### NYS BOARD FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION December 7, 2017

#### Remarks by Daniel Mackay on behalf of Commissioner Rose Harvey

- Members of the public and board, welcome to the 170<sup>th</sup> meeting of the NYS Board for Historic Preservation
- Commissioner Rose Harvey had a scheduling conflict this morning and is unable to attend. She will be joining the review board for the tour of the NYS Museum Suffrage Centennial Exhibit later this afternoon, as well as for our awards program at 2:30.
- Members of the public, you are welcome to stay on for these events as well
- Brief update on the work of the agency and Division for Historic Preservation regarding our work to advance historic preservation in New York State:

#### **National Register:**

- 88 National Register nominations will have been submitted to the National Park Service, matching volume in recent years. NYS is the national leader in number of National Register nominations with over 6000 listings representing over 120,000 structures and sites.
- In 2017, 88 nominations were approved from 37 counties and 56 municipalities, representing:
  - o 19 historic districts
  - o 69 individual listings
  - Totaling 1576 structures (including at least 11 religious properties) as well as 7 cemeteries, 1 park, 1 bridge, and 1 archeological site.
- 78% of the nominations are in distressed census tracts qualified to use the NYS rehabilitation tax credit programs.

#### Compliance:

- Over 8800 project reviews completed to date under state and federal preservation statutes; consistently meeting project review timelines and other streamlining requirements. Significant MOUs and Programmatic Agreements include 13 Letters of Resolution for Section 14.09 actions and 17 Memoranda of Agreement for Federal Section 106 undertakings.
- We also were a signatory to 4 Programmatic Agreements (federal), which included the Knolls and Kesselring Facilities (Department of Energy) and a state level agreement with SED for NYS School construction and Library Grants.

#### **Tax Credit Programs:**

- Retain #1 national ranking in 2016 for Federal Historic Tax Credit program use, with \$831 million in tax credit-funded historic property investment. On pace to match this total in 2017
- 296 tax credit projects under review; estimated \$5.6 billion in planned historic property investment.

#### **State Historic Sites:**

Opened new exhibits at Senate House, Schuyler Mansion and Schoharie Crossing State Historic Sites

Convened a regional meeting of groups focused on Dutch Heritage in New York, attracting over 80 organizations and scholars to discuss greater collaboration between public and private sites interpreting this era of NYS history.

#### **Vital Brooklyn Initiative:**

 Working with Governor's regional staff to expand the number of historic homes in Brooklyn that could access the NYS Historic Homeownership Tax Credit program and coordinating outreach and marketing of this program with local community organizations and sustainable energy advocates.

#### **Peebles Island:**

• Solar installation nearing completion and will be operative in 2017.

Thank you to members of the public in attendance today. We appreciate your effort to join us and contribute to the deliberations of this board and acknowledge the time, distance, and effort you make in support of the evaluation of historic property nominations.

#### Michael Lynch:

The year in review at the Bureau of Historic Sites and Parks:

If you have been to any one of our 35+ state historic sites, you have only seen the tip of the iceberg. • This is all the "back of house" stuff we do at Peebles Island to support the sites system. Today I want to look back on 2017 and show you some highlights • We add to collections through donation • ... and through purchase. We have a small fund from the deaccessioning of objects, generally with no provenance or in poor condition • We loan collections OUT to others and BORROW for our own exhibits We assist with restoration work at the various sites o Schulyer Mansion originally had wall paper called the Ruins of Rome. But in the 1917 restoration State Ed installed a different scenic paper, in itself an historic material o To replicate the Ruins of Rome we photographed two surviving examples at the Metropolitan Museum and the Lee Mansion in Marblehead. These images were manipulated on the computer, color matched and then printed on special paper in our own large-scale printer. o The new paper was hung over the existing to retain it in place and the central hallway transformed o Reproducing the paper in traditional block printing was in the 50k range. By using modern technology we saved 10s of \$1000s The people of the State of New York own a vast collection of 100s of thousands of objects, and we are charged with caring for it all. And using them to educate the public. The conservation labs at Peebles are where the magic happens, o Objects selected for exhibition are evaluated. The first rule is "do no harm" Don't do something that can't be undone later o Repairs have to be reversible o Then the repair is in-painted to mask it for exhibit o Before & After The second rule is minimize the damage done by previous treatments • Here the well-intentioned use of adhesive tape on a Dutch document has been undone to prevent further damage Research is an important part of developing interpretation and exhibits-sometimes with unexpected results • We had 79 Dutch documents translated to see what they said, and discovered this client list by a local cabinet maker. This document will inform further research, and an exhibit on kas at the nearby Huguenot Houses in New Paltz • Sometimes materials are just too far gone to be conserved. But getting from this • ...to this involves more than reupholstering. The fabric has to be custom produced to match color and pattern, and even the correct edging, fringe and tack heads have to be sourced • Some objects are large, requiring as many handlers as a Macy's parade balloon o To carefully remove o And roll up o So it can be put in the van for transport to PI. And then repeat to re-install From the large, we go to the small, • most of which are archeological artifacts. Those going on exhibit need treatment • before being displayed Sometimes the objects in the ground • have to be treated in place And finally, one interesting but different project for us this year • has been producing interpretive signage for the five Hudson River bridges under contract with the Bridge Authority. When you come to Peebles Island in March for the next board meeting I would be glad to show you around-there is always something interesting going on "back of house."

Kath LaFrank for William Krattinger agenda items/significance overviews New York State Board for Historic Preservation 7 December 2017

**DUNIX, Cornwallville, Greene County** 

Dunix, the Catskill Mountain retreat of the Matthews family, whose fortune was derived from pioneering soda fountain apparatus developed by the family's American patriarch, "The Soda Fountain King" John Matthews (1808-1870), is an architecturally significant resource located in the Town of Durham, Greene County. This property, originally a modest farmstead, was purchased and subsequently transformed by the Matthews family into a summer retreat with the construction of new buildings and the reshaping and aggrandizement, over the course of many building campaigns, of the original farmhouse. Documentary photographs indicate that the house as presently constituted evolved over the course of no fewer than four separate building campaigns which came to introduce Queen Anne, Neoclassical and Arts & Crafts features to the original vernacular house. This fanciful and idiosyncratic work of domestic architecture features a number of noteworthy features, but none so compelling as its dining room, which features elaborate Arts & Crafts treatments including the extensive use of quarter-sawn oak paneling and carved work and elaborate hand-painted decoration. This work is attributed to the German-born artist and sculptor, Karl L.H. Muller (ca. 1820-1887), who married into the Matthews family and who also designed John Matthews's well-known grave marker at Green-wood cemetery in Brooklyn, New York. The house, which retains a high level of integrity to the historic period as evidenced by its physical fabric and documentary images, is complemented by a number of additional buildings, among them one which served in part as a recreation building, or casino, for the Matthews family, a freestanding water tower, a highly ornate privy, and other smaller landscape features. Taken collectively these resources offer a detailed look at the manner in which the Matthews family reshaped this rural Catskills farm property from its humble origins as a working farm in a country retreat of seemingly unique and at time whimsical architectural character. The Matthews family's occupancy was initiated with its ownership by the patriarch John Matthews's son, George Matthews (1834-1885), and later yet by his son, John Henry Matthews (1859-1930). The property is being nominated under NRHP Criterion C, in the area of Architecture, for the remarkable collection of buildings which were constructed or otherwise modified by the Matthews's family in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century. It is additionally being nominated in the area of Art, given the elaborate carving and decorative work of the dining room, which was executed by the notable nineteenth century German-born artist, Karl L.H. Muller.

