Nation community during two fundamental events in tribal history. At the Council House, the Seneca Nation organized resistance to the construction of the Kinzua Dam in several ways from 1936-1966, ranging from legal actions to social activism. Although the nation was ultimately unable to prevent the United States government from building the Kinzua Dam, the controversial event mobilized the Senecas in their efforts to resist the taking of their land. Furthermore, Seneca women played an important leadership role at the Allegany Council House beginning in 1935, when they first petitioned the council for the right to vote. Women's efforts during the fight to prevent the Kinzua Dam were particularly influential, and ultimately convincing enough to finally grant them the right to vote in the Seneca Nation. Both the construction of the Kinzua Dam and the attainment of Seneca Women's suffrage greatly impacted the future governmental, social, and cultural patterns of daily life in the Seneca Nation henceforth. As the primary location where both of these historic events and governmental meetings occurred, the Allegany Council House is a rare surviving touchstone to this important era of Seneca Nation history.

I want to end this presentation by showing a short clip from the 1994 Seneca-produced documentary "Lands of our Ancestors." Narrated by George D. Heron, president of the Seneca

Nation during the Kinzua Dam era, it draws heavily from historic footage during the era, and tells a bit of this story in the Seneca's words.

### Coeymans Landing Historic District Notes- John Bonafide

Being constrained for time today I will keep this very brief as I know you have already read at least portions of the nomination.

As a local historian, I have been working for nearly 30 years to bring this district to you.

The district is being nominated under:

Criteria: A, B, C & D

Criteria Exceptions: A (Religious Property) & D (Cemetery)

Period of Significance: 8500 BCE to 1967 CE, Significant Dates: 1673, 1700 - 1967 (Architecture)

Nominated in the areas of:

- Architecture
- Archaeology (Pre and post contact)
- Commerce
- Community Planning and Development
- Ethnic Heritage (Black & European)
- Exploration & Settlement
- Industry

217 Contributing Resources:

183 Primary Contributing Buildings,

8 Non-Contributing Homes (for Age)

8 Individual properties already listed in the S/N Registers

1 Mushroom Shaped Pool....

Co-Sponsorship of the Nomination:

- Coeymans Neighborhood Association
- Coeymans-Ravenna Historical Society
- Coeymans Landing Heritage Society

It is a point of both personal and professional pride to bring this district to your attention and for your consideration today.

The Coeymans Landing Historic District is a densely developed hamlet located at the southeast corner of Albany County, New York. The post-contact history and development of the district begins in the third-quarter of the seventeenth century and continues in an unbroken arc until the mid-twentieth century. First settled by Barent Petersen Coeymans in 1673, less than 50 years after the establishment of Fort Orange (Albany) and Fort Amsterdam (New York), the Landing is one of New York's oldest continuously occupied settlements. The history of the Landing is linked with New York's late seventeenth century phase of Dutch settlement and the state's eighteenth century water-powered industrial development. The district's historical significance continues throughout the nineteenth century driven by the economic and commercial power of the Hudson River and the Erie Canal. Finally, the Landing reaches its industrial and commercial peak as a center for the Hudson Valley's brick making and ice harvesting industries. Additionally, Coeymans Landing retains more than 250 years of architectural heritage beginning with the ca.1700 Coeymans Manor House and continuing up to the 1960s with excellent local examples of Mid-Century modernism.

### Delaware Avenue Baptist Church - Buffalo, Erie County Grant Candidate notes – Jennifer Walkowski

### **Slide 1: Intro exterior**

Delaware Avenue Baptist Church is a good locally-significant example of the Romanesque Revival style, located in Buffalo, Erie County, New York. Designed by prominent architect John H. Coxhead and constructed between 1894 and 1895, the church was built along one of the city's most fashionable and prominent late nineteenth century thoroughfares. As a good representative example of the Romanesque Revival style, the building is significant under criterion C in the area of Architecture.

The congregation was established in 1882 as an outgrowth of the Olivet Mission, and initially worshipped in a brick church constructed at 595 Delaware Avenue. As early as the 1850s when the street was extended northward from downtown, Delaware Avenue was home to some of Buffalo's wealthiest and most prominent residents. This trend continued into the 1880s while the area became increasing subdivided and developed, aided by the development and expansion of Buffalo's streetcar system which ran up Delaware Avenue in 1889 and was electrified beginning in 1892. The congregation in the Delaware Avenue neighborhood grew over the subsequent decade, and in 1894 construction of a new and more substantial church building began. Architect (and parishioner) John H. Coxhead, designed the new facility, orienting its most prominent features to face onto Delaware Avenue. In 1932, in celebration of the church's 50th anniversary, funds were raised to undertake some remodeling and renovations to the building, including the addition of a small kitchen and some updates to primarily the education spaces.

### Slide 2: Exterior

Because of its location on a relatively narrow urban lot, with neighboring buildings adjacent on both sides, the primary architectural articulation occurs on the front (west) elevation, with the seemingly impenetrable rock-faced Medina sandstone, prominent corner towers, round headed arches, and round Rose window typical features of the Romanesque Revival style. Secondary elevations, less visible from the primary street, were rendered in red brick with sandstone accents, providing a cost-effective and practical solution.

# Slide 3: Floor Plan

This physical distinction also marks an internal functional division within the building, as the Medina sandstone portion to the west contains the primary worship space, while the brick area to the east contained the educational and meeting areas of the building.

### Slide 4, 5: Interior, auditorium

The building also merits consideration under criterion C in the area of Art, primarily for its highly intact interior decoration in the main sanctuary space. Unlike many other urban churches which underwent subsequent redecorating campaigns, the historic interior stenciling and mosaic work is highly intact, and is an excellent example of the decoration of church interiors from the late-Victorian era. The work of New York City-based design firm J. & R. Lamb Company, the vast dome of the worship space is decorated with multicolored geometric bands and medallion-like ornament, accented with a ring of angels, accented with shimmering gold touches, crowned with a large center oculus stained glass window with a geometric design. The space also features intricate mosaic tilework, which covers the rostrum, and seems to spill over the curved edge and onto the floor. The tilework, with its colorful patterns and bands and flourishes, accents the ornate back wall of the chancel area, which opens into a spectacular Baptistery, with a sunken pool ringed by shell-topped exedra.