#### Vernooy-Bevier Stone House and Barns, Wawarsing, Ulster County

The Vernooy-Bevier Stone House, located in the Town of Wawarsing, is an architecturally and historically significant example of eighteenth century New World Dutch domestic architecture located in the mid-Hudson Valley in rural Ulster County, New York. Constructed in two distinct phases, the first of which likely occurred near the mid-point of the eighteenth century, the nominated dwelling remains an excellent representation of the stone house and domestic traditions fostered in Ulster County by that region's early Dutch and French Huguenot population. It exhibits distinctive aspects of this traditional Ulster County building type, among them in its roughly laid load-bearing limestone walls, story-and-a-half form, steeply pitched gable roof, limited ornamental elaboration and the expression inside of its heavily scaled ceiling beams which sustain the upper story floor. The house is complemented by a highly intact later nineteenth century barn grouping which includes a main and secondary barn, both of timberframe construction with vertical board-and-batten wood sheathing and slate-clad roofs, in addition to a granary and ice house, among other agriculture-related resources. These date to a later epoch in the property's history and that time when the adjoining lands were farmed by the Hoornbeek family. As for the stone house, the precise circumstances of its early history and

construction remain undefined, though it has long been traditionally associated with both the Vernooy and Bevier families; at the time that Wawarsing was attacked in August 1781, during the American Revolution, it was being resided in by the family of Peter Vernooy (1738-1813). Among those scenarios which have been advanced in association with the house's earliest history, and that which is cited in this NRHP documentation, is that it was built ca. 1751 following the marriage of Jacobus Bevier and Anna Vernooy; a second and seemingly less likely possibility is that the house was built roughly a half-century earlier, ca. 1707, for Abraham Bevier and Rachel Vernooy, a potentially dubious claim given the site's remote location and what would appear a very early date of construction for a stone house in the region. Regardless of the absence of precise documentation relative to the dwelling's age, the Vernoov-Bevier Stone House remains an important expression of this traditional Ulster County dwelling type, and although it lost a small frame out-kitchen and lean-to which are depicted in a 1906 image, it nevertheless survives with many important features intact. It is being nominated in association with NRHP Criterion A, in the area of Exploration/Settlement, given its strong associations with the Bevier and Vernooy families, both important in the early history of Wawarsing, and in association with Criterion C, in the area of Architecture, for both the house and the remarkable collection of barns which surround it.

#### Whitehall Fire Station, Whitehall, Washington County

Completed in 1913 to the designs of Vermont architect S.O. Burdick and moved to its present location in 1932, the Whitehall Fire Station provides a salient connection to the evolution and modernization of organized firefighting in the Village of Whitehall, Washington County, New York. This important regional transportation center, located at the head of navigation on the south end of Lake Champlain, was well acquainted with the dangers of large-scale fires, having suffered the effects of any number of devastating conflagrations in the second half of the nineteenth century. The nominated building's construction was occasioned by the village's purchase of a mechanized, gas-powered Webb fire engine, the procurement of which placed Whitehall on a par with much larger American cities, among them New York City and Boston, which first introduced motorized pumper trucks in 1909 and 1910, respectively. It was on this occasion that the village's fire department was reorganized and plans for the new station advanced. The arrival of the new Webb engine in Whitehall was widely noticed, given the considerable damage that fire had rendered to its commercial and industrial infrastructure on any number of occasions; it was noted at the time that "the people of the town are proud of the new machine." The station provided quarters for the new Webb truck and other firefighting apparatus along with accommodations for the firefighters and was linked to a series of Gamewell fire boxes distributed throughout the village; this unified alarm system, along with the new capabilities offered by the Webb engine, greatly improved firefighting capabilities in Whitehall by improving response time. The building originally occupied a position on Main Street (now Broadway), but was moved to its present location after its site was claimed for the relocation of railroad tracks on the east side of that thoroughfare from their original position in the center of the roadbed. The building has assumed significance in its new location where it has continually served the firefighting needs of the village, which were expanded with the addition of the newer south block ca. 1970; it presently serves as home for Whitehall's Volunteer Fire Company. The building is being nominated in association with Criterion C, in the area of Architecture, as an important local and regional example of fire station design conceived in part for the stationing of motorized firefighting equipment, which was only then coming into its first usage in the

Northeast's largest metropolitan areas. It remains an important legacy of the village's early twentieth century efforts to offer improved fire protection to its residents and businesses.

Kath LaFrank:

EARL HALL

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY, NEW YORK, NEW YORK COUNTY

SPONSOR: NYC LGBT HISTORIC SITES PROJECT

This is the fifth or five nominations we contracted for under our first LGBT underrepresented community grant; we will be doing two more under the second grant, which is just starting and is more focused on survey

Earl Hall has multiple layers of significance. It was built as an assembly hall with a gift from William Earl Dodge Jr, who hoped that the building would be used to further the spiritual life of the student body; it was open to those of all denominations or those with no denomination, and it was used as a meeting place for all sorts of clubs and student organizations, especially those with a social or religious purpose. Completed in 1902, Earl Hall was among the earliest college buildings erected after Columbia acquired the Morningside Heights campus and it was part of Columbia College's expansion from a minor institution into one of the great universities of the world. It is significant first under criterion A in the area of education for its association with the development of Columbia University as a major institution of higher learning in America.

Earl Hall is also significant under criterion C in the area of architecture as an important work by McKim, Mead & White. The building fills a key site in Charles McKim's master plan for Columbia's campus – this is one of the three major institutional buildings at the center of the campus. Low Library is the centerpiece of the plan and is flanked by St. Paul's Chapel on the east and by Earl Hall on the west. Both of these buildings face the library, and all three buildings have monumental domes. Both the library and the chapel are already individually listed [and the campus is NRE]

Earl Hall is a handsome example of the firm's Classical Revival work, and some have pointed out its similarities to the rotunda at UVA, which McKim, Mead and White

were working on in the same period, as inspiration. The period of significance for Earl Hall under Criteria A and C in education and architecture is 1900-02, reflecting its original design, construction, and program on the Columbia University campus.

The building retains a very high level of integrity, both exterior and interior, where it is still characterized by the small offices and meeting rooms it was designed to hold

Earl Hall is also significant under criterion A in social history for its early and significant association with Columbia's LGBT community. Columbia was the first university in the United States to have a gay student group – the Student Homophile League, founded in 1966, after two students had the idea to form a chapter of the Mattachine Society, an early gay rights group, at Columbia. They had the support of university chaplain John Dyson Cannon, and on October 28, 1966, three students had an organizational meeting sponsored by Chaplain Cannon in the Dodge Room on the second floor of Earl Hall. The Earl Hall location was appropriate, as William Dodge had specified that the building be used to help students balance their intellectual, physical, and spiritual life. Given that homosexuality was severely stigmatized in the 1960s and that gays were not just discriminated against but labeled as deviants or sinners, the need for an advocacy group and a place of companionship or refuge for young people away from home was a critical need on university campuses. Despite university resistance, national advocates supported the group, and advocates and students fought hard to overcome the administration's objections. Finally accepted in 1967, the group was given offices and meeting space in Earl Hall. Leaders hoped to initiate discussion and dialogue about homosexuality, invite speakers to campus, integrate homosexuals into the religious life of the community, encourage gay students to accept themselves, and offer counseling services.

Beginning in 1970, the Homophile League's successor organization, Gay People at Columbia-Barnard, which also had offices at Earl Hall, began holding regularly scheduled monthly gay dances in the Earl Hall auditorium. These dances grew into

one of the most important gay social events in New York and eventually attracted large numbers of LGBT people from all over the city. By the 1980s, these dances, the first at an American university, drew well over 1,000 attendees. They were especially popular with younger men and with men who felt uncomfortable in gay bars and clubs.

The period of significance for Earl Hall for its association with LGBT history is 1966c1985. This begins with the first meeting to discuss establishing an organization in 1966 and extends to c1985 to encompass the establishment, growth and significance of the Earl Hall dances. The period between 1970-1985 is exceptionally significant for its association with the gay dances in the era just before the AIDS epidemic forever changed social life for gay men. The dances initially provided young gay people with a space to gather and socialize. However, over the next fifteen years, their importance increased. In 1981, the AIDS virus began its destructive path through the gay community. As the epidemic spread, the year 1985 marked a watershed in the understanding of the severity of the crisis in New York City. It was also the year in which AIDS became a national issue. The death of several celebrities from AIDS, notably Rock Hudson, the opening of Larry Kramer's play, *The Normal Heart*, and other well-publicized events brought the enormity of the crisis to general public awareness. Also in 1985, the drinking age in New York State was raised to twenty-one, and most bars began requiring identification. However, the Earl Hall mixers, which were lax on checking i.d.'s, remained welcoming to younger gay men and lesbians, accepting of everyone no matter how they looked or dressed, and were more low key than events at venues such as bars, clubs, and discos. Thus, they were an important safe social space, and they played a vital role in bridging the gap between the early days of gay rights advocacy at Columbia and the AIDS-related political activism that became evident in the late-1980s.

JW December SRB Meeting Notes – December 7, 2017

Niagara Machine and Tool Works Factory, Buffalo, Erie County

**SLIDE 1: Aerial** 

The Niagara Machine & Tool Works Factory is a good representative example of a large-scale tool and machine factory designed and built during the first half of the twentieth century. The Niagara Machine & Tool Works Factory is significant under Criterion A in the area of Industry as one of the oldest and most important tool and machine manufacturing facilities in Buffalo in the twentieth century; its products were used nationally and internationally across industries. It is also significant for its contribution to the manufacturing of tools and machines for working sheet metal, specializing in presses, punches, and rotary sheets for government defense contracts. The company had orders from the federal government during World War I and World War II, and during World War II the company established itself as an important defense contractor. The company had government orders for regular products in addition to equipment for many of the significant international aircraft manufacturers, which included Curtiss-Wright, Bell, Lockheed, Douglass and 23 different foundries, who used the company's presses to manufacture small parts for aircraft assembly, both during and after World War II. The factory complex is further significant for its association with the industrial development of the East Side of Buffalo along manufacturing nodes of the Belt Line railroad in the early twentieth century.

**SLIDE 2: Map** 

The complex is also significant under Criterion C in the area of Architecture as a good, representative example of evolving industrial architectural and engineering trends, innovations and developments during the twentieth century. The Niagara Machine & Tool Works Factory is a good example of early twentieth century factory design with the original buildings designed by the noted Buffalo architectural firm of Green & Wicks and later buildings and additions designed by local civil engineers H. E. Plumer and Jacob Fruchtbaum. Development of the factory complex occurred between 1910 and 1981, although the last building campaign that can be considered architecturally significant was completed in 1967, which also coincides with the final piece of the factory's post-World War II and Cold War expansion. The nomination boundaries encompass three contributing buildings – the Main Factory, the pattern storage shed, and the Machine Shop, as well as the Belt Line spurs which are still present, and enter the buildings.

#### **SLIDE 3: Exterior**

Like many factories from the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> century, the Main Factory, which housed offices and staff spaces, was designed so that the more architecturally sophisticated administration portion concealed the more functionally designed production spaces. The factory incorporates key advances in factory construction of the period such as the use of increased daylight with its large window openings and sawtooth monitor roofs. It also employed modern fireproof construction materials. Advances in early

twentieth century factory operations for mass production incorporated management science and the assembly line as evidenced in the layout of the plant and its two primary buildings.

#### **SLIDE 4, 5, 6: Interior Views**

Three business partners formed the company in 1872 in downtown Buffalo to manufacture household items such as refrigerators. As they changed ownership and grew, ultimately the company incorporated and named itself the Niagara Machine & Tool Works Factory in 1901. First located downtown, it moved to the edge of the Fruit Belt on Buffalo's East Side in 1894 and ultimately to the Northland Corridor in 1910, where large swaths of land and a node of the Belt Line offered the perfect location for expanding industry. Like many factories, including its neighbors, it evolved over time as both technology and manufacturing capacity were expanded and national war and defense needs increased. As a result, the Main Factory building was expanded with many additions. While some of the additions were carefully planned and executed by architects or engineers, others were added as needed and expansion dictated. It's really a group of buildings designed from the inside out: where interior function dictated the form of the exterior.

We have an "enthusiastic" letter of support for this project from the Buffalo Preservation Board. The consultant on the project, Barbara

Campagna, is here today – Barbara, would you like to say a few words about the project?

This is the Niagara Machine and Tool Works Factory, are there any questions?

Ingleside Home, Buffalo, Erie Co.

**SLIDE 1: Intro** 

Ingleside Home provides a substantial contribution to the history of women, social work, and health care during the twentieth century in Buffalo. Although the organization, established in 1869, had operated in several other locations, including an earlier building on this site, the nominated building, built in 1929, was the first and only building constructed specifically for the institution. The building was constructed at a pivotal moment for the organization, when it shifted its mission from focusing on social reform to providing women's health services and domestic refuge for those in need.

#### **SLIDE 2: History slide**

Initially founded as the 'Ingleside Home for Reclaiming the Erring,' the organization underwent several transformations during its substantial history of operations from its founding in 1869 to its closing in 1976. It began as a place of social reform, providing detoxification and refuge for what it deemed 'erring' women associated with activities deemed socially inacceptable for women, such as prostitution, promiscuity or

alcoholism. In 1923, the organization shortened its name to the less critical "Ingleside Home" to better reflect its new mission and program, which provided medical care, counseling services and domestic refuge for unwed pregnant women and their babies. At this time, the institution required a new building that included both a medical wing and enhanced residential facilities for residents and staff in order to better serve this new mission. The design and construction of the new building represents the organization's dedication to and associations with women's healthcare; One design feature that reflects this was the secondary side entrance off of a circular driveway, which provided a measure of privacy for patients entering the facility. For its associations with Ingleside Home is significant under criterion A in the areas of Health/Medicine and Social History.

#### **SLIDE 3: Exterior**

In 1929, the building at 70 Harvard Place was designed by Frederick C. Backus specifically to provide facilities for the organization's expanded medical services in combination with dormitory accommodations for the female residents and patients at Ingleside Home. The purpose-built space, which replaced an earlier building used by the home on the same site, reflects the intricate relationship between the architecture and the organization it contained.

#### SLIDE 4: Interior

Evidence of the institution's mission can be seen in the physical spaces designed to provide medical care and residential accommodations, most notably in the second floor hospital wing and in the dormitory layout still present on the second and third floors of the building. Ingleside Home is a good representative example of a Colonial Revival style institutional facility, meeting the requirements of criterion C in the area of Architecture. The period of significance begins with the construction of the nominated building in 1929 and ends when the institution closed in 1976.

I do want to note that we have an approved Part 1 on this project. This is Ingleside Home, are there any questions on this?

#### Westminster House Club House, Buffalo, Erie County

#### **SLIDE 1: Intro**

Westminster House Club House is significant as one of the only remaining buildings affiliated with the Settlement House Movement located in Buffalo. As such, the building provides a substantial contribution to the history of social work and institutional architecture during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The organization known as Westminster House was established in other existing houses and buildings at this location beginning in 1894, and the nominated building was built to serve as a club house for social and recreational activities. The club house formed the nucleus of the

organization's programmatic activities, where most of the classes and events occurred. Housing for residents was primarily located in three other preexisting wood framed buildings adjacent to Monroe Street on Adams Street that have now all been demolished. The club house building was thus one of four institutional buildings that composed the Westminster House organization; however, it was the only building commissioned by the organization. The period of significance begins with the construction of the present building in 1909 and ends when both the institution and the surrounding community it served experienced substantial changes in 1962. After 1962, Westminster House underwent a significant change in leadership when it merged with the umbrella organization of United Way.

#### **SLIDE 2: Historic photos**

The building, designed by an unknown architect around 1909, served as the club house for the Westminster House organization. Established by the Westminster Presbyterian Church congregation, located in Buffalo's wealthy Delaware Avenue Historic District, Westminster House operated as a settlement house on Buffalo's East Side, an area dominated by immigrant communities. Associated with the international Settlement House Movement, Westminster House conducted extensive community outreach within the surrounding neighborhood, as well as offering educational and recreational programming at the club house on Monroe Street. The institution aimed to integrate the surrounding German immigrant community of the

neighborhood with the house's middle-class social workers by providing residential opportunities for full-time workers at Westminster House, as well as encouraging nearby residents to visit the facility through a combination of outreach, classes, and special events. Westminster House was one of the first organizations associated with the Settlement House Movement established in Buffalo, and the building is perhaps the only settlement house of this kind remaining extant in the city today. The building is a good representative example of this type of social work facility and the values it embodied, meeting the requirements of Criterion A in the area of Social History.