## Slide 6: Baptistery

# **Slide 7: Sunday School Space**

The educational area was designed using the Akron Plan, and originally had a large two-story space between the second and third floors that accommodated 450 people with an upper gallery with the typical small radiating rooms that could be separated by moveable partitions. In 1932, as the Akron style Sunday School programs were declining in popularity, a floor was inserted, creating two distinct spaces.

This is Delaware Avenue Baptist Church, are there any questions?

# Newberry Building - Batavia, Genesee County Tax Credit Project/approved Part 1

# **Slide 1: Exterior**

The Newberry Building, located at 109-111 Main Street in Batavia, Genesee County, New York, is a locally significant example of a late nineteenth century commercial building that reflects the shifting commercial landscape in Batavia, from small, independent, locally

owned businesses to larger chain businesses. For more than a century, the building served as a primary anchor for Batavia's commercial Main Street, housing local companies from 1881 to 1929 and a branch of a national business from 1929 to 1996. For its associations with the commercial development of Batavia, the Newberry Building is eligible under Criterion A in the area of Commerce.

Constructed by local craftsman George J. King in 1881 for the C.H. Turner & Son Company, a prominent local furniture making and undertaking firm, the building contributed to the early commercial development of Main Street. The C.H. Turner & Son Company rented one storefront while occupying the other and using the upper floors for its furniture business. After the C.H. Turner & Son Company sold its business in 1887, two other undertakers used the building until 1929. The J.J. Newberry Company, a national five-and-dime chain retailer, bought the building in 1929 and remained there until 1996.

### **Slide 2: Historic images**

The building is additionally locally significant under Criterion C in Architecture for illustrating the changing commercial design trends from the late-nineteenth through midtwentieth centuries. The building was completed in 1881 and designed as an Italianate two-part commercial block, a common commercial form on Main Street in Batavia and on commercial streets throughout the country.

## **Slide 3: Interior**

After the J.J. Newberry Company purchased the building it was renovated twice during the early and mid-twentieth century as part of broad drives by the company to update branch locations across the country. Through these two redesign campaigns in 1929 and 1948-49, the J.J. Newberry Company opened up the first floor into a larger single commercial space, created commercial offices on the upper floors, and installed a plate glass storefront system which flooded the interior with more light. These modifications reflected chain store tactics of store renovation and, along with other storefront renovations in the area, helped transform the character of Batavia's Main Street according to the aesthetics of twentieth-century consumer culture.

We do have an approved Part 1 on this project, as well as an enthusiastic letter of support from Jason Molino, City Manager of the City of Batavia, and Larry D. Barnes, the Batavia City Historian. This is the Newberry Building, are there any questions?

# Linde Air Products Factory – Buffalo, Erie Co. Tax Credit Project

### **Slide 1: Intro/Exterior**

The Linde Air Products Factory is a locally significant oxygen extraction plant located on Chandler Street in the Black Rock neighborhood of Buffalo. Opened in 1907 by the German-based Linde Air Products Company, this facility in Buffalo was the first oxygen extraction facility in America and was later dubbed "the birthplace of the oxygen industry in the United States." The laboratory in the Chandler Street Plant served as the primary research facility for the company from 1923 until 1942. On site, the company produced pressurized oxygen for acetylene torches used in industrial welding and developed new methods of transporting liquid oxygen. In addition, scientists involved in the Manhattan Project used laboratories in the Linde Air Products Factory between 1942 and 1946.

### Slide 2: Plan - donut, evolved over time

The Linde Air Products Factory was built in phases from 1907 to 1959, with a majority of the building constructed by the Linde Air Products Company between 1907 and 1948. From the street it appears as separate buildings, however the factory is actually a C-shaped building in plan that is nearly fully enclosed, forming a center work yard. The footprint of the red brick factory is approximately 300 feet wide by 275 feet deep in size.

### **Slide 3: Exterior views**

The Linde Air Products Factory is locally significant under criterion A in the area of Industry for its associations with the nationally prominent Linde Air Products Company. The Linde Air Products Company was the nation's first provider of purified oxygen, which, when used with acetylene, powered welding torches that were critical to efficiently cut and join steel. In 1927, scientists at the Linde Air Products Factory on Chandler Street developed the Driox system, which provided unprecedented efficiency in liquid oxygen production, storage, and distribution. While the Linde Air Products Company opened other Buffalo area facilities and factories in New Jersey, Pennsylvania, and Illinois, the Linde Air Products Factory on Chandler Street was the first oxygen extraction plant in the United States and it remained an important research facility for decades.

The period of significance for the Linde Air Products Factory stretches between 1907 and 1948, beginning with the initial construction of the building and ending with the last year that the Linde Air Products Company utilized the factory. This span also includes the most expansive building phases of the facility.

### **Slide 4: Interior workyard**

### **Slide 5: Interior**

I will note that we have an approved Part 1 on this building, and currently the building is being redeveloped for use by a technology company, a beer bottling facility, and a winery. This is the Linde Air Products Factory, are there any questions?

# First Baptist Church of Springville Boundary Expansion Grant candidate

### **Slide 1: Overview**

The First Baptist Church of Springville was listed on the National Register in 2008 under criterion C in the area of Architecture and under criterion A in the area of Social History. The period of significance was defined beginning with the initial construction of the church around 1869 and closing in 1914 with the last major phase of alteration and updates made to the church. At the time of listing, the historically associated parsonage and its garage were accidently omitted from the nomination because they had been sold and their connection to the church was not understood.

### Slide 2: Parcel

This amendment to the church nomination expands the boundary to include these two associated properties. The parsonage enhances the significance of the church building by representing the full history of the parish and fits within the general development era and period of significance defined in the original nomination. It complements the significance of the church, as it supported its functions and activities. The garage, although noncontributing due to age, has been association with the parsonage since its construction.

# Slide 3: Historic Photos

According to church records, the land at the southeast corner of North Buffalo Street and Franklin Streets was purchased by the congregation in 1868. At the time, it contained an existing house. Shortly after, the church was constructed in 1869, and the house was used as a parsonage. In 1886 due to the rising maintenance costs on the older building, church records indicate that discussions were underway to build a new parsonage for the church. It was completed in 1887 at a cost of \$1400. A new spacious porch was added to the building in 1914, corresponding to other work going on at the church.

### Slide 4: Views

The building was used by the First Baptist Church continually from the 1880s until 2003. At this time, the parsonage and garage were split off as a separate parcel and sold for private residential use. Presently, Springville Center for the Arts, owner of the church and the sponsor of the original nomination in 2008, is in the process of acquiring the parsonage from the homeowner, and seeks to utilize the building to support its operations.