#### SLIDE 3, 4: Exterior and Interior

The club house building was one of four institutional buildings that composed the Westminster House organization; however, it was the only building commissioned by the organization. The nominated building was designed specifically to provide facilities for the organization's expanded programs, classes, and recreational opportunities. The purpose-built spaces reflect the relationship between the architecture and the organization it contained. Evidence of the institution's mission can be seen in the numerous large rooms designed to provide shared spaces for workers and neighborhood residents to gather together. A large gymnasium, kindergarten classroom, dance hall, and library were some of the most distinctive spaces within the building, exemplifying Westminster House's programmatic initiative to provide both educational and recreational

outreach to community members. The Westminster House Club House retains a high level of integrity and is a good representative example of an early Craftsman style institutional facility, meeting the requirements of Criterion C in the area of Architecture.

I will note that we have an approved Part 1 on this building. This is the Westminster House Club House, are there any questions?

#### West End Historic District, Springville, Erie County

#### **SLIDE 1: Intro**

The West End Historic District is significant under criterion A in the area of Community Planning and Development for its association with the growth and development of the Village of Springville and under criterion C in the area of Architecture as an intact enclave of residential and religious architecture spanning roughly a century of development.

#### SLIDE 2: Map

The district encompasses the residential neighborhood that grew up west of Springville's village center during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Once an area outside of the main settlement of Springville, the neighborhood began developing in the mid-nineteenth century, reaching its fullest growth around the turn of the twentieth century.

The middle to upper-middle income family setting and feel of the West End Historic District ensemble is distinctively different from Springville's East Hill Historic District, NR listed in 2015, located east of the central business district, which principally features large high-style estates of the most prominent civic and social leaders of Springville.

#### **SLIDE 3: Historic Map**

Closer to the railroad, the West End was originally considered the less desirable area of the village in its early days. However, this area of the village became a center for residential development in the late nineteenth century due to West Main Street's proximity to the businesses and amenities of the commercial core of Springville and North Central Avenue's connection to the industry along Spring Brook to the south and the Springville-Boston Plank Road to the north.

The West Side's golden age occurred after the 1878 opening of the Springville & Sardinia railroad, which ushered in an era of increasing rail-borne economic prosperity. This development helped spur the growth and settlement of the western areas of the community and made Springville a bustling economic, industrial, and cultural center for southern Erie County. By about 1920, the West End Historic District had reached the final phases of its growth, as much of the land along Main Street and Central Avenue had already been subdivided and developed. The individual ownership of automobiles also indicated a shift in the location and type of residential development in and around the village,

encouraging subsequent growth in new, peripheral neighborhoods that were now accessible to downtown Springville. Accommodations for this new mode of transportation were made in the West End district, as barns and carriage houses were transformed into automobile garages, and new garages were constructed.

#### **SLIDE 4: Views**

Several of the buildings received minor "updates," including new siding or replacement windows, and a few buildings have since found new use as commercial properties. Yet, despite change, the district remained a center for the area, which is reflected in the construction of the most recent and most substantial church building and school in the post-war baby boom in 1950. The district buildings are associated with Springville's successful railroad capitalists as well as its middle-income merchants, farmers, and professionals and also reflect national trends in residential architecture.

#### **SLIDE 5: Views**

The district includes examples of the Italianate and Gothic Revival styles of the mid- to late-1800s, large and grand Queen Anne and Shingle Style buildings in the late nineteenth century, and examples of Colonial Revival styles from the early twentieth century. This small district also includes several churches and a former burial ground reused as a public park. While many properties appear to have been built by local builders

and carpenters, likely using pattern books as inspiration and guide, several of the larger properties may have been designed by architects, given their detail, complexity and the social standing of their owners. However, the names of these architects and/or builders are currently unknown.

The project was funded by a Preserve New York grant, a program by NYSCA and the Preservation League. We do have one letter of objection from a property owner, and one letter of support from two property owners. This is the West End Historic District, are there any questions?

#### Jennifer Betsworth:

John H. and Sarah Trumbull House 80 Marius Street, Kingston, Ulster County

[Facade] The John H. and Sarah Trumbull House, built in 1876, is significant under Criterion C at the local level as a distinctive example of picturesque residential design by architect Arthur Crooks. Trained by Richard Upjohn, Crooks had a successful New York City practice and had recently completed Kingston's Gothic Revival City Hall. John and Sarah Trumbull commissioned Crooks to design an impressive house for them on the edge of town.

[Plans/Historic] His design blends the Gothic Revival and Stick styles, and he carefully situated the house amid rock outcroppings. Crooks was known primarily for his ecclesiastical architecture, and the Trumbull House is one of his few residential designs. In December 1876, Crooks' design for the house was published in American Builder, which described it as "a very pretty frame house."

[Addition elev] The Trumbulls were active in Kingston's social and civic community and had social and familial ties to national political leaders. Sarah continued living at the house after John's death in 1881, and made plans to bequeath it to the Old Ladies Home of Ulster County. However, the house was unsuited to this use and became a boarding house for much of the twentieth century.

[Interiors] While it falls outside of the period of significance, the nomination also notes the house's association with experimental composer and installation artist Maryanne Amacher from 1981-2009. Amacher lived in and, through her site-specific composition style, engaged with the house musically. Future critical study of her later works may contribute greater understanding of her significance.

[View to Porch] After Amacher's death, the house sat vacant and continued to deteriorate. In 2015, Dennis and Valerie Connors, the current owners, purchased the house and have been working to repair and restore it. Dennis assembled much of the information for the nomination, and aims to use the homeowner tax credit to support continued work on the house.

### Letter of support from Kingston Mayor Steven Noble, Assemblymember Kevin Cahill

INTRODUCE: James Connors (son), David Lee (builder)

<u>Kngston City Almshouse</u> 300 Flatbush Avenue, Kingston, Ulster County

[Almshouse] The Kingston City Almshouse, primarily constructed between 1872-74, is significant under Criterion C for its Italianate design and as a representative example of the work of architect John A. Wood. After merging with Rondout to become the City of Kingston, the community had the resources to establish an almshouse to care for its aging and impoverished residents. While planning for the building, Kingston's Almshouse Commission studied other almshouses in the region as well as publications of reformers advocating for better facilities and living conditions.

[Porch] Wood, a prolific mid-Hudson Valley Architect during the late 19<sup>th</sup> century, began his career in Kingston during the early 1860s. Wood became known for his ecclesiastical, hotel, and institutional designs, and had designed Poughkeepsie's almshouse shortly before he was commissioned by Kingston. Wood's design for the Kingston Almshouse offered a tripartite design with simple, but bold, Italianate details including bracketed porches, window hoods, a decorative cornice, and shallow gables emerging from flat roofs.

[Rear] The building's minimal design, which is largely characterized by its fenestration, reflects the architect's interest in maximizing its functionality and

keeping costs down for a municipal client while still creating a building that would be attractive to both its residents and members of the community.

[Interiors] The Almshouse is additionally significant under Criterion A in the area of social history for its association with the City of Kingston's efforts to care for its poor and aging citizens. Once completed, the almshouse offered housing for 150-200 people and was praised for its design, which allowed plentiful light and air, and practices, such as separating the sexes and maintaining clean, pleasant, and sanitary facilities.

[Outbuildings / Landscape] Located on the edge of the City, the Almshouse was surrounded by lawns and agricultural fields which provided both meaningful work and recreation for residents. The Kingston City Almshouse also reflects shifts in health care and social welfare practices from the late-19<sup>th</sup> to mid-20<sup>th</sup> centuries. The facility remained open until 1948, when it was repurposed as a county infirmary.

[Outbuildings] In addition to the main almshouse building, the property is notable for retaining many of its accessory buildings, including the laundry house, a barn, a brick office and garage, and a stone cottage.

Letter of support from Kingston Mayor Steven Noble, Resolution from Ulster Co. Legislature Approved Part 1

INTRODUCE: Lee Riccetti, Heritage Consulting Group

George W. Bellows House

9 Bellows Lane, Woodstock, Ulster County

[Bellows / Stag at Sharkeys] The George W. Bellows House is significant under Criterion B and C in the areas of art and architecture for its association with Bellows, the early twentieth century American realist artist who designed and built it as his Woodstock summer residence in 1922. Bellows studied under Robert Henri at the New York School of Art where he developed his skills as a realist artist and became known as one of the most prominent young members of Henri's Ashcan School.

[Cliff Dwellers] Bellows is best known for this early work, typically of boxing matches and urban life painted in a rough, energetic and bold style. During the 1910s, Bellows gradually became more interested in painting landscapes and portraits and making lithographs.

[Fishermans Family] By this time, Bellows was well recognized for his work. The Metropolitan Museum of Art purchased one of his paintings in 1911 and he worked as one of the organizers of the 1913 Armory Show. After briefly traveling and teaching, Bellows returned to New York and became increasingly involved in Woodstock's artistic community. Inspired by the region's dramatic landscape, Bellows' family began staying in Woodstock for summer and fall in 1920.

[Façade] He purchased land in the section of town known as Rock City, between Woodstock's commercial center and the Byrdcliffe artists' colony and from April to September of 1922 built a summer home and studio with his friend, painter John Carroll. Bellows employed Jay Hambridge's theory of dynamic symmetry in his design for the home, just as he did in planning his artwork; it was the only home he ever designed. \*façade asymmetry

#### [Elevation] point out asymmetries

[Pool] Bellows also built stone walls and a bridge over a small creek that runs just north of the house. When the stream ran sufficiently, he dammed the water to create a pool and waterfall.

[Interior] simple and honest. Large gathering room, plank walls.

[Desk / Picnic] Built in desks for himself and daughter in the great room. The paintings and lithographs Bellows produced during his Woodstock years reflect his growing interest in landscapes, portraits and color systems and demonstrate a softening of his style. Bellows played an active role in Woodstock's artistic and social communities – jurying exhibitions, managing a baseball team, and teaching swimming lessons to local children at his pool.

[My House] Bellows hosted family, New York City visitors, and other artists at his home, which he depicted in this painting. At the height of his career, Bellows died of appendicitis in 1925 at the age of 43. The Metropolitan Museum of Art held a memorial exhibition in his honor later that year.

#### Draft written by Richard Heppner, Town of Woodstock Historian

New Guinea Community Site

59 East Market Street, Hyde Park, Dutchess

[Freedonia / Map] The New Guinea Community Site reflects the history of an early free black community in Hyde Park which was active from ca. 1790 to ca. 1850. The site is significant under Criterion A in the area of ethnic history and Criterion D for

its potential to reveal more information about the lives of free black communities during the period when slavery was gradually being abolished in New York State.

[Historic Map] The period brought considerable social and economic change for African-Americans, but historic records which relate to their experience are meager. The community was established on a piece of marginal land along the Crumb Elbow Creek that was subdivided and sold by the Bard family. \*point out\* Most families rented their land – one only person, Primus Martin, purchased his lot – and most worked for nearby landowners in addition to farming their own land. Many were free blacks and their descendants who had formerly been enslaved by local large landowners. At its height, the community included about 60 families in and around Hyde Park. Freedonia Lane, the community's central road, remains evident.

[Foundation] While recent historical research offers an understanding of how free black communities functioned within the broad social, political, and economic life of the Hudson Valley, archaeological sites can expand our knowledge. Given the prolonged process of emancipation in New York, the New Guinea community has the potential to provide insights critical to understanding the cultural landscape of freedom in the region.

[Excavation / Tim] Archaeological investigations completed between 2001 and 2004 identified three house locations and produced a wealth of domestic artifacts, including pipes, ceramics, glass bottles and drinking vessels, and faunal materials. While some focused studies have been completed, many of these artifacts remain unanalyzed.

[Freedonia] The artifacts uncovered at the New Guinea Community Site have the potential to reveal information about its inhabitants' daily lives, economic base and interaction with the wider Hyde Park Community, as well as the opportunity to contribute to knowledge about free black communities elsewhere in the Hudson Valley.

I worked on this nomination with the assistance of Tim Lloyd, of our office, who is in the audience today, and the bulk of the work was done by INTRODUCE: Ann Wentworth & Melodye Moore, Authors & Representatives of Dutchess County Historical Society

### Old Town of Flushing Burial Ground 46 Avenue between 164th and 165th Street, Queens Co.

[Map] The Old Town of Flushing Burial Ground, also known as Martin's Field, is locally significant under Criterion A in the areas of ethnic heritage and social history for its role as the primary burial ground that served the African American and Native American community in Flushing during the nineteenth century. Used between 1840 and 1898, the burial ground is the final resting place for approximately 1,000 individuals.

[Park] The Village initially established this site as the public burying ground for victims of contagious disease and as a potter's field. Prior to 1881, many of the individuals buried at the site died during smallpox and cholera epidemics. Most of those buried here were Flushing's poorest citizens, with a large percentage of African American and Native American descent.

[1917 map / Wall] By 1898, the cemetery had been filled. Over the next several decades, the site fell into disuse and the growing village struggled what to do with the land. In 1914, after the village's proposal to reopen the cemetery for burials was rejected by local residents, the Village of Flushing sold the land to the New York City Parks Department for use as a public park. At that time, four headstones remained on the land.

[Park] This history appears to have been forgotten by 1936, when the city installed a playground on the southern portion of the land, where the stones had been located, and discovered buried remains in the process.

[Park/moved playground] In recent years, local groups – notably, the Old Town of Flushing Burial Ground Conservancy – have worked in collaboration with New York City Parks and local politicians to reinstall the playground in a more appropriate location and recognize the history of the site as an early and predominantly African and Native American burial ground in Flushing.

[Plaque] Letters of Support from NYC LPC, NYC Parks, Queens Library, and the Old Town of Flushing Burial Ground Conservancy
INTRODUCE: Representatives of the OTFBG Conservancy – Robbie Garrison,
Henry Euler, Aline Euler, Eddie Abrams, Nancy Tognan, Erika Saleh, and
Beverly Riley

Saxe Embroidery Company Building 511-513 East 164<sup>th</sup> Street, Bronx Co.

[Façade] The Saxe Embroidery Company Building is locally significant under Criterion A in the area of Industry as an intact example of a Bronx tenant factory building. Initially constructed by the Saxe Embroidery Company, a family-owned business, the building ultimately housed a range of commercial enterprises that provide insight into small-scale local manufacturing in the Bronx during the early twentieth century.

[1922 Industrial Map of NYC] Although the Bronx was primarily a residential district, concentrations of small industries and manufacturers began locating in the borough by the late 19<sup>th</sup> century. \*yellow is food products and tobacco, red hashing is women's wear, which became the dominant industry in Morrisania\* Locating in the Bronx was cost-effective for employers and workers, and had nearby housing, good transit, and easy access to Manhattan. Between 1912 and 1922, the number of factories in the borough more than tripled from 700 to 2,400.

[Entrance] The Saxe Embroidery Company, which specialized in embroidered medallions and monograms, was incorporated in 1901. They purchased a lot in Morrisania's industrial district the following year, commissioned architects Hamilton and Mersereau to design the building, and constructed it in 1904.

[Upper Floor] Morrisania's industrial district, which developed alongside commercial and passenger rail lines, became known for its large number of small loft-style plants. Textile manufacturing, particularly millinery and lace goods, was most common. Of the more than 80 industrial buildings that occupied the area at its peak, Saxe Embroidery is one of only six that remain.

[Upper Floor] Beginning in 1913, Saxe Embroidery consolidated its operations on the upper floor and leased the rest of the building to a variety of small manufacturers and businesses. This strategy, which was supported by the building's flexible, open spaces, contributed to Saxe's success even as the district around them began to decline during the Great Depression. Since that time, the building has continued to operate as a commercial and manufacturing tenant building.

Approved Part 1, nomination written by Logan Ferguson of Powers and Company

Letter of Support from NYC LPC??

Ridgewood Reservoir Jackie Robinson Parkway, Kings / Queens Co.

[Aerial] The Ridgewood Reservoir is significant under Criterion C in the area of engineering and Criterion A in the area of community planning as the last surviving intact component of the first great infrastructure project undertaken by the City of Brooklyn – the building of a water supply system from the south side of Long Island to the homes and businesses of her citizens.