We have letter of support from the Mayor of Springville as well as the Historic Preservation Commission for this project. This is the First Baptist Church of Springville Boundary Expansion, are there any questions?

# Sagamore Apartment House, (Syracuse, Onondaga County) notes Emilie Goul

[3 Slides]

- Syracuse = CLG
- Letter of support Syracuse Landmark Preservation Board
- Nomination developed by Dean Biancavilla, Holmes King Kallquist,& Associates, LLP,
- Housing Visions (client) plans its redevelopment as a shelter + housing for homeless women

<u>Criterion A (Social History)</u>: Represents **growth of an urban middle class in early twentieth-century Syracuse** and the **development of new housing types to accommodate its needs**. At the time, the neighborhood was considered wealthy,

with many expensive single-family mansions; in the 1920s, it was just beginning to accept apartment buildings.

Apartment built on spec in **1926** by **Detroit Construction Co.** and sold – fully rented – the same year to Levi Manheim. Builder constructed Roosevelt Apts and the New Jefferson-Clinton Hotel in Syracuse. **Pattern of spec building similar to that of the Huntley Apartments** (NR listed, 2011), which started the apartment boom.

At the end of its period of significance, the **building illustrates changes in demographics** and the **decline of this housing type with the movement of the middle class to suburbia after World War II**.

<u>Criterion C (Architecture)</u>: Building further significant for its architecture as an **example of a popular building type in the 1920s** and in association with the post-World War I wave of apartment building in Syracuse.

The apartments were advertised at the time as **two, three, and four room apartments** for **bachelors, single people, and married couples without children**. The 1911-Feb 1951 Sanborn map shows a large attached one-story garage at the rear (no longer extant). Even though West Onondaga street had an active trolley line, the garage was particularly featured in advertising the Sagamore, so that residents could protect their automobiles, which were symbols of their social mobility.

# [OVER]

The Sagamore has **features that highlight its target upper-middle-class residential market**, including an elaborate and decorative entry; terrazzo, marble and ceramic mosaic tile in the lobby; ceramic mosaic tile trim in the hallways and stairwell entries; and apartment thresholds of marble.

Business directories demonstrate that the first residents were upper middle-class in terms of incomes, occupations, and business ownership.

# First Lewis County Clerk's Office, (Martinsburg, Lewis County) [2 Slides]

- Letter of support from Lewis County Historical Society
- Nomination developed by Bette Lathan of the Martinsburg His Soc
- Information on the Fire Dept from 99-year old Ed Ingersoll!

Locally significant under <u>Criterion A: Government</u> for its association with the siting of the original county seat in Lewis County. Contention between the hamlet of Martinsburg and the village of Lowville over the appropriate location of county government began in 1805, when Lewis County first separated from Oneida County. The selection of Martinsburg and erection of the first courthouse in 1812 (now Martinsburg Town Hall; NR listed, 2001) were engineered by local landowner Walter Martin to improve the value of his property. Construction of the county clerk's office in 1847 was one move (of many) by which Martinsburg retained its hold on the county courthouse. The rivalry continued until – and after – the county seat was moved to Lowville almost twenty years later. [Slide note: 1857 Map of Lewis County]

### **CHANGE SLIDE**

Also locally significant under <u>Criterion A: Social History</u> for its role in the <u>economic</u> and <u>civic life of the hamlet after the community lost the county seat in 1864</u>.

Subsequently a <u>law office</u>, <u>store</u>, <u>and harness repair shop</u> [<u>Slide = D.L. Rima Store</u>] until, in the 1920s, it was acquired by the <u>Town of Martinsburg</u> for its <u>water</u> <u>commission + fire department</u>. At that time, it was modified to hold a fire truck!

When the town built a new fire hall in 1964 that could accommodate larger trucks, the "brick building" was left **vacant for twenty years**. In 1983, the **Martinsburg Historical Society** leased the Lewis County Clerk's Office from the town and conducted a five-year restoration of the building. It now owns the building which has become a local museum and a focus of local pride.

Locally significant under <u>Criterion C: Architecture</u>. The First Lewis County Clerk's Office replaced rented space in (then) <u>Brigadier General Walter Martin's Land</u>

**Office** (built 1822) and shares a close resemblance to that earlier building. Both were "fire-proof" brick for document storage; both face gable end towards State Route 26. However, the earlier building has Federal trim and the Clerk's Office has **Greek Revival trim**.

# Lady Tree Lodge (Upper Saranac Lake, Franklin County) [4 Slides]

- Nomination developed by owner Chris Cohan of Rye, NY
- Interesting new Adirondack Camp type Hotel Cottage (not identified in the existing Multiple Property nomination)

Locally significant under <u>Criterion A: Social History and Recreation</u>. Built in 1896 as the Lone Star or Belo Cottage and historically associated with the Saranac Inn, one of the premier hotels of the early twentieth century under the direction of **Harrington Mills**.

Served as the summer home of two prominent individuals: Texas newspaperman Colonel Alfred H. Belo (1839-1901) and New York Governor Charles Evans Hughes (1862-1948).

- **Colonel Belo** built the cottage in 1896; died in 1901. Set journalistic standards for approach | accuracy that were widely accepted into the mainstream press in the early 20<sup>th</sup> C. Quote by Adolph Ochs (NY Times)
- Governor Hughes summered in the Rustic Cabin in the summers of 1908-09. Hughes joined the Supreme Court (1910-1916) after serving two terms in New York State, ran for the Presidency (1916) against President Woodrow Wilson, became U.S. Secretary of State (1921-1925) for President Harding, returned to private practice (also on the Permanent Court of Arbitration and Judge of the Permanent Court of International Justice) for five years, and was appointed by President Hoover as the 11th chief justice of the Supreme Court (1930-1941).

In the 1930s Lady Tree Lodge was bought by Frederick E. Altemus, Mills' son-in-law and a later manager of the Saranac Inn. It has remained in private hands to present as an important recreational property.

<u>Criterion C: Architecture</u>: Rich blend of Adirondack elements mixed with contemporary (late 19<sup>th</sup> C) residential style

- Its interior and four-square floor plan, with attached service wing at the rear,
   reflects its first owners' expectations for domestic comfort

  [OVER]
- Its **exterior** styling clearly reflects the influence of William West Durant's 1877 Swiss chalet at Camp Pine Knot.