[Water Map] After the region's water supply was threatened by private ownership and control, the Cities of Brooklyn and Williamsburg and the Town of Bushwick consolidated in 1853 in large part to begin establishing a large, public water system. Long Island presented the best source of reliable water. The Ridgewood water system stretched from ponds and streams in Massapequa to a distributing reservoir overlooking Prospect Park and into the water mains under the streets of Brooklyn.

[Plan] James P. Kirkwood was the chief engineer for the project, and H.S. Welles was the primary contractor. The construction of the entire water system, including the Ridgewood Reservoir, additional storage reservoirs, conduit, pumping station, and distribution system under the streets of Brooklyn was an inspiring feat of engineering and accomplished in only two-and-a-half years.

[Engraving] The Reservoir began filling in November 1858 and residents began enjoying fresh water direct to their homes the following January. In April 1859, the City staged a massive celebration, complete with a five-mile-long parade and the dedication of a new ornamental fountain in front of city hall.

[1947 Aerial] The City's thirst grew rapidly, tripling in size between 1862 and 1871, making it necessary to construct a third, larger basin in 1891. The water provided by the Reservoir allowed the City of Brooklyn to grow from 96,000 in 1850 to 806,000 in 1890 to become the third largest city in the country. The water supplied the steam engines that made Brooklyn an industrial powerhouse and allowed it to become the largest beer producing city in the United States during the late 19<sup>th</sup> century. Although the City's population and industry continued to grow, the water system had reached the limit of its capacity. By merging with New York in 1898, Brooklyn was able was able to resolve its long-term water needs.

[Steps] In 1917, the Ridgewood Reservoir was directly connected to new reservoirs in the Catskills, supplementing its supply from Long Island. After additional sources were added to the system in 1951, the Ridgewood Reservoir's system became

redundan[Structures] The Reservoir's three stone-faced basins collected the water for distribution throughout Brooklyn and water flowed from the Reservoir for a full century, from 1859 to 1959 when it was officially designated a reserve supply. Over the past half century, nature has reclaimed the reservoir, but its significance remains evident.

[Basins] Letters from Congresswomen Nydia Velazquez and Grace Meng State Senator Joseph Addabbo State Assemblymember Catherine Nolan **Brooklyn Borough President Eric Adams Queens Borough President Melinda Katz** 34th District Councilmember Antonio Revnoso 37th District Councilmember Rafael Espinal **NYC LPC NYC Parks** Queens Borough Historian Jack Eichenbaum **Brooklyn Historical Society** Brooklyn Chapter of the AIA **Cypress Hills Local Development Corporation** Ridgewood Property Owners Association **Brooklyn Bird Club Local residents and supporters** 

## INTRODUCE: Sponsor NYCH20, Matt Malina and Steve Fiedler (Parks Committee chair, Community Board 5) in attendance

**Greenacre Park** 

217 East 51st Street, New York Co.

[Overall] Greenacre Park, constructed in 1970-71, is locally significant under Criterion C in the areas of landscape architecture and community development and planning as an early and exceptional example of a mid-20<sup>th</sup> century vest-pocket park. The vest pocket park movement promoted the creation of small urban parks in an effort to celebrate urban life after decades of urban renewal and the destruction of vast swathes of urban fabric.

[Model] After being introduced in Philadelphia during the early 1960s, these ideas were quickly adopted and promoted by the Park Association of New York. After she heard about the plans for Paley Park, New York City's first vest-pocket park, Abby Rockefeller Mauze established the Greenacre Foundation to build and maintain Greenacre Park. The firm of

Sasaki, Dawson, DeMay Associates was hired to design the park. Harmon Goldstone was brought in as associate architect.

[Plans] Hideo Sasaki, a renowned landscape architect, was known for his revolutionary holistic approach to landscape, which encompassed principles of planning and the environment. Greenacre Park is considered one of his finest small landscapes.

[Fountain] It embodies the characteristics of this park type, with its multi-level design, water features, multiple plantings, rich textures, concession stand, and flexible seating and takes these features to high levels of design and workmanship.

#### [Runnel / Seating]

[Waterfall] The park was recognized at the time as a significant work and received awards from the New York Society of Architects, New York State Association of Architects and the Parks Council of NYS, among others. The park's significant design, continued successful operation, influence on later New York City zoning regulation on parks and plazas, high degree of integrity and important place in the history of pocket parks makes this an exceptional resource.

#### Draft by Missy Dierickx Letters of Support from NYC LPC, State Senator Liz Krueger

#### LANAI

79th Street Boat Basin, New York Co.

[LANAI / Ad] LANAI is significant under Criterion C in the area of Architecture and design as an early yacht built and designed by John Trumpy and produced by the Mathis Yacht Building Company. Renowned boat builder John Trumpy immigrated from Norway and began working in New Jersey's shipyards during the early twentieth century. The John H. Mathis Company created the spinoff corporation Mathis Yacht, in which John Trumpy was a founding partner, in 1910.

[LANAI] The success of the company's first boat, CALIPH, inspired more commissions; as Trumpy continually worked on new design strategies for his new breed of luxury houseboat, each of his early boats had a unique design. Trumpy's Yachts combine compact, shallow-draft structures, which allowed them to easily navigate shallow waterways, with robust engines, attractive designs, and comfortable interiors.

[Historic / Plans] Built in 1911, LANAI was the Mathis Company's sixteenth contract and fifth houseboat to be produced in the Mathis yard. The Company was pleased with the design and featured the LANAI prominently in its advertisements as late as 1922.

[Deck] LANAI is additionally significant under Criterion A in the area of Recreation for its association with the development of luxury yacht recreational culture during the early twentieth century. As the American leisure class developed during the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> century, water recreation became a prominent activity. Wealthy individuals owned and raced yachts and were competitive in their search for more powerful boats and attractive, luxurious designs.

[Interiors] Arthur Curtiss James, the LANAI's first owner, was a lifelong yachtsman and excellent navigator. He and his wife, Harriet, had home ports in Newport and Miami, where they were active in yachting culture. Arthur also worked with the YMCA in the effort to make boating and navigation more widely accessible. Under the ownership of a series of individuals, LANAI (renamed ARGO in 1928) remained a part of this upscale recreational culture well into the mid-twentieth century.

[LANAI / Trumpy & sons] Later renamed John Trumpy and Sons, the company continued to produce boats through 1978. Few of Trumpy's prewar yachts are known to still exist. LANAI is the oldest known surviving example of a Mathis-built, Trumpy-designed luxury houseboat and serves to illustrate the company's early designs and construction techniques.

Letter of Support from the Shelter Island Historical Society, Town of Shelter Island

INTRODUCE: Katy Braiewa, on board of Smith-Ransome Japanese Bridge Conservancy

<u>Smith-Ransome Japanese Bridge</u> Merkel Lane, Shelter Island, Suffolk Co.

[Historic] The Smith-Ransome Japanese Bridge located on Shelter Island was built ca. 1905 as an ornamental landscape feature on the summer estate of Francis Marion Smith, the owner of the Pacific Coast Borax Company. Designed by engineer and inventor Ernest L. Ransome, the bridge is significant under Criterion C for its architectural design and engineering, and reinforced concrete construction. The bridge exemplifies Ransome's innovative methods, but the delicate Japanese-inspired design is unusual among Ransome's commissions which primarily focused on industrial buildings.

[Map / Bridge] The structure and an adjoining concrete sea wall around a designed lagoon are the only surviving trace of Smith's turn of the century estate, whose principal buildings were damaged or destroyed in the Hurricane of 1938, and are therefore a testimony to the strength and durability of this once novel construction technology.

[Beach Reservation] Ransome, an English inventor, engineer and architect whose father had patented a process for producing artificial stone in the 1840s, brought his experience working in the family factory with him when he immigrated to the United States in 1870. Ransome began experimenting with reinforced concrete and secured a patent for his system of construction in 1884. Francis Marion Smith hired Ransome to build his west and east coast borax refineries out of reinforced concrete in 1889 and 1897.

[Deterioration / Bars] The Smith-Ransome Japanese Bridge was designed and built at the height of Ransome's career, incorporating the inventor's signature Ransome bars in its reinforced concrete construction. The twist in the bar across its entire length contributed to the formation of a stronger bond with the surrounding concrete.

[Lagoon] The design of the bridge embodied the taste for Japanese culture during the late 19<sup>th</sup> century. Graceful in its contours and essentially ornamental in purpose, the Smith's bridge and lagoon serve as an analogue to the popular Japanese garden.

[Lagoon/Bridge] Although they have deteriorated over time, the bridge and lagoon remain as a rare, early, and unusual example of Ransome's work.

#### **Draft by Zach Studenroth**

#### Virginia Bartos:

#### Finger Lakes Region NR Nominations State Board for Historic Preservation Meeting 7 December 2017

Once again, we're pressed for time, so I'll just give you the highlights on my two nominations. After all, since you've read them, I don't need to bore you twice.

Slide 1: First up is the Lyons Downtown Historic District in Wayne
County. This nomination is sponsored by the Lyons Main Street
Program and with grant funding from NYSCA & the Preservation
League and with encouragement from the Landmark Society of Wester
New York. Part of the impetus was spurred by the local community
rallying to save the two historic buildings on both sides of the
courthouse. The former village of Lyons is the county seat for Wayne
County and this slide shows the government buildings around the
park—the 1854 court house, 1931 post office and an 1872-redone 1923
county office building (lower left). The US Post office seen in the lower
right is individually listed as part of the USPO MPDF (1989).

Slide 2: The core of the district is Broad Street, part of which is already listed as part of the Broad & Water Streets Historic District (NR listed 1973) roughly outlined in Blue on the map. The red is the nominated

ends at Water Street. The nominated district extends north on Broad beginning with the 1885 Lutheran Church, seen in the upper left.

Slide 3: The nominated district contains over 250 contributing resources representing the period of significance that extends from 1796 when the initial street plan was laid out through 1967 marking the onset of a long period of population decline and decentralization of jobs and services.

These images show several Greek Revival canal era buildings in the north section of Broad Street.

Slide 4: William Street is the other major north-south artery with roughly half commercial and half residential buildings. The original intent of the nominated district was to promote the commercial tax credit, at least when we started the project last year. The majority of the contributing buildings in the nominated district are residential and will be able to take advantage of the state homeowner's tax credit.

Slide 5: This images shows part of the residential section of William Street, looking north.

Slide 6: Canal Street is another major commercial section extending east from William Street, some buildings retaining the original cast iron store fronts. The Herman Brothers complex is near the eastern most end of the nominated district.

Slide 7: Other key streets are Butternut, seen in the upper images, and High Street in the lower images, both on the west side of the nominated district.

Slide 8: We'll end with Phelps Street, on the west end of the district, seen in the upper image. The church is the individually listed Grace Episcopal Church complex (1974). The lower left shows the trolley depot on Montezuma Street, and the lower right is the elementary school on Lawrence Street. I trust these images give you an idea of the variety of styles and types of resources contributing to the Lyons Downtown Historic District.

**Questions? Comments?** 

Slide 1: My other nomination is the Lipe-Rollway Company in Syracuse, Onondaga County. This is a commercial tax credit project that received its part 1 approval in early October (10/4/17). The 1921

building is being listed under Criterion C as an excellent study of the industrial work of Syracuse architectural firm Gaggin & Gaggin using the Kahn concrete construction method (that would be Julius Kahn, not Albert), a portion being visible on the current building with the exposed extender corbels intended for an expansion that never took place. The lower left shows the building under construction, looking at the north and west elevations (essentially the rear of the building). The main factory building has three attached ca. 1940s portions to the south and a freestanding surviving silo. The juxtaposition of Building J and former boiler shop offers a comparison of two types of common factory construction.

Slide 2: The company is also falls under Criterion A in the area of industry for it being one of the major industries in Syracuse that developed form the Charles Lipe industrial incubator, well outlined in the nomination text and MPDF text. It seems like most of the industries bearing the Lipe name manufactured parts for railway cars and automobiles.

For Lipe-Rollway, a fair amount of the historic fabric is extant, even with the first three floors of building J previously renovated for office

and retail space. Plans for building J are to keep retail and offices in the first three floors and add approximately 25 residential units (1 & 2 bedroom apartments) in the upper floors.

**Questions? Comments?** 

# [Following Virginia Bartos - Lip-Rollway Building, Syracuse, Onondaga County]

## **Upper Genesee Street Historic District (Utica, Oneida County)**[10]

- Walter (Wally) Wheeler of Hartgen Archeological Associates = consultant
- Based on survey funded by **CLG Grant** to the City of Utica
- Adding almost 100 properties to the National Register from Utica
  - One Part 1 already received; at least two more in progress; possibly one from a small building being rehabilitated by its owner
  - o 1 Letter of Objection
- Complements the neighboring districts of Lower Genesee Street HD (hotel and warehouse district, 1830-1929), Bagg's Square East HD (commercial and industrial buildings associated with rail transport, 1875-1955), and Rutger-Steuben Park HD (high-quality residences, 1825-1880)
- Four listed sites: Grace Episcopal Church, Fort Steuben Club, New Century Club, Stanley Theatre
- Themes of Commerce, Community Development, and Architecture for the period ca. 1825-1972
  - Tackles the issue of the impact mid-twentieth century Urban Renewal on a 19<sup>th</sup> century commercial street

**Two maps** – <u>Start with development of commercial corridor; later crossed by "Civic Center" dev by Urban Renewal</u>

 Genesee Street runs at an angle across the street grid – original path of a Native American trail

**Commerce and Architecture:** Height of Utica's prosperity ran from 1875-1830 → date of most of the buildings in the district

- Utica grew due to its location in the center of the state access to national markets through the Erie Canal and railroad
- **Mix of industries**, especially cotton and wool, after steam power (from coal from the Chenango Canal) substituted for water power
- **Strong growth** in late 19<sup>th</sup> century (28,000 in 1870) to 1930 topped 101,000; now population = 60,000
  - City jumped the Erie Canal and grew south, incorporating old residential areas
  - Some buildings at the south end of the district remain converted (or encapsulated) houses
- Strong mix of department stores, banks, specialty stores, churches, and social clubs, many by notable architects;
  - [IMAGE] "Busy Corner" Genesee Street at Bleecker (east) and Lafayette (west) Sts = core of the city
    - Site of James Schoolcraft Sherman's nomination parade and funeral; many other civic events
    - Second building from left = Munson Building (Frederick H. Grant (1886); Bagg and Newkirk (1948)
    - View south from the corner showing old Woolworth's Five and Dime Store
  - [IMAGE] First National Bank of Utica (now, Adirondack Bank; York & Sawyer, New York, 1922-26)
    - Small Building and Westminister Moriah Olivet Presbyterian Church (William Ellis, 1854) – great collection of stained glass windows from Tiffany and Lamb Studios
    - Grace Church (Richard Upjohn, 1958, w chancel by Richard M Upjohn, 1890, and spire by Hobart B Upjohn, 1933)
    - Carlile Building by Frederick Hamilton Gouge (1884)
  - o [IMAGE] Savings Bank of Utica (Robert William Gibson, 1898-1900)
    - Genesee Street looking south w Kempf Building (Walter G. Frank, 1914-1915) at right and Utica Gas and Electric Company Building (Bagg and Newkirk, 1927) at left
    - Stanley Theatre (Thomas W. Lamb, 1928) in the background
  - o [IMAGE] Mitchell Building (Bagg and Newkirk, 1921-22)