The rustic log screen, in the front gable of the building, is highly decorative and may link the building with **William L. Coulter**, Saranac Lake architect and designer of other buildings with similar screens on the National Register (Moss Ledge, 1898; Knollwood, 1899-1900; Eagle Island, 1902; Prospect Point, 1902; and others).

**BUT** – no record and Coulter only arrived in Saranac Lake that spring for treatment of his TB

**Two possible links**: That first year, Coulter continued his employment with Renwick, Aspinwall, and Renwick of NYC and supervised construction of the Trudeau Institute's new Admin Building. Coulter's mentor = J. Lawrence Aspinwall = Dr. Trudeau's cousin.

The exact circumstances of its construction in 1895-96 are not really known – built by the Saranac Inn for Belo; pencil marks on lumber connect construction with Saranac Inn manager Daniel L. Riddle (also in SL due to TB and Dr. Trudeau's treasurer). He may be a 2<sup>nd</sup> link between Coulter and the cottage. It is known that the inn built other cottages that year but none that have the exterior styling of Lady Tree Lodge.

Overall, Lady Tree Lodge's history and design stamp it as an unusual type of Gilded Age recreational property in its own right. And its association with one of the

premier destinations in the Adirondacks – the Upper Saranac Lake and Saranac Inn – marks it as significant in understanding the history of recreation in northern NY State.

# Stillwater Mountain Fire Observation Station (vicinity of Stillwater Reservoir, Herkimer Co.) [4 Slides]

- Project initiated by the Friends of the Stillwater Mt. Fire Tower
- Added to and meets the requirements of the Multiple Property
   Listing: Fire Observation Stations of the New York State Forest

   Preserve
- Letters of Support from DEC, Lyme Timber Company, Peg Masters (Town of Webb Historian)
- → RESTORATION: This is the only public fire tower on private land in the multiple property listing excellent example of a public private non-profit collaboration. NY State closed the Stillwater Mountain Fire Observation Station in 1988. In 2016, with the support of Lyme Adirondack Timberlands (the landowner) and the NYS Department of Environmental Conservation (NYS DEC), the Friends of Stillwater Fire Tower restored the tower and reopened it for public access.
  - Help from Stephen Engelhart, Adirondack Architectural Heritage
  - My favorite site visit a hike up 2264-foot Stillwater Mt to climb the tower!

Significant **at the local level** under <u>Criterion A: Exploration</u> for the use of the summit by **Verplanck Colvin** in his 1882 survey of the Adirondack Mountains and **at the state level** under <u>Criterion A: Conservation</u> and <u>Recreation</u> and <u>Criterion C:</u> <u>Architecture</u> for the establishment of the existing fire observation station as an

integral part of New York State's early  $20^{\text{th}}$  C efforts to protect and improve its forests.

[Map | Plan of Summit] → show the components of the nomination <u>associated</u> with the Period of Significance: 1882 (use of summit by Verplanck Colvin as a signal station for his survey of the Adirondacks) through 1967

# [OVER]

- Four eye bolts and a drilled hole remain in the granite bedrock from the 1882 Adirondack Survey
- Steel fire tower built in 1919 and in service NYS DEC until 1988
- Observer's cabin (w privy and woodshed) built in 1966; continues to house DEC personnel
- Trail from summit to observer's cabin follows historic (not current) route

**Verplanck Colvin** built a wood tower on the summit in 1882 to use as a **Primary Triangulation Station** during his Survey of the Adirondacks; the mountain established a **major baseline** in his survey. **Tower was topped by a reflector** – S.H. Snell's 1882 surveyor's notebook from Conservation Department Archive shows the spinning device.

Three decades later, after the **disastrous forest fires of 1903 and 1908**, a **second wood observation tower** was built on the summit by local people to serve visitors at local hotels.

In **1912**, tower was absorbed into the new state-run fire observation system and rebuilt to a greater height. **First fire tower built atop older observation tower.** 

**Aermoter Co.**'s **56-foot tower** erected in **1919** to provide more coverage and better shelter for the observer. **Stenciling** shows the rail route used to ship the tower – Chicago to Woods Lake Station; Woods Lake shortline to Twitchell Creek; hauled by horse to the summit.

Over time, the fire observation station = equally important as a **recreational destination for hikers and campers**, who were **educated by its observers about fire prevention**. The current **observation table** is a reproduction of the original that was still in the cabin two years ago; it includes a copy of the original **panoramic map** used for triangulating fires.

First **observer's cabin** built in the 1930s; current cabin (Model 1941) built in 1966. Historic **trail** ran between the cabin and the tower; slightly rerouted last year to a new parking area.

# NYS Board for Historic Preservation Meeting 15 June 2017 PIRC—Auditorium

# **Text for V. Bartos presentations**

### Morgan Dunne House, Syracuse, Onondaga County

Slide 1: Located in Syracuse, the Morgan Dunne House is significant under Criterion C as an example of the work of prolific local architect Ward Wellington Ward (1875-1932) pictured here over his elevation drawing for the house. It also meets the registration requirements for one or two family residences outlined in the National Register Multiple Property Document *Architecture of Ward Wellington Ward in Syracuse, New York, 1908-1932* (NPS approved 1996). The owner of the building is the sponsor and the SHPO received a letter of support from the Syracuse Landmark Preservation Board (Syracuse is a CLG). The building is also a commercial tax credit project and received its part 1 HPCA approval in February of 2017. Part of the project includes removing the aluminum siding and restoring the exterior, guided by Ward's original drawings.

Slide 2: The interior is highly intact, retaining much of the historic fabric and many of the historic architectural features including a fireplace decorated with Mercer Moravian Pottery tiles. The period of significance covers the construction of the house: 1911 to 1914. The house was built for Morgan A. Dunne and his wife Helen, who were active in the Cathedral of the Immaculate Conception in Syracuse and with several business and musical groups outside of the parish. Dunne was also treasurer and a trustee of the Roman Catholic diocese. The nomination document describes the building in detail and how the neighborhood was part of a prime residential area known as University Hill. Houses built in the area were largely for upper middle class patrons, some being architect designed, with the Dunne House now being added to the MPDF.