- New Century Club (LISTED) (Frederick Hamilton Gouge for 1897 auditorium addition only) – early social club for women, est. 1893
- Oneida National Bank and Trust Company (Alfred Easton Poor (NYC); Edmund J. Booth (Utica), associate architect, 1957-1959)
- New York Telephone Building (Verizon) (Voorhees, Gmelin and Walker, New York, 1926-28) OVER
- [IMAGE] SIDE STREETS
  - Elizabeth Street with Oneida County Courthouse (Olin Wesley Cutter, in association with Ward & Turner Architects (S. S. Ward and Alfred C. Turner) of Boston, 1903-08, remodeled by Edmund J. Booth, 1957-59)
  - OPPOSITE Central Fire Department (on left, John A. Hobbes, 1911), now law library
  - Hotel Utica (Esenwein & Johnson, 1910-1912; extra stories in 1926)
- Architects active in Utica included William Ellis (1816-1866); Richard Upjohn (1802-1878); Richard W. Gibson; Ulrich Franzen & Associates; George Edward Cooper AND local architects Linn Kinne; Bagg & Newkirk; Egbert Bagg, Jr.; Egbert Bagg IV; Edmund J. Booth; Frank C. Delle Cese who updated commercial buildings in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century and became involved in the Urban Renewal projects of the 1960s

#### **Urban Renewal - 1957-1972**

- Utica selected as a demonstration city for Urban Renewal plan to bisect commercial Genesee Street with a corridor of state, county, and local government buildings
- Applying ideas of Le Corbusier and the Chicago School
  - o Differentiation of buildings by use (no more mixed use)
  - o Tall buildings in parkland or on podiums
  - o "Concentric Zone Theory" focus on city cores for rehab
- First project focused on "slum clearance" → required demolition of Utica City Hall (Richard Upjohn, 1860; also architect of Grace Church, extant) and the removal +100 homes in the Af-American part of the city
  - Demolition expected to stimulate reconstruction
- Meanwhile, of course, the city was reshaping itself as surburbanization drew people out of the center and into the margins
  - Various elements of "car culture" privileged parking lots and parking garages and spread-out one-story suburban elements in design of storefronts and replacement buildings

- Troubled story of developers and consultants proposing commercial projects, only to drop them because Utica was "too small" → led to new program to bring together all government buildings in a Civic Center Plan which would cross Genesee Street
  - At the same time, other projects going on east of Genesee Street to segregate industrial functions along the railroad (Bagg's Square East) and build large housing projects south of Oriskany Ave
- After many stalled efforts, six projects were completed
  - o (no number) Utica Memorial Auditorium (1959)
  - 1 New City Hall (1961-1967, Frank C. Della Cese) and Tower of Hope
  - o 2 Oriskany Plaza (1964-1868)
  - o 3 Oneida County Office Building (Edmund Booth, Sr., 1964-1969)
  - 4 New York State Office Building (Pederson, Hueber, Hares & Glavin of Syracuse, designed 1966-67; construction completed 1972)
  - 5 Kennedy Plaza Parking Garage (Lathrop, Douglass, Mahle, 1964-1970)
  - 6 Kennedy Plaza Apartments (Ulrich Franzen & Associates, New York, 1969-1972)

FINAL IMAGE – SYNTHESIS of Old and New on Devereaux Street [END]

# Oneida Downtown Commercial Historic District (Oneida, Madison County) [10]

- City Sponsored project Cassie Rose, planner
- Consultant = Nicole Martin of In-Site
- 69 Historic Resources added to the National Register 1 Listed Site; 1 Letter of
   Objection
- Significant in the areas of Transportation and Community Planning [IMAGE] for the influence of the Oneida Feeder Canal (part of the Erie System) and Utica-Syracuse Railroad on the layout of the community
  - Also significant for Architecture for the range of buildings built in the core that reflect the city's development through the period of significance 1850-1968

- [IMAGE] Oneida, surprisingly, is known for **cigar manufacture** 
  - "Madison Square" is Oneida's "busy corner" but also housed Powell & Goldstein's cigar factory
  - Characteristic building style three to four story buildings, shops below,
     cigar manufacturing above, housing (in a few cases) above that
  - Producing over 1 M cigars in 1884/employing 50 people; Goldstein elected first mayor in 1901
- Traveling down w side of Main St → [IMAGE] Looking south (postcard) → and looking back north
  - o C. T. Walrath Block (architect unknown, 1876)
- [IMAGE] End of commercial district west side of Main St at Washington –
   Crandell-Cree Building (1889)

[IMAGE] East side of Main (postcard) signif different → due to the existence of the Oneida Feeder Canal

- Taken out beginning in 1925; around the same time that Lenox Avenue was extended
- o Much newer buildings **Hotel Oneida** constructed 1926
- Elks Club family home (Mott family) until 1914 → Elks Lodge 767 → addition built c 1920
- [IMAGE] Other architecturally significant buildings → Kallet Theatre (Myron Kallet, 1937); Commercial building fronting Vanderbilt and Oriskany Avenues;
   Reynolds Block (1889), designed to hold public hall on 4<sup>th</sup> floor and stores on the ground floor; Oneida City Municipal Building (John Rose and Ted Kirmmse, Syracuse, 1968) intended to bring together city hall, fire department, and police department in one place
- [IMAGE] Farrier Avenue looking west (opposite side of street from Higinbotham Park)
  - o Salvation Army Citadel (1905) at left
  - o **Post Office** (1931-1932) LISTED at right
- [IMAGE] Other types of buildings around the periphery of the district
  - North Main/James Street Railroad housing and saloons

- Intersection of Phelps and Cedar Streets three carriage factories (no longer extant) and carriage-related buildings (c 1880s); early garage (1910)
- o Also a "Ward & Dickinson" diner from the 1920s on Phelps Street
- [IMAGE] City efforts beginning to pay off **Oneida City Center Committee** pulling together to make some progress
  - Hotel Oneida has been looked at as a possible tax credit; local developer actively working on plan to rehabilitate Lehrman Building [END]

## Wampsville Presbyterian Church (Wampsville, Madison County) [4]

- Tax Act project bought by neighbor after building was condemned; Part 1 approved by NPS in Nov
- Modified Classical Revival meeting house, constructed 1830-1832
  - Modified as patterns of worship changed, achieving its current form by 1912 or 1915
  - Three parts: Sanctuary (1830-1832), session room (1891), kitchen (1912 and/or 1915)
- Nominated for significance in **Religion** as the first religious organization in Wampsville and **Architecture**
  - o Lacks its original columns but otherwise intact inside and out
- Period of significance (1830-1832) through 1967 (fifty years from present);
   open as a church until 1994

**Religion:** First church built in Wampsville – now the county seat of Madison County (organized in 1806)

- History of community closely tied to development of transportation through this area
  - First, Seneca Turnpike (now State Route 5) after 1802
    - Brought people to the crossroads with the road to the Lenox
       Furnace one mile south
    - Tavern stop → Mydert Wemple ("Old Wemp") and postal village (1825)
  - Second, Erie Canal (1825) made land more valuable because products could be more easily moved
  - Third, railroad (1839) Utica and Schenectady RR moved focus to Wampsville Depot (one mile north) and Oneida
- Congregation incorporated in 1828, but had been worshipping in a nearby school for almost ten years
- Church construction started around 1830 maybe a bit earlier with the cutting of timbers in 1839
  - Nice set of "recollections" from 1891 of people who had participated in building the church
  - Sources known for frame, stone foundation, and finished seasoned wood
- Lots of different ministers over a long period
  - Low point = Congregation split in 1844 when two-thirds the original

- members went to Oneida
- High points = Renovation of the church in 1878 and subsequent revivals by a strong minister → 1891 session room; growth after county seat moved to Wampsville from Morrisville in 1907 → 1912 and 1915 kitchen additions
- Church closed in 1994

**Architecture:** Relatively little change from 1832; most of the changes due to **changes in liturgical practice** or **denominational attempts to increase congregational involvement** 

- Original church ~ meetinghouse style box pews, pulpit behind tower, plain glass
- Remodeled in 1878 box pews removed → auditorium style, pulpit moved to back; more congregational involvement in the service with choral singing and praise
  - Probably when apse and choir loft were added; windows given their Gothic arches; and Meneely Bell added to the tower
- **Session room** added in 1891 space for socialization and Sunday schools; period beadboard wall and ceiling trim and simple stained glass NOTE: only stained glass in the building!
- Kitchen added in 1912 and or 1915 1912 rededication speech notes that the building committee "found it quite necessary to consult the ladies" perhaps a function of both the increasing roles for women in church activities and the influence of suffrage <u>AND ON THAT NOTE, time for the MUSEUM tour of "Votes for WOMEN"!</u> [END]