**Questions? Comments?** 

## West High School, Auburn, Cayuga County

Slide 1: The city of Auburn is also a CLG and supports this nomination for the West High School. It's being nominated under Criterion A for fostering the role of vocational education in the Auburn Public Schools and for participating in the federal VEND program during WWII to train adult war industry workers. The property is also being nominated for architecture (Criterion C) as an intact example of a late Depression era Art Deco school built in 1938 and designed by local architect Wallace Beardsley. The period of significance for West High School

is 1938-1945. Built with economy in mind, the exterior decorative features were limited to the prominent elevations and clock tower. Of particular interest is the mural over the east elevation depicting labor, education and "moral guidance" as stated in the document.\* The bas reliefs are all depictions of various educational disciplines. All these are detailed in the nomination document.

Slide 2: The building was a middle school from 1970 to 2011 and these images from 2015 show that other than drop ceilings, the interior is much as it was when it opened. It retains the original floors, doors, wall surfaces (tile) and the interiors of both the auditorium and gymnasium. The floor by the main entrance door still features the original tile mosaic map of Cayuga County. Plans are to convert the space into housing using commercial tax credits and the project received conditional part 2 approval in November 2016. Our technical unit continues to work with the consultants on this project.

**Questions? Comments?** 

\*I personally interpret this portion of the panel as history and tradition, since it shows a churn, a woman cooking over an open fire and what appears to be an agricultural field.

# St. Matthew's Episcopal Church, Horseheads, Chemung County

**Slide 1:** Significant under Criterion C and Criterion Consideration A for its architecture, the St. Matthew's Episcopal Church property contains two buildings built nearly a century apart and

serving as excellent examples of modest period style designs well-suited to the church. This also nicely bookends the period of significance from 1866 to 1965. The 1866 Gothic Revival style church was determined as meeting registration requirements for masonry Gothic Revival churches in the multiple property document *Historic Churches of the Episcopal Diocese of Central New York* (1996), basically stated as retaining the form, basic construction material and period features. The building's appearance is much as it was from 1890 after the steeple was removed due to structural issues. The other building on the property is a 1965 parish house, of concrete construction and faced with brick to complement the church. Being located at the edge of large residential area, the building follows the familiar form of a raised ranch.

Slide 2: The sanctuary was redecorated more than once, with the latest being the new carpeting in the 1980s. The chancel is the focus of the interior, being set into an arch. The historic image of the chancel was taken around 1895. Of particular interest are the ceiling beams and brackets, chestnut wainscoting and Gothic arched windows and doors. The lower right image is one of the extant nineteenth century windows in the sacristy. As stated in the document, the current stained glass windows in the sanctuary date from the 1970s.

**Slide 3:** By the 1960s, the church needed additional space for its growing youth program, acquired the adjacent north property and began a capital campaign to build a parish house. The design for the building was a collaborative effort between the 1960s congregation and the

builder. I say 1960s congregation because the original 1860s congregation also collaborated with the builders on the design for the Gothic Revival church. When the parish house opened, it had sufficient room for classrooms, offices and a large multipurpose room in the north end now known as Judson Hall. This building is largely intact with the only major change being a new wood floor in the upper story and Judson Hall (formerly tile).

Questions? Comments?

### Warren-Benham House, Bristol Springs Vicinity, Ontario County

Slide One: Noted in the order of presentation as the House at 5680 Seneca Point Road, the Warren-Benham House was built around 1924 for Frank Warren and remodeled ca. 1960 after Walter Benham bought the property in 1957, making the period of significance ca. 1924 to ca. 1960. The house is significant under Criterion A in the area of recreation for being part of the Seneca Point's transition from the summer hotel and steamboat excursion trade to the development of seasonal private estates and vacation homes. The house is also significant for its architecture under Criterion C as a design by Boston based architect James Stearns Lee, who had ties to the area, along with his own summer home at Seneca Point. Lee designed a house to be used as staff housing for Frank Warren's estate across the road. The lower right shows the house as it appeared in 1928; going from left to right is the barn, next a two bay garage and chauffeur's quarters with finally a cottage on the east end, connected to the rest with a breezeway. The image in the upper left is a current image of the house with changes made by Walter Benham around 1960, which included enclosing the breezeway and converting the

garage into living space, replacing the garage doors with windows appropriate to the Tudor Revival. The image in the upper right shows the house as you would see it from Seneca Point Road.

Slide Two: Along with Benham enclosing the breezeway, he added a dormer window to provide light for a bathroom and another larger dormer to provide natural lighting to the interior of the enclosed space. He left the barn at the north end unchanged and in the east end or main cottage; he opened the first floor and added a half bath. Added dormer windows were done to match those on the rest of the house as were any new windows, in keeping with the Tudor Revival/Arts and Crafts design of the house. The image in the lower right shows the building's close proximity to the hillside.

Slide Three: When he converted the garage into a "common room," Benham added a fireplace constructed of brick from a demolished local schoolhouse. The fireplace required a chimney addition that he matched to the rest of the house with a stucco exterior and a sloping roofline. Benham used additional brick from the schoolhouse to resurface the floor of the common room.

**Slide Four**: Here we see a bedroom and the dining area in the east cottage—those would be the left and upper right images. The lower right is a room over the former garage (chauffer's quarters) that shows some of the built-in features, believed to be added by Benham.

Mentioned in the nomination was the discovery of original sheetrock from the 1920s found by the current owners during repairs to the building. The building was vacant for several years before being purchased by the current owners who are in the process of repairing/restoring the building. They plan to use the homeowner tax credit for additional repairs to the main house and the commercial tax credit for the barn, which they would like to turn into rental property.

**Questions? Comments?** 

# <u>Congregation Ohab Zedek notes – Jennifer Betsworth</u>

118-120 West 95<sup>th</sup> Street, New York

[Overview] Congregation Ohab Zedek, completed in 1927, is historically significant under Criterion A in the areas of ethnic and social history as an early twentieth century synagogue on Manhattan's Upper West Side. The traditionally Hungarian and strictly Orthodox congregation had been founded on the Lower East Side in 1872 and had previously built a synagogue in Harlem during the early twentieth century.

[Façade] Designed by architect Charles B. Meyers, Ohab Zedek is additionally significant under Criterion C for its design which combines Moorish-inspired ornament with Judaic motifs. This style of Moorish ornament became popular for use in synagogues during the 19<sup>th</sup> century as a more Eastern and culturally appropriate style for Jewish buildings. The grand entrance, the building's main feature, is set within successive layers of ornately decorated colonettes and is surrounded by cast stone adorned with Arabesque designs and Judaic symbols. The façade, which curves to match the entrance, also features narrow, slit-like windows reminiscent of an ancient Moorish fortress.

[Lobby] The combination of Moorish and Judaic ornament continues into the foyer...

[Sanctuary] ... as well as the synagogue. In contrast with the more severe façade the brightly lit ornamental sanctuary features large stained glass windows, a rose window above the ark, and a stained glass cupola.

[Sanctuaryx2] During the early twentieth century, Ohab Zedek had become well-known for its cantors. Josef Rosenblatt, who served at Ohab Zedek from 1912 to 1926, became known as one of the finest cantors in the world. He went on concert tours, sang at Carnegie Hall, and contributed to an increase in attendance at the synagogue. Although he was no longer the congregation's official cantor, Rosenblatt sang at the dedication of the new building.

### [Sanctuary windows]

[School] The adjoining school and community center was planned at the same time as the synagogue, but its construction was delayed until 1939. Instead of building a new building, the congregation hired architect Herman H. Sohn to repurpose two former rowhouses and unite them under a modest Moderne façade. The building housed the Beth Hillel institute through the 1950s, and currently serves as space for the congregation's offices, kitchen, and educational programming.

### Nomination by Tony Robbins, Letter of Support from NYC LPC

### Swan River Schoolhouse

31 Roe Avenue, East Patchogue, Suffolk County

#### Columbia student draft

[Façade] The Swan River Schoolhouse, built in 1858, is significant under Criterion C in the area of architecture as an intact example of transitional Greek Revival and Italianate design as applied to the schoolhouse building type. The building has the rectangular form, gable roof, banks of windows, and open interior plan typical of the one-room schoolhouse type. Instead of avoiding decoration to save on costs, as was common, the district or local families instead opted to dress the building stylishly.

[Elevations] The waning Greek Revival style, which may have been chosen for its allusion to democracy or grander institutional buildings, is expressed on the two entranceways framed by pilasters supporting wooden entablatures, cornice band, and cornice returns. These simple features contrast somewhat with the building's ornate Italianate

bracketing along the roofline and above the entranceways. These relatively inexpensive details allowed the local builder to offer a fashionable upgrade on the more conservative design.

[Interior] The schoolhouse is additionally significant under Criterion A in the area of education as the first schoolhouse built to serve the hamlet of East Patchogue. The Town of Brookhaven established the school district in 1857 to better serve the growing agricultural and mill community. Norton Robinson, a member of the family who owned the sawmill on Swan Creek, purchased a small lot and donated it to the district for the school.

[Interior] The building continued to serve as a one-room schoolhouse until it was closed and students were sent to newer schools in 1936. The desks are original to the school; they were purchased from the Chicago-based A.H. Andrews Company and installed in late 1870s. After years of serving as a bus shelter, the school was sold to the Town of Brookhaven in 1962 and became a small museum. Since the 1980s, the Greater Patchogue Historical Society has operated the museum and maintained the building.

Letters of Support from Greater Patchogue Chamber of Commerce, Patchogue-Medford School District Superintendent, Focus East Patchogue (local civic association)

Second & Ostrander Historic District

Riverhead, Suffolk County

[District map] A few years in the making – the companion district to the Riverhead Main Street Historic District listed in 2012. The Second & Ostrander Historic District is significant under Criterion A in the areas of community development and planning and social history.

[Historic map] The neighborhood was downtown Riverhead's primary residential neighborhood for much of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and supported the nearby commercial district that grew up along Main Street during the same time period.

1858 Chace map of Suffolk County shows both areas – boundary of the district just east of Abner, roughly along east side of First & then jogs up, back down along East street, and over.

[Houses] The history of the district offers a clear picture of how the primary market town and seat of the predominantly agricultural county developed, functioned, and prospered. And, as the residents of the area included merchants and lawyers as well as craftsman and laborers, the buildings in the district provide a visual and historical window into the social history of the town between the mid-19<sup>th</sup> and mid-20<sup>th</sup> centuries.

[Streetscape] The district is additionally significant under Criterion C for its collection of resources which encompass the broad range of architectural styles popular during the period.

[Houses] The earliest buildings demonstrate Greek Revival, Gothic Revival, and vernacular features. Fine examples of Italianate, Queen Anne, Shingle, Colonial Revival, Tudor, and Bungalow residences as well as simple vernacular buildings followed. As the residential area grew essentially one building at a time, the styles and periods of development are intermixed in the streetscape.

[Modest houses x2] The district is also notable for its combination of high style buildings, vernacular adaptations of popular styles, and simple vernacular homes in a relatively small and dense residential area. The neighborhood's grandest homes are located closest to Main Street; modest homes generally in the areas furthest from it and nearest or north of the railroad tracks.

[Ostrander Avenue] Ostrander Avenue was laid out on the east side of the neighborhood in the early twentieth century, and the last major addition to the district.

[Institutional] Finally, a handful of institutional buildings from the late 20s/early 30s. Post Office (already listed, 1935), Firehouse (1931), Odd Fellows Lodge/Town Hall (1928). Firehouse planned to be a tax credit project. Whole district in an eligible census tract & good reception from residents.

### Charles & Anna Bates House

126 Center Street, Greenport, Suffolk County

[Historic] A little further east to Greenport! This house is just west of the village historic district, and it was looking a bit rough when it came in...

[Before] New owner interested in using tax credits. Worked with Zach Studenroth to uncover history of house. Approved Part 1, and tax credit project is complete or nearly so.

[Façade] The Charles & Anna Bates House is significant under Criterion C for its distinctive architectural design and construction technology reflecting both the Greek Revival and Italianate styles and under Criterion A for its association with the development of Greenport as a resort community. The house, which was constructed speculatively soon after the completion of the Long Island Railroad to Greenport in 1844, retains a Greek Revival door and surround and interior details. Charles Bates, a grocer, and his wife, Anna, moved to Greenport and purchased the house in 1853; by 1873, they had transformed the modest home into a small boardinghouse.

[Side] The Bates enlarged the house to provide additional rooms, modernized its interior spaces by removing its center chimney and replacing it with parlor doors to create a larger social area, and updated its exterior architectural detailing to make it more attractive to travelers from urban areas.

[Detail] While only one of Greenport's historic inns survives, now moved to Orient, the community historically had several hotels along the waterfront. Whether they were heading to Boston or New York, Greenport provided a natural stop for travelers. Boardinghouses like this one provided an affordable and cozier option for travelers and summer tourists alike. While repurposing a home as a boardinghouse is not it itself unusual, research suggests that the Bates were among the few in Greenport to take the trouble and expense to update their home to do so.

[Interior x3] As a grocer, Charles was well-positioned to offer a good table at the boardinghouse; Anna, with the help of her children, appears to have managed much of the operations and continued to run the boardinghouse well after Charles' death.

### 390 Ocean Avenue

390 Ocean Avenue, Massapequa, Nassau County

#### **Columbia Student draft**

[NATCO ad] The house at 390 Ocean Avenue is locally significant under Criterion C as an example of residential single-family home construction employing National Fire Proofing Company (NATCO) tile and is representative of the greater fire-proof movement impacting American buildings at the turn of the twentieth century. Hollow clay tiles were invented during the 1850s as a fireproof alternative to traditional masonry, and became particularly popular during the early twentieth century.

[NATCO ads] Established in 1889, the National Fire Proofing Company grew to prominence through the development of a fireproof hollow tile construction system for skyscrapers. The tiles' consistent size and shape helped save construction time and labor and were as durable and fire retardant as stone but less expensive to produce. However, the heights masonry skyscrapers could grow to were limited by safety and code regulations. Facing competition by steel companies, NATCO began to focus on the residential market during the early decades of the twentieth century. NATCO's residential design competitions and direct advertisements to builders appealed to Allen and George Haight, two brothers in Brooklyn.

[Massapequa map + houses] The house is additionally locally significant under Criterion A in the area of community planning and development for its association with Allen and George Haight's development of NATCO homes in Massapequa. A quiet, rural area with a small resort center, Massapequa remained largely undeveloped into the early twentieth century. Anticipating increased resort and residential development, the Haight Brothers purchased a 3,000-acre parcel in Massapequa in 1905. They laid out roads, installed utilities, and, from 1910-1913, began building a residential development entirely made of homes constructed from NATCO tile. While they planned to build 40 NATCO tile homes, only a dozen were completed before their development was halted by legal and financial challenges. Effectively, the insurance company held a mortgage on the entire property regardless of any later subdivisions, and the entire property was foreclosed on.

When this homeowner reached out to us, we originally considered a district (too spotty), then an MPDF. Columbia student took on nomination as a project; if future demonstrated interest from other owners, will pursue MPDF.

[Façade] Although their development project ultimately failed, the neighborhood is scattered with impressive NATCO homes and reflects the Haights' vision for innovative, attractive seasonal and year-round housing in Massapequa; the speculatively-built house at 390 Ocean Avenue was the last they built, and quite literally represents the final days of that vision.

[Rear/side]

[Stair/Mantel]

George Sumner Kellogg House

960 Merrick Road, Baldwin, Nassau Co

[Overview] Ending on a hopeful story. 3<sup>rd</sup> party DOE request in 2013. Sign: "Under Construction: New Nassau County Police Department First Precinct." Nassau County supportive of the nomination, and working with the community to settle on a positive future for the building.

[Façade / Historic] Designed and constructed from 1899 to 1900, the George Sumner Kellogg house is locally significant under Criterion C as a good and the last remaining intact example of a Queen Anne Style residence in Baldwin. Civil War veteran George Sumner Kellogg purchased the lot on Merrick Road and commissioned architect Walter I. Halliday to build the house during the earliest months of Baldwin's first residential building boom. Encouraged and inspired by the creation of Nassau County a few months prior, Kellogg was among many private individuals and developers seeking to buy land and build houses, particularly in communities closest to the border of Queens County.

[Stair/Entry] The Kellogg House was among the earliest commissions for Walter I. Halliday, a 22-year-old architect from Jamaica, Queens. Halliday worked prolifically for middle-class clients designing homes in Queen Anne and revival style in Queens and Nassau Counties, and quickly became locally prominent. Halliday's design for the Kellogg House reflects the

exuberance of the Queen Anne style through its use of an asymmetrical plan, irregular roofline, a variety of materials and textures, and expansive porch. He also carried the style into the design of the interior, where it is particularly evident in the grand foyer and staircase...

[Dining Rm / Kitchen] .... And through the use of stained glass, decorative woodwork, and plaster moldings. House used as a residence and later an antique store during the twentieth century – interior remarkably intact.

[Upstairs]

[Bathroom / Carriage House] While it was among a number of grand, new houses built on Baldwin's primary roads during the early twentieth century, the rapid pace of development in Baldwin only increased. Grander homes from this early period of Baldwin's development have long since been lost for new subdivisions, and the more modest examples that survive are substantially altered. The Kellogg House is rare survivor in Baldwin, and hopefully has a brighter future ahead.

**Letter of Support from Assemblyman Brian Curran** 

<u>William Krattinger agenda items/significance overviews</u>

New York State Board for Historic Preservation 15 June 2017

### **Gumaer Cemetery, Town of Deerpark, Orange County**

The Gumaer Cemetery is a resource of considerable importance to the early history of the Town of Deerpark, Orange County, and to the larger environs of the Hudson Valley. It is situated within the boundary of the historic 1,200-acre Peenpack Patent, the settlement of which represented an early milestone in the history of present-day Deerpark, which was formed as a township towards the end of the eighteenth century. This patent dates to October 1697, at which time seven patentees were granted land from the English Crown in the Magheckemeck, or Neversink River, Valley. Peter Guimard, Jacob Caudebec, Thomas Swartwout, Antoni Swartwout, Bernardus Swartwout, Jan Tyse and David Jamison were the original patentees. The Guimard, Caudebec and Swartwout families figured prominently in local affairs from an early date forward and are inextricably linked to the Colonial history of this region. The Peenpack area is considered among the oldest continuously inhabited European settlement areas in Orange County and is among those areas of the Hudson Valley first settled by non-indigenous peoples prior to 1700. The cemetery is perhaps the oldest burial ground used by European settlers within the bounds of present-day Orange County and it is the sole surviving resource that documents the very earliest settlement of the Peenpack Patent. Among its remaining decipherable grave markers are those which bear the dates of 1713/1719 and 1720, the latter marking the final resting place of Benjamin Provost, its simple inscription rendered in the French language. However, given that the first settlers had arrived in the Peenpack Patent as early as the later 1690s, it is assumed that earlier unmarked burials are also located there, along with the interments of many of the earliest patentees, among them the pioneer, Peter Guimard. Although it had been in active use since the turn of the eighteenth century as a burial yard, it was not until 1838 that a meeting of subscribers was organized by Peter E. Gumaer which resulted in the formal creation of the Gumaer Cemetery. Gumaer, along with his wife, Esther Cuddeback Gumaer, deeded the acreage of the cemetery to the Reformed Dutch Church of Deerpark in 1840. The nominated resource also includes the adjacent slave burial area,

which contains six marked graves in addition to those which are unmarked—as is the case with the main burial area the precise number of interments is not presently known—and it documents the association between enslaved labor and the successful economy established in the Hudson Valley's Dutch settlement areas from the seventeenth century until slavery was outlawed in New York in the early nineteenth century. The Gumaer Cemetery consists of approximately two and one-half acres of associated land inclusive of the slave cemetery and the Godeffroy family plot. Marked graves include those identified with early and relatively crudely crafted stones in addition to those of later date which have more fully developed and finished markers. The Gumaer Cemetery is being nominated in association with NRHP Criterion A, in the area of Exploration/Settlement, as a compelling touchstone to the earliest history and settlement of the Peenpack Patent; it is additionally being nominated in the area of Ethnic History, given the presence of the slave burials, which recall the lives of the enslaved individuals who worked alongside the early settlers from the early eighteenth century into the first decades of the nineteenth century. It remains a historic resource that speaks evocatively to the earliest European settlement of the Minisink country and the Town of Deerpark.

### **Crandell Theatre, Village of Chatham, Columbia County**

Built in 1926 and expanded the following year, the Crandell Theatre remains an architecturally and historically significant resource located in the Village of Chatham, Columbia County, New York. Erected through the efforts of Chatham native Walter S. Crandell and designed by the Glens Falls-based architect Louis L. Wetmore, the nominated theatre speaks to a number of local, regional and national themes and in large measure survives as built, notwithstanding changes made to further its continued use a movie theatre to the present day. The theatre was originally erected as a venue for both live vaudeville performances and the screening of photoplays, which were in large measure filmed theatrical productions; however, by 1929, the Crandell Theatre had been retrofitted with new equipment in order to screen motion pictures with sound, or "talkies," the first of which—The Broadway Melody— was shown that year in Chatham and other upstate New York locales. As such, the building's early history spans a significant transformative moment in American culture and entertainment, from the earlier period of vaudeville performances and photoplays into the modern motion picture age. Its construction can be viewed as part of a period of improvement in Chatham, as during the early part of the twentieth century the village increasingly shed its provincial roots as new architecture and infrastructure was introduced, including the Morris Memorial Building (1910) and Tracy Memorial Village Hall (1913), both important works of civic architecture erected through the munificence of prominent families. The construction of the Crandell Theatre, although not a work of civic architecture, was nevertheless part of this new era of improvement in Chatham and, like the other two, was backed by a prominent local family, the Crandells. Its completion was widely celebrated by Chatham residents, who viewed it as further evidence of local progress and development. The building is being nominated in association with NRHP Criterion A, in the area of Entertainment/Recreation, given its association with important cultural themes both locally and nationally and specifically those relating to the transitional period between live vaudeville entertainment and photoplays to the age of the motion picture with sound. It is also being nominated in association with Criterion C, in the area of Architecture, as a largely intact example of 1920s-era theatre design which exhibits traits linking it to the so-called "atmospheric theatre" type. It is being nominated at the local significance level.

### Oak Hill Historic District, Town of Durham, Greene County

The Oak Hill Historic District is an architecturally and historically significant resource located in the Town of Durham, Greene County, New York. Set amidst the rolling topography of northern Greene County, traversed by the course of the Catskill Creek and framed to the south by the prominent landforms of the northern Catskill Mountains, which rise impressively in the distance, this rural hamlet has survived to present times with much of its nineteenth and early twentieth century building stock substantially intact. The buildings, structures and associated features contained therein collectively chronicle the development of Oak Hill as it evolved from a Revolutionary War-era frontier settlement in the rugged foothills north of the Catskill Mountains and west of the Hudson River into a thriving hamlet

which came to sustain its own manufacturing and commercial interests, hotels, and religious organizations by the midnineteenth century. Although this historic manufacturing infrastructure, located alongside the Catskill and Squirmer Valley creeks within and on the outskirts of the hamlet, has long since fallen away, resources associated with its domestic, commercial, and religious life remain to portray Oak Hill's historic growth. A majority of the resources included within the boundary date to the second and third quarters of the nineteenth century and attest to a period of relative prosperity and physical expansion which corresponded with the architectural popularity of the Greek Revival style, a national design mode which is well represented by the hamlet's domestic, commercial and religious building stock. Although examples of architecture from the pre-1830 period are also present in Oak Hill—the earliest extant identified house likely dates to ca. 1790—the Greek Revival style remains the prevailing architectural idiom found there. Expressions of the Romantic-Picturesque styles also exist, the Italianate mode being fairly well represented; also of considerable note in this particular context is the so-called Icicle House, an antebellum period dwelling which exhibits distinctive features of the Romantic-Picturesque mode. It would appear that much of the nominated building stock had been erected by the end of the third quarter of the nineteenth century, notwithstanding additions and modest upgrades such as new porches made to existing houses. Wood frame construction predominates and there is only one example of brick construction in the hamlet, albeit a prominent one, the ca. 1830 Tripp House. The last quarter of the nineteenth century is nevertheless represented by two important and conspicuous works of architecture in the hamlet, those being the former Lyman Tremain Opera House and the Tripp Store, both of which portray the architectural exuberance of the Late Victorian era, the architecture of which formed a marked contrast to the more sedate architecture of earlier periods. There are additionally a small number of resources which portray early twentieth century architectural trends, among them houses of the Craftsman and Cape types. In addition to its considerable architectural interest, Oak Hill is also historically significant as a rural hamlet the development of which was tied directly to the harnessing of water power from the Catskill Creek and the growth of which was made possible by overland transportation routes which connected its manufacturing and agricultural interests with the Hudson River to the east, namely the Schoharie and Susquehanna turnpikes. A number of important early industries were conducted there, among them iron foundries, which provided an impetus for growth and which helped sustain the hamlet's economic fortunes during the nineteenth century. While these industries have long since fallen away, the hamlet which grew up around them remains to chronicle this chapter of Durham and Greene County history. The Oak Hill Historic District is being nominated in association with NRHP Criterion A, in the areas of Exploration/Settlement and Commerce, and is additionally being nominated under Criterion C, in the area of Architecture. It is being nominated at the local significance level